Reflections of the Woman Image on Painting and Literature in the Ottoman Society (1839-1922)

By İnci Aydın Çolak
Mimar Sinan Fine Arts University

Abstract- This article aims to evaluate the policies shaped over the female body and its reflection on art together. This period, which started with the Tanzimat years, when the empire turned to the West, would undergo a radical transformation with the proclamation of the Republic.

Odalisque and concubine are among the main themes of the Tanzimat novel and story, and it is discussed from a critical point of view. In this context, female portraits of Osman Hamdi Bey, the only Orientalist artist from the East, show a similar quality to Tanzimat novels. The glorification of the spiritual values of Islam is the common feature of art in those years.

Art is the occupation of the wealthy class. The megrims of the individual stuck between the East and the West are mostly experienced by women. In the Constitutional Monarchy period, there is no social structure in which well-educated women can exist. Therefore, the crisis, in which a knowledgeable and productive woman, who cannot show herself, will fall, appears in both literary works and painting.

Keywords: woman, painting, literature, ottoman, interdisciplinary.

GJHSS-A Classification: FOR Code: 199999

Strictly as per the compliance and regulations of:

© 2021. İnci Aydın Çolak. This is a research/review paper, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 3.0 Unported License http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/), permitting all non-commercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.
Reflections of the Woman Image on Painting and Literature in the Ottoman Society (1839-1922)

İnci Aydın Çolak

Abstract This article aims to evaluate the policies shaped over the female body and its reflection on art together. This period, which started with the Tanzimat years, when the empire turned to the West, would undergo a radical transformation with the proclamation of the Republic.

Odalisque and concubine are among the main themes of the Tanzimat novel and story, and it is discussed from a critical point of view. In this context, female portraits of Osman Hamdi Bey, the only Orientalist artist from the East, show a similar quality to Tanzimat novels. The glorification of the spiritual values of Islam is the common feature of art in those years.

Art is the occupation of the wealthy class. The megrims of the individual stuck between the East and the West are mostly experienced by women. In the Constitutional Monarchy period, there is no social structure in which well-educated women can exist. Therefore, the crisis, in which a knowledgeable and productive woman, who cannot show herself, will fall, appears in both literary works and painting.

The women who were behind the front lines during the war years, if they were among the profiteering war-rich, continued to lead the life of the existing flamboyant high society. On the other hand, it is a fact that women of the middle class fall to the streets and try to earn a living by prostitution. However, this negative environment was not reflected in the paintings on the grounds that it would demoralize the soldiers and the public, or remained only as symbolic signs, and was discussed in the context of war criticism in the novels and stories of realistic writers.

Keywords: woman, painting, literature, ottoman, interdisciplinary.

I. Introduction

All works associated with femininity, such as marriage, motherhood, and other household chores, have been considered out of history. The problem here is that women, too, consider themselves out of history. The women's movement in general is a movement for freedom and equality. It was with the French Revolution that women first appeared on the stage of history. "Women are either victims of abduction, slavery, rape, or ambitious beings thirsting for power." (Çakır, 2011: 35)

At this point, Namik Kemal's Intibah, Samipaşazade's Sergüzeşt, Şemsettin Sami's Taasüş-ü Talat and Fitnat Nabizade Nazım's Zehra are important examples of these types of women. Fatma Alıye Hanım had to use the signature "Bir Hanım (A Lady)" in her first translated work (1889). Women have written in magazines and newspapers to make demands in order to gain a different status in social life.

The position of women in the Ottoman Empire would begin to change in the Second Constitutional Period parallel to modernization. Women have written in magazines and newspapers to make demands in order to gain a different status in social life.

The first women's newspaper was Terakki-i Muhadderat with weekly forty-eight issues published (1869). (Newspaper for Muslim Women) Untitled articles criticizing the position of women are published in the newspaper, whose publisher is Ali Raşit. The following is written in the reader's letter with the pen name Rabia: "It is necessary to know well that neither men were created to serve women, nor women to be concubines to men."

In 1886, the aim of Süklezär, the owner and writer staff of which were only women, was to announce the existence of women to the public. Articles separated into subject headings started to be published in the magazine Murüvet released in 1887. Nigar Binti Osman published her first poem in the newspaper published with the support and encouragement of Abdulhamit II. Poet Nigar Hanım is an important figure who has realized the first of the hall meetings in the Ottoman Empire and she holds these non-public meetings on Tuesday at her home in Şişli.

Entered into publication in 1895, Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete (Newspaper for Ladies) was the longest-running women's magazine with a thirteen-year-old period until 1908. Poet Nigar Hanım and Fatma Alıye Hanım are among the writers of this magazine. For Fatma Alıye Hanım, the most important factor that impedes the development of women are men. Men try to close the doors of especially science and art to women. By establishing the Newspaper Library for Ladies, the books of Fatma Alıye Hanım and Nigar Hanım were published. The number of magazines took off in 1908. Also, women write articles demanding their rights in the newspapers Tanin, Servet-i Fünun, Sabah.

Mehasin magazine (1908-1909) is the first colored and illustrated women's magazine. The 12 issue magazine features competitions and promotions. Issued between 1913-1921, the journal Kadınlar Dünyası...
(Women's World) is a publication of the Ottoman Müdafaâ-i Hukuk-i Nisvan Cemiyeti.

In 1919, the magazine İnci (Pearl) was published by Sedat Simavi. Twenty-one out of one hundred and sixty signatures are women and the lead author is Emine Semye. Generally, the thoughts of men about women are expressed.

Magazines both the owners and authors of which are women are: Şükürzez, Seyyale, Kadınlar Dünyası (Women's World), Siyanet, Diyane. Magazines, which are owned by men, open questionnaires by including articles describing how women should be in the eyes of men, and these survey questions are directly directed to men.¹

The staff of the magazine Kadınlar Dünyası (Women's World) (1913-1921) struggled against the traditions surrounding women, restrictions, inequality of men and women, and women's lack of education, and the magazine continued its publishing life with some interruptions between 1913-1921. The magazine, owned by Nuride Ulvuye, published a photograph of the Turkish woman for the first time. Not only the editorial staff, but even the typesetters of the magazine are women. They take the discourse "We will not open the pages of Kadınlar Dünyası to men unless our law is recognized by the common law and participation in all kinds of work between men and women is accepted." as their base. A woman who cannot provide her own livelihood is dependent on men, so a women's revolution should be done. The name of the journal was chosen deliberately. It was aimed to show that women have a world and what kind of world they want. "Because women have been living in hell for so many years, not in the world." (Nedime İhsan, Women's World, 15 April 1329, No: 12, p.3-4).

While there was no sound in Bab-i Âli, the foreign press was interested in the magazine. After the 100th issue, discussions in favor and against were included. In the Great Women section, names such as George Sand and Madam Curie were introduced. Writing as "We do not have as many positions in the world as animals", Muhlis Hanım (Muhlis Fuad, Women's World, 1329, no: 117), is supported by Nilüfer Mazlum in her letter: "For men, the position of a woman is no more than that of the yellow ox." (Nilüfer Mazlum, Women's World, 1329, no: 110) Fatma Zerrin expressed the point of view of men with the following words: "Men divide women into three as the women-about-town, the middle class, and the poor. A woman-about-town is a sweet fruit, middle-class women are servants, and those who are not well off are captives." (Fatma Zerrin, Women's World, 1329, no: 48, p.2-3).

In this world shaped by the male gaze, women have no place. While women express their rebellion through magazines, the Tanzimat period male writers cover the subject of women in almost every novel. This style of expression has been shaped by a patriarchal perspective, and although it deals with the problems of the period, the woman always remained being defined between the poles of "emotional, passive, passive" or "seditious, liar, deceitful". This situation which is similar to the description of the devoted concubine Dilâşûb and the villainess Mahpeyker in the novel Intibah (1876), is a typical aspect of the Tanzimat period.

II. The Image of Woman Reflected in Painting and Literature in Ottoman Society

From the Tanzimat novels, Taâşûk-û Talat and Fitnat (1872-73) is especially important as it is a book that created controversy on the institution of marriage and the position of women. For example, Talat dresses as a woman and befriends Fitnat at home to get to know her better. This situation, which is painful for both men and women, highlights that the chador can be a front for undercover works. Also, in the play Şair Evinmesesi (Poet's Marriage), written by Şinasi, it is, again, the chador that played the main role in Müştaḳ being married off to the sister instead of the woman he loved. A woman cannot escape from a masculine point of view while evaluating herself and her environment. The rights granted to men are against women.

"Oh how cruel you men are! If a girl has a little squint in one eye, she would wretchedly grow old without marrying. Nobody would bother to wire her! But who knows, the worst, the most sinister, the most cripple one of you would wire the most beautiful, most well-behaved one of the girls and enslave the poor girl!.." (Sami, 2003: 40-41).

The use of the definition while Fitnat Hanım's beauty and merits were praised, "Reticent and not laughing out loud", and the qualities sought in women indicate that the desired existence is not herself but her shadow. A woman divorced by her husband questions her position with the following words:

"When they (men) get married, the importance they give to their wives is less than the importance they give to a horse or a car they buy! Yes... They have the right... Because they will buy a horse, and if it does not turn out to be good, they will have to sell it again, but maybe they cannot sell it at the price they bought. There is a fear of loss in this. " (Sami, 2003: 128).

While Talat goes about dressed as a woman, his friend, whom he works with at the same secretary, molests him by not knowing him, and the insults he suffered make him understand how difficult it is for women to live in this society.

---

¹ For detailed information, see: Serpil Çakır, Osmanlı Kadın Hareketi, Metis Publications, Istanbul, 2011.
In Ahmet Midhat Efendi's novel named Felatun Bey and Rakim Efendi (1875), Rakim takes a Circassian concubine, whom they call Canan. The girl is only just fourteen years old. Rakim teaches her how to read and write. But when Canan attends the lesson at his neighbor's house to learn piano, Rakim gets irritated. Every step taken by Canan beyond his own sovereignty, knowledge, and control makes him nervous. A piano was bought for the house so that she would not leave the house, and a teacher was hired for Canan to learn piano. Canan lives in the most comfortable state of slavery/concubinage institution. She also started learning French with her piano teacher.

“Rakim- (...) They give me five hundred gold for you. Canan- (...) 
Rakim- Apparently a lot of money. 
Canan- (with great despair) Are you going to sell, sir? 
Rakim- What do you think? 
Canan- (turning red in the face) I am your property, sir. It is up to you.” (Ahmet Midhat Efendi, 2002: 134)

The love that started between Rakim and Canan continued until Canan became the lady of the house after being an odalisque. Samiçaşazade Sezai's novel Sergûzest (1888) scrutinizes the concepts of slave trading, concubine, and odalisque around the character "Dilber". Dilber is a nine-year-old captive girl kidnapped from Batumi and sold in Istanbul. We do not know her real name. This is the name the slave dealers give her. She is employed in the heaviest jobs and beaten. Her most comfortable days coincide with the years when she worked in a mansion in Istanbul. The son of the house, Celal Bey, is an Ottoman intellectual who studied painting in Paris, took lessons from Gèrome and was able to exhibit his painting at Salon.2 The Western education he received causes him and his family to think differently on some issues, especially in love affairs. Celal Bey, who puts Dilber in various disguises as a model while painting, feels affection towards her. Dilber is in love with Celal Bey too. This "inappropriate" situation, noticed by the mother, ended with the sale of Dilber one day when Celal Bey was not home. A person who does not have own her liberty falling in love has created a tragedy. Celal Bey, who is in love with her, goes crazy in Dilber's absence; Dilber commits suicide by escaping from the Egyptian merchant she was sold to. Suicide is actually her reaching the state of being a free human. Only in this way was she able to end her captivity. Even though a person is a slave, he/she can make some decisions and implement them. Rather than returning to the life of a slave with the man she loved, Dilber went forward to freedom alone.

Sırrıcemal in Nabızade Nazım's novel Zehra (1894) is also a vivid tragedy created by the institution of slavery. This concubine, who has no capital other than her beauty, has intercourse with Suphi, the master of the house, and becomes pregnant by him. After she gets Suphi divorce from his wife, Suphi cheats her too. The young woman whose life becomes meaningless after losing her baby in her womb ends her life by committing suicide. In the novel, Sırrıcemal is described with the following words:

“Sırrıcemal was a symbol of beauty. At first glance, it was affirmed by even the most captious of hearts that she was from the most famous branch of the Caucasian race with her beauty. She was very flamboyant in her figure and she was the full embodiment of whatever comes to mind when the word woman is mentioned. This tall and strongly built body must not be thought of as something coarse. With this heftiness, her qualities were very thin and delicate. Her waist was thin, her chest and shoulders were wide, her neck was long, her face was oval; eyebrows, eyelashes, hair thick and black, pinkish white in color; her hands, feet, mouth were small; her walk was heart-stealing; her gaze was deceiving; in short, she was a beauty who hunted the hearts.”

The neglect by the man she loved and her deep conflict lead her to suicide. The author reflected this crisis with the metaphor of intertwined mirrors.

“She went in front of the mirror. Hundreds of her images appearing by each other's shoulders also enraged her. These images imitated all the movements of her head and hands on a series. She considered these things as if they were making fun of her. She would almost break the mirror.” (Nazım, 2003: 97)

---

2 The fact that Şeker Ahmet Pasha, Süleyman Seyyid, and Osman Hamdi Bey were in Paris for painting education and took lessons from academic masters during these years was reflected in the novel with the character of Celal Bey.
Osman Hamdi Bey's painting "Lady Having Her Hair Combed by a Servant" can also be evaluated in the context of women's identity. In addition, the mirror is the place of fascination or destruction of the individual who encounters it, it is an anti-world. Although he depicted the subjects of the harem, concubine, and chambering in his paintings, Osman Hamdi Bey, in his letter from Baghdad, wrote to his father on April 27, 1870, that this institution unsettled the family order. Osman Hamdi Bey's writings almost serve as a summary of the novel Zehra.

"Except for my dear family and a few other families, dear Father, take a look around! What do you see in families? Rottenness, immorality, quarrel, divorce. Slavery spoils them, odalisques spoil their spirituality. The woman does not obey her husband, the husband does not regard his wife. While the husband is in his own world, his wife is in her own path. They never joined hands. They never formed a family. " (Eldem, 2010: 267).

Having the most attractive opportunities for a slave, Canan is different from Dilber, who threw herself into the waters of the Nile, and Sırıcemal, who ended her life. Class-wise, all three characters are slaves. However, the experiences and owners of these slaves are different. Rakım has almost created Canan over again. With his own hands, he created a well-behaved wife who knows the languages French and Ottoman Turkish and plays the piano well. Moreover, she is loyal to him like a slave.

It is beneficial to underline an important point here. Ahmet Midhat, unlike his friend Osman Hamdi Bey, does not criticize the institution of slavery/odalisque/concubine. He blames the men like Felatun Bey who are educated wrong and inadequately. While presenting Rakım as the ideal Ottoman intellectual, he states that this problem can be solved within the sharia rules. Dilaşüb in the novel Intibah is a way the mother found to attach her son Ali Bey to the house. The emotional intimacy that occurred between her and Ali Bey was disrupted as a result of Mahpeyker's plans. Dilaşüb was sold to a slave trader, slandered, and beaten by Ali Bey. Despite this, she is still the one who risks her life for Ali Bey at the end of the novel. Dilber and Sırıcemal committed suicide and moved away from the facts they could not bear. Dilaşüb also showed a suicide-like performance, sacrificing her life for the man she loved. Slavery is giving allegiance to the master no matter what he does.

The novel Pakize by Behice Ziya Kollar is important in terms of evaluating the position of women. Pakize is a well-educated young woman. She reads and writes in French. She follows the Ottoman newspapers. One day, an article in a newspaper about women's education caught her attention. The fact that the author of this was a man named Rifat also surprised her. The
fact that thoughts similar to hers were expressed by a man affected her very much. During a conversation, she learned that Rifat was the elder brother of one of her friends. A book exchange begins between Rifat and Pakize. Rifat even wanted to read the writings written by Pakize, and Pakize hesitantly gave Rifat Bey her novel "Betrayal", which she hid even from her father, and gained his appreciation. It is extremely realistic for Pakize to keep her novel in her drawer. Because the social environment in which an educated woman can show herself is not possible. The woman has to hide the work she has written.

"Definitely his father will give her to a man. What if that man is an old-fashioned person who does not consider women as human beings, or otherwise, a totally fake European style one? Or what if she coincides with a man with elegant outfits and vile ideas who finds it inappropriate for women to be dealing with reading and writing, who will be enemies of her books the next day of their marriage" (Kollar, 2019: 34).

While Dilâşub, in Namık Kemal's work İntibah, was writing down her thoughts, her husband Ali Bey entered the room. Dilâşub does not want to show her husband what she wrote, and when he tries to get it jokingly, she tears up the paper. Thereupon, Namık Kemal intervened and wrote the following:

"How beautifully can a woman write with this education here, even if she has the talent of Şinasi? Poor Dilâşub was naturally embarrassed and did not show the things she had put on paper because even she could not like them. Thereupon, the gentleman tried to take it jokingly, and she tore the paper. " (Kemal, 2003: 190).

This situation explains why Fatma Aliye Hanım used the pseudonym "Bir Hanım (A Lady)" while appearing in the literature community and wrote her first novel with Ahmet Midhat's patronage.

The fact that women are a sexual commodity, that they are bought and sold like a slave was a topic on the agenda of the Tanzimat artists, and it also pushed Fatma Áliye Hanım (1862-1936), one of the women writers of this period, to write on this subject. In her novel Üdî, the difficulties of a woman working as a musician with her honor and sustaining her livelihood in this way are reflected in a realistic style.

The novel Üdî starts with a garden depiction of a mansion in Damascus. Bedia is a woman who makes a living by playing the oud. After this point, the author turns to the past and speaks of her father Nazmi Bey, who is the source of the musical curiosity in Bedia. Besides being a music enthusiast, Nazmi Bey is a poet and composer. Violin is the instrument that he plays best. Bedia, who listened to the violin like a lullaby since her infancy, started to play the qanun at the age of eight and by mastering this instrument at the age of thirteen, became interested in violin. But what really impressed her was the sound of the oud she heard at a wedding. Bedia decides on the oud and gives up the other instruments. She starts to play his father's compositions with her oud. The oud, which her sibling gave her as a gift, turns into an icon object and guiding motif in the work. Bedia, who has come to Istanbul upon the death of her husband, is surprised to see how progressed music is here.

It has been two years since Bedia came to Istanbul. Bedia, who received the news of her sibling's death, takes care of her nephew. From this point on, the novel follows a different course. For a woman who is left alone, the issue of making money has come to the fore. The woman who, after her father's home, went to her husband and from there to under her brother's protection is now alone with her nephew who is in need of her help. She started to earn money by teaching others the oud, which she used to play until now only for her own pleasure.

Bedia is beautiful, moral, and elegant. She is in love with music. She grew up in a house with nine servants. The spoiled character of being a member of the upper class has not left a mark in her character. She was able to turn her 'oud', which is her 'love', into a livelihood when she needed it, and was able to survive without the need for a man's guardianship. In this respect, she is both idealized and realistic. During the Tanzimat period, high-level bureaucrats turned to the West, educating girls in French and music, formed the basis of the virtues that they will exhibit in their future marriages. As time went on, the piano, a Western instrument, was going to replace the 'oud'.

Although the musical instruments played are traditional, the reflection of women working with a musical instrument on painting and novel is new. In Osman Hamdi Bey's painting "İki Müzisyen Kız (Two Musician Girls)", one of the two traditionally dressed young women is holding a tambourine and the other holding a tambour. The standing woman playing the tambour is focused on her work. In this respect, she resembles the character Bedia. She is aware of her predispositions and strives to improve them. It is understood from the clothing of the young women that they belong to the upper class and that they treat the musical instruments they play just to engage in the art, without the purpose of earning money. The prayer rugs on the floor and the mother-of-pearl inlaid handles of the cabinet in the background show the reflection of art on architecture. The place beyond the tile border on the left and the marble grid in the middle is Bursa Yeşil Mosque. Women who are engaged in music are wearing three skirts and kerchief wrapped around their heads.

The Ottoman woman without ornamentation or make-up, but refining with her simplicity and with her work and action, is an ideal type for Fatma Aliye Hanım as well as Osman Hamdi Bey. In the novel named Hayal ve Hakikat (Dream and Truth) that Fatma Aliye Hanım wrote with Ahmet Midhat Efendi, the stance of the character Vedat is similar to this idea:
“Vedat never liked the glamour that the womankind was passionate about since he was young. For him, women whose virtues consist only of piecing together the pieces of cloth were no different from mannequins in front of fancy big stores. With this idea and view, he devoted all his time to reading and being occupied with manual skills. For that, he actually became a man of letters and, as required, a brilliant artist.” (Aliye, 2015: 40)

Another striking point like that in the Tanzimat period women were interested in music to deal with pure art, is that when women were with musical instruments, they did not have a man next to them or in front of them. Women play the musical instruments for themselves. In this respect, it can be said that the traditional mental structure continues. For Bedia, the character of the novel Udi, the oud is no different from a friend or comrade. Sometimes she put her oud in her lover’s place: "My faithful beloved who never leaves me, who never runs away from my arms! My dear friend! My confidant who listens to my troubles, who understands my heart! My comrade who is always accompanying me! Only you did not leave me, only you did not give up on me, you did not betray me! You were once my source of pleasure and enjoyment. And now my livelihood! You are my breadwinner! You are my love, my man!.." (Fatma Aliye, 1315: 116)

Levayh-i Hayat serialized in Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete, also written by Fatma Aliye Hanım between the years 1899-1900, consists of sixteen parts. Written using the letter technique, this novel reveals how women

**Painting 2:** Osman Hamdi Bey, “İki Müzisyen Kız ”, 1880, oil on canvas, 58x39 cm, Suna and İnan Kıraç Foundation Collection.
approach the institution of marriage. A woman who lacks economic freedom has no chance to be happy in this environment even if she is educated. In the novel, Fehame and Sabahat are women who are cheated by their husbands. They both have children and their marital trouble is common. While Fehame endures this marriage for the future of her children, Sabahat thinks of leaving her husband and living her life. Because Sabahat has a financial income besides her husband's and she will be able to guarantee the future of her children with this property. On the other hand, Fehame is an orphan. Her disreputable husband is the patron of her and her children.

Fehame and Mehabe are women who read, think, and discuss a lot. Hence, having to live with a man she doesn't love just for his money is a great tragedy for Fehame. "Aren't brides sought to bind sons to home in our marriage?" (Fatma Aliye, 2020: 7).

"Yes, Mehabe, because for a living, I am obliged to obey their orders and submit to their judgments whether rightful or unjust! Oh, what a dishonor! But my children! ... Your Sister Fehame!" (Fatma Aliye, 2020: 9).

The novel focuses on what the differences between humans and animals are in the correspondence between two siblings. By emphasizing that God is the appearance and reflection of nature, the traditional Ottoman understanding of Sufism is reflected.

"It is their virtues and praiseworthy good manners that distinguish human beings from animals and make them superior. Some have got a lot of share from that honor, some less! Those who have got a lot of shares have entered into humanity more, and others approached it according to their degrees. Fatma Aliye, 2020: 13"

Especially when talking about "getting a share", she is not Fatma Aliye but like Plato. Plato also writes that people get a share of the idea of "goodness" and that they are classified according to their share. In the following lines, Fatma Aliye states that the perfection of any plant or fruit in nature leads the human to their creator. This perfection in the creation is the reflection of the creator. This view, which can be named as a reflection of the understanding of Sufism, defines the human as the most honorable of animals.

Fatma Aliye mentions a spiritual illness that will happen to people in the future:

"Today they work this hard for tuberculosis. Who knows, maybe they will later work for this spiritual illness that will plague youth. It is possible that experts special to this will be born" (Fatma Aliye, 2020: 21)

Her experiences changed Fehame's perception of life. After her marriage, she fell in the middle of a life that was not her own. This is such a pit that she must have certain financial means to get out of it. The words that Fehame chose while describing the pit she fell into emphasize her loneliness while revealing her cultural situation. As a woman learns and educates herself, she becomes alienated from and disgusted with the man who maintains the existing patriarchal structure. With her education, her loneliness and depression increase.

"Even the nightingale can not resist the beauty of spring and sings with its sweet tunes. And while I was fascinated by them, I was surprised that Schopenhauer crowed like a wrecked owl. It was not only difficult but impossible to tell me about my pessimism." (Fatma Aliye, 2020: 38)

The novel Refet published by Fatma Aliye in 1897, includes the first female teacher main character in Turkish literature. Also in Fatma Aliye's novels Udi and Refet, the main characters are the first female characters to work and stand on their own feet.

Refet is a girl who lost her father at an early age, and her mother, Binnaz, gets her an education with difficulties. When she lost her father, her relatives turned their backs on them and the mother and daughter struggled to survive. Mürüvet Hanım, who came to visit the relatives' house, took pity on the mother and daughter and took them into her house. Refet got skinny and unhealthy due to not eating well. However, she always came first in her class with her perseverance, diligence, and intelligence, so she got into Darülmuallimat (Girls' Teacher School).

His mother, Binnaz, objected to Refet's entrance to a girls' teacher school by saying, “They don't make poor people like us teachers”. Refet strongly opposed this idea and said that poor and intelligent girls could teach and rich girls came to this school only to increase their general knowledge. The idea of equality in Fatma Aliye's mind was reflected in this school.

"Oh!... How many feet without socks were taken out of buskins by force! And how fancy shoes were lined up aside. In these school desks where the rich and the poor were equally involved, how many poor people without stockings and cardigans were above the fancy ladies with fur coats. Yes! Often those poor were among the outstanding students of their class. Because they work with determination and effort to be teachers and earn their bread. The others, on the other hand, were sent to the school to learn knowledge and be decorated also with this ornament. Most of them are trying to receive praise from their parents." (Fatma Aliye Hanım, 2019: 60).

The intelligence, diligence, and wisdom that belong to the individual give the person the opportunity to show herself by pushing back the social classes. And this is the path Refet chose. Students of Darülmuallimat wear a wool uniform dress in dark tahini color. Darülmuallimat is written on the sides of the velvet collars. On the sleeves of the chadors, bands are sewn according to the class they are in. While Refet is studying in her senior year, she has four bands on her arm. (Fatma Aliye, 2019: 116)
Rich schoolgirls sometimes help the poor. Some rich students, on the other hand, try to oppress the poor. Refet is extremely distant and careful towards both two types of girls. In this difficult struggle she fights on her own (how many nights she sleeps hungry, risks freezing on a snowy winter night when they cannot buy coal), another orphan girlfriend, Şule, is with her.

Among rich girls, Şahap is a positive character. She helped Refet get the required materials for her lessons without hurting her pride. Şahap, who already took private lessons at home, was sent to Darülmuallimat by her elder sister to get to know the world and life. Because nobody knows who will be poor or get sick in the future.

Among rich girls, Hürmüz, Faize, Sakibe are characters depicted negatively. One day, Refet cannot find the money to buy fabric for the lesson. Hürmüz gave her the remaining fabric of hers. Refet will do the needlework and after the dress is finished and Refet has received her grade, she will give her production to Hürmüz. One day before the day of the grading, she broke the agreement and said: "The goods are mine, I will get them whenever I want", and acted with the pampering and arrogance brought by the money. Sakibe used the title "servant-like" for Refet's mother, and Faize wrote a sarcastic poem for her. Her pride hurt, Refet lays these two rich spoiled girls low with the essay she wrote for the exam so that when the girls feel embarrassed to the core by this keen intelligence, they were taken by surprise in the exam and could not give the answers they had to give.

School, which is a war of wealth and poverty for the poor, is just a place of socialization and sometimes fun for rich girls.

It is known that painting lessons were given in Darülmuallimat and Müfide Kadri, one of the first female painters, taught there. Müfide Kadri even created still lifes for her students in which she gathered flowers she collected from nature and her violin, and her students studied etudes of those. Müfide Kadri encouraged her students to work in the face of nature. When she passed away at a young age, first Madame Rafael and then Mihrı Hanım gave painting lessons, and with the application of students of Darülmuallimat and the efforts of Mihrı Hanım, the School of İnas Sanayı-i Nefise was opened.

"Neither Refet nor Şule were all idle in the matter of painting. Because they were taught charcoal drawing and watercolor painting at school." (Fatma Aliye, 2019: 93)

They talked about the paintings of famous painters during their visit to Şahap's house. Refet, who learned for how many thousand francs these were sold, was very surprised and could not understand this price difference between painting and embroidery. She questioned why painting is an art and why embroidery is a craft.

"An embroidered quilt and a bundle pillow, which is the product of a woman's diligent hand, can only earn a few cents even though it is made with so much effort, and a picture depicted brings such thousands of francs." (Fatma Aliye, 2019: 94)

A similar one to this exact thought takes place in Ahmet Midhat Efendi's novel Pariste Bir Türk (A Turk in Paris). He was angry that while the flowers that the florist sells were a few francs, the flower painting was several thousand francs; moreover, he was furious at the painter's dare to imitate the creator by copying this created thing.

Refet finds peace in nature and illustrates nature scenes.

"The painting made at the school was pencil and watercolor drawing. Refet portrayed the setting sun and its reflection on the sea and the rising of the moon so beautifully, made the colors go together so nicely, and gave the shadows so perfectly that she liked it too. She was in the desire to paint the fourteenth night in Fener which was settled in her mind." (Fatma Aliye, 2019: 107)

After Refet graduated, her rich cousin wanted to marry her, and Refet refused this interest-based marriage proposal. The cousin is looking for a volunteer maid who will do accounting for free and cook food.

In the novel Hayal ve Hakikat (Dream and Truth) which is written by Fatma Aliye Hanım with Ahmet Midhat Efendi, Fatma Aliye used the pseudonym "Bir Hanım (A Lady)” instead of using her own name. Ahmet Midhat considered himself the stand-in father of Fatma Aliye Hanım. It is he who introduced her to the literary community. Her husband tore the novels she wrote and even banned her from reading for a period. The appointment of her husband and the support that she received from her stand-in father set the things of Fatma Aliye on track, albeit a little.

The novel is the depiction of the relationship between Vedat and Vefa with letters. Vedat is a typical Ottoman girl who likes to read. She does not know the outside world. Therefore, she was impressed by the first peer man who came home, and with the support of her environment, engaged with him. However, Vefa wants to study medicine and is not in the mood for marriage. However, the miscommunication reaches such a point that Vedat gets sick in bed and dies. Vefa, on the other hand, underlines that he should not be held responsible by staying out of this whole process.

The male character in the novel Hayal ve Hakikat (Dream and Truth) is symbolized by reason, rationality, mind; the woman is symbolized by nature, emotion. This form of symbolization/representation is political. It bears the traces of a patriarchal structure. Although this novel was written jointly by Fatma Aliye and Ahmet Midhat, the representation of the female character with hysteria and the diagnosis of this situation by the male named Vefa expresses the encompassing by the man. The power
holders of society are men. Therefore, the decisions also reflect their interests. While the woman continues the lineage by giving birth to mortal bodies, she becomes the other of the man and the independence of the woman is denied. (Berktay, 2012: 26) Female is symbolized by nature and sensuality in patriarchal ideology; the man is symbolized by the mind and reason.

Whether she is a concubine or not, in the Ottoman social structure, women are positioned by the patriarchal ideology. A woman who is incapable of making her own decisions and making a living with the money she earns cannot avoid being a man's toy. She is always in need of a guardian.

The liberation movement, which had been continuing moderately since the 19th century, accelerated with the declaration of the Second Constitutional Monarchy in 1908. In the Second Constitutional Monarchy, new and advanced steps were taken in human rights in general, and in women's rights especially, in the context of principles of equality, justice, and fellowship. Related to this, in this period, the woman opens up to world, reads, and engage in music effectively in paintings and novels. In particular, the type of woman who reads became an emphasized theme in this period. In Prince Abdülmecit Efendi’s painting “Darüşşehvar Sultan”, the illustration of her daughter with the books and modern clothes is the reflection of the modernizing woman image on the painting.

Knowledgeable, educated women outside the traditional patterns of society are approached in Namık Ismail’s painting “Sedirde Uzanan Kadın (Woman Reclining on the Cedar)”. While the library in the background and the woman's clothing point to the relationship established with modernity, the tray on the floor, the calligraphy on the wall refer to oriental identity.

Painters and writers acted in unity and brought the issue of women's freedom and education to the agenda. Fatma Aliye Hanım, Mihrı (Müşfık) Hanım, and Nigar Hanım were pioneers in this regard both with their personalities and their productions. *Violet* in Mehmet Rauf’s novel *Menekşe (Violet)* and the characters Nevhiz, Yezdan and Pervin in the novel *Karanfil ve Yasemin (Clove and Jasmine)* are intellectuals who enjoy reading the works of Western authors.

This image, which is reflected in the painting, has also appeared in the novels of the Constitutional Period. While the character of Yezdan in Mehmet Rauf's novel *Karanfil ve Yasemin (Clove and Jasmine)* is known as a foreign literature enthusiast as much as a writer³ Nevhiz has a reading corner and a library consisting of foreign books in his mansion in Çengelköy. The reading corner is described in detail in the novel.* The other corner was devoted to study (reading). Here, a small mahogany women’s office occupied the corner;*  

\[ ^3 \text{Mehmet Rauf, Karanfil ve Yasemin, p. 37.} \]

\[ ^4 \text{Mehmet Rauf, a.g.e, p. 195.} \]
Women reading books and playing musical instruments in paintings and literature are the reflection of the important steps for women to become individuals in art. In this painting of Namık İsmail, the woman is dressed in upper-class clothes. The library full of books in the right part symbolizes the cultural level of the woman, and the calligraphy plate with kufi writing in the upper left part of the picture symbolizes traditional motifs. The dress and posture of the woman signify sadness in the room decorated with Eastern and Western motifs. Black dress and white collar accentuate the expression of the woman.

In Mehmed Murad’s *Turfanda mı Yoksa Turfa mı?*, one of the transitional novels of the Constitutional Period, Fatma and Zehra are two strong female characters. Their strength comes from the passion they have for reading and their desire to shape their lives as individuals. Fatma is depicted in the novel as follows:

Fatma was a Çankırı girl who had unique solid ideas on women who have read and understood what they had read, and especially their education and upbringings. (Murad, 1980: 98) Fatma also applied to the Ministry of Education, wanting to open a girls' school for women's education, but her application was inconclusive. The moments that Fatma and Zehra enjoy the most are when they read books to each other. However, Zehra is aware that reading and education cannot get a reward in this society.

"Is the woman one of the things that are the furnishings and ornaments of the house? Or is she a necessary part of the family and society? If there is no place to use the gained information, what is the need and use of acquiring them? If a woman's skills will only increase the pleasure and satisfaction of her husband, is not a woman, again, a 'household item' that fulfills the needs and services of men?" (Murad, 1980: 155-156)

Zehra's questioning is similar to the female figure in Namık İsmail's painting. The awake and reading Ottoman woman lacks the social structure that will create her. Therefore, this woman will have to lead an introverted, depressive life.

In the novel named *Dilharap*, serialized in *Hanımılara Mahsus Gazete (Newspaper for Ladies)* by Fatma Fahrünnis between November 26, 1896 - June 3, 1897, internal monologue and the stream of consciousness were used for the first time. The name symbolization made by the name of the main character of the novel, Mazlume (oppressed), refers to the torments experienced by all women in the example of Mazlume. For Mazlume's father, the upbringings of a daughter comes before her education. Although the father did not school his daughter, Mazlume was able to learn to read by herself and started reading books. After the death of her father, Mazlume honed books as the only shelter and found a place for herself in the metaphor-filled world of books:
"When she is in dire need of consolation, she says, "Come, my loyal lover, my comforting friend," and locks herself in her room and sits with her true and old friend Fuzuli's Divan." (Fahrunnisa, 2017: 76)

Mazlume, who especially likes the Fuzuli's Divan, attributes these couplets to herself with a lyrical sensitivity:

"Now the greatest source of consolation were books, she was never seen without a book. She read and read incessantly as the terrifying storms and gusts wreaked havoc, while heavy downpours beat the windows with prolonged blows; as a result of the season, when the universe was dressed in white, in contrast to the dark colors that tended to black, she read in secluded rooms and corners sharpening the minds; she read constantly; in the heat of the summer season, in the sad nights and days of the autumn, in the festive morning and evening of the spring, she always read; from time to time she would close her book and read the pages from the book of nature that appeared before her." (Fahrunnisa, 2017: 37)

In stories named Makes-i Hayal, written by Makhbule Leman in 1897, the criticism of the ignorant husband and the tragedy of the educated woman are treated as a typical subject of the period. However, the marriage of a man who strongly opposed the women's reading and writing with an illiterate woman and the ensuing harm had transformed the man and forced him to decide to have his daughter educated. His initial thoughts, on the other hand, are as follows:

"I do not want to, sir. I do not. I cannot endure a woman who will participate in my life to participate in my profession; I mean the woman who uses my writing set, my pens, and my papers... She must don me my coat and fez, and get me undressed and be a wife. (...) I do not like a woman who is like men." (Leman, 1897: 52)

The man's strong opposition to the educated woman is a rooted reflection of the patriarchal role distribution. While the woman is busy with housework, the man can produce and write thoughts. This is a natural distinction, not a cultural one. Any activity that takes place outside of the natural division of labor makes men nervous.

The steps taken for modernization in the last periods of the Ottoman Empire brought with it increasing interest in fine arts. In the 19th century, upper-class families who wanted their daughters to be brought up with Western culture hired private teachers for their children. The American College and French Girls Schools played a major role in the development of the idea that female students should receive painting education. In this period, the number of young girls who wanted to prove themselves in fields such as music and painting and who received support from their families increased day by day.

Before the İnas Sanayi-i Nefise, different institutions were opened for the education of women. The first girls' art school was opened in 1864, and the first Darülmuallimat (Girls Teachers' School) was opened in 1870. During the Second Constitutional Period, many women's magazines were opened and women's associations were established. In 1914, for the first time, the doors of higher education were opened to women. Free conferences for women began on February 7, 1914 in Darülfünun. In addition, the paintings of Levantine, minority, and foreign female painters at the Istanbul Salon Exhibitions were praised. Before the İnas Sanayi-i Nefise School was opened, Darülmuallimat was the only institution where women received painting education, and the painting teachers of this institution were Mihr Hanım and Müfide Kadri. Although their attitudes differ from each other, these two female artists are united on the same ground in terms of being innovative and pioneering. (Pelvanoğlu, 2018)

Mihr Hanım, who was appointed as the director of this new institution, prepared by Darülmuallimat of Istanbul, is an important name that stands out with her will and intelligence, whose Western and Eastern identities live together. In this period, when the girls were not admitted to Sanayi-i Nefise School, Mihr Hanım (1886-1954) ensured that İnas Sanayi-i Nefise School was opened in Zeynep Hanım Mansion on November 1, 1914. During the establishment of the İnas Sanayi-i Nefise School, there was a location problem due to the fact that it was during the war years, and the school had to move many times. It first settled in the Bezmialem Valide Sultan School (Istanbul Girls High School), and from there in the building built as a primary school in Gedikpaşa. Mihr Hanım, who is known to have a solid knowledge of drawing beside her mastery of portraits, brought ancient sculptures, old women she collected from the baths, White Russians who came to Istanbul after 1917, the school janitor Ali Efendi, and Zaro Ağâ who lived for 150 years as models. She tried to solve the naked male model problem with torso sculptures she brought from the Archeology Museum. She silenced the criticisms by saying that she tied loincloths around the torso's waist. (Pelvanoğlu, 2011: 49)

In İnan Sanayi-i School Âli, which provides free education, education lasts for three years and it is compulsory to attend classes. Education is carried out full time. Mornings are devoted to workshops and the afternoons to auxiliary lessons. Among the lessons are pencil drawing, oil, and watercolor painting lessons; they also take perspective, anatomy, and art history. It is known that Omer Adil and Feyhanman Duran also gave lectures in the school where there were only painting and sculpture departments. Ahmet Haşim also taught art history and aesthetics at the institution. Students
receiving education all day attend workshop classes in the morning and auxiliary classes in the afternoon.

The boys and girls departments of this school, which had thirty-five students when it was first opened, were unified in 1923. In 1926, during the directorate of Namık İsmail, the students moved to the old Meclis-i Mebusan building in Fındıklı. (Pelvanoğlu, 2011: 50) Many of these students quit painting in the following years, those who were interested in painting and wanted to build their career in this way, like Mihrı Hanım and Hale Asaf, continued their lives abroad.

Although important steps were taken regarding the education of women, the war caused the middle class to become poor and the poor to fall into the streets. Emine Semiye, who told the disasters of the war years from the point of women, was active in politics and she focused on women and education in her novels.

"O the women of Islam... O my honorable sisters! Because women will learn a lot if they read well, thanks to their keener intelligence than men. They will earn their livelihood by sucking business and art. Then they will no longer succumb to the material and moral blows that men want to inflict on their heads (Emine Semiye, 1909- Islam and Feminism).

Emine Semiye is the sister of Fatma Aliye Hanım. While Fatma Aliye Hanım also puts forth the woman problem, she thinks that with good education, men can improve. Emine Semiye, on the other hand, states that this problem is primarily due to economic dependence, and if the woman is economically independent of the man, men will not be able to treat women as they wish. Gayya Kuyusu written by Emine Semiye is a novel in which a scene from the Holy Scripture becomes a metaphor and tells about the Istanbul of the war years. In the novel, Safai Bey feels sexual desire against Yekta, a twelve-year-old orphan who took shelter in his house. When he failed to deceive Yekta with gifts and promises, he started to make plans. Safai, who broke Yekta's room lock and hid her key, one night when his wife and daughter were not home, raped her, and when Yekta was about to commit suicide by throwing herself into the well, the kitchen boy rescued her. However, Yekta could not prove her righteousness to anyone. Especially the attitude of Safai's wife started the process that would lead Yekta to destruction.

"By charging this oppressed girl with all the blame, with the scolding 'If you had not wanted, if you had not demanded for yourself, a sane man with a gentle soul would not have done this vile thing.; she did not approach to forgive her. " (Semiye, 2020: 77)

Thus, while Yekta could not overcome the trauma of the rape, she was thrown into the streets and started wandering without knowing what to do. Yekta, who came across an old friend, was marketed and sold to ten people for a medjidie and came to the point of losing her mind after the successive rapes she suffered in the cemetery. Now she is a prostitute without a ration card.

In 1332, depressing period of the hunger days, when even the strongest stomachs could not digest ratio bread kneaded with the broom corn or even its straw, street prostitutes who were excluded from the right to live were not given ration cards and each one was considered responsible for the innkeeper they are appurtenant to. These miserable people could not bring money in the evenings when they could not sell their disgusting bodies and instead of getting bread, they were getting beaten by the innkeeper and they would curl up in the courtyards of the mosques, on the walls of the desolate streets and in front of the fountain. (Semiye, 2020: 97).

Painting 4: Avni Lifij, Çaresiz İnsanlar, charcoal and watercolor on paper, 28x38 cm, MSFAU Istanbul Museum of Painting and Sculpture.
In this painting by Avni Lifij, the corrosive effects of the war on the civilian population were referred to. The dry tree and the cluster of people around it are looking towards the girl with pity, who is sitting in front of them and crouching, hiding her face, possibly crying. Everywhere was burned down. Death and despair concentrate on the figure left alone. Avni Lifij, who prefers indirect expression, expresses how much destruction the war brought.

At the end of the novel Gayya Kuyusu Seeing the state of Yekta, the wife of the house felt sorry for her and wanted to have Yekta treated to clear her conscience, but advanced tuberculosis accelerated her death.

In 1921, 50,000 Muslims, 40,000 Russians, and 4,000 minorities and refugees lived in Istanbul. In 1917, with the White Russian influx, fur fashion began among the women of the new-rich class. In this fashion, which became widespread through the Greek tailors named Modistra, the use of fur without season has become widespread. While abaya was compulsory during the Tanzimat years, this requirement was abrogated in 1892 and the chador fashion started. During the Second Constitutional Monarchy, the veil was abrogated and the chador turned into an overcoat. In 1914, the chador got smaller and turned into a cape over trousers. The head was covered with a small accessory and the nape was left uncovered. A newly derived wealthy class emerged, living off the backs of the impoverished people behind the front. For women belonging to this class, the definition of flapper woman is used. They have short hair, wear short dresses, smoke with long cigarette holders, and exhibit masculine attitudes. Leyla in Yakup Kadri Karaosmanoğlu’s novel Sodom and Gomorrah and Nevin in Peyami Safa’s novel Sözde Kızlar (So-called Girls) can be counted among flapper women characters, a female type reflected in the magazines of the period.

*Painting 5: Resimli Ay cover picture, Number: 2, March 1340 (1922)*
"Leyla wore a small squirrel fur that gave her the look of a tabby cat. Her face was a little dull. The shadow around her eyes seemed a little darker." (Yakup Kadri, 2020: 67)

Hüseyin Rahmi Gürpinar's story titled "A Memory from the Days of the Captivity of Istanbul" ironically tells the Russian invasion in Istanbul and the attitude of the occupying power in the streets:

"British law enforcement officers with cold, treacherous eyes, and unsmiling faces who suppose a sullen face is dignity, Italian policemen with buffoon hats in the streets... (...) The ferries dump the White Russians, which they carried to Istanbul in the crowd like livestock ships, onto the sidewalks, and return full again (...) Imam Mukhtar on the front, police and officers of the allies behind are knocking on your door. They huddle five or six dirty male and female white Russians inside and go" (Gürpinar, 2002: 287-288).

In the story titled "The Issue of Honor and Hunger", which gives the book its title, it is explained that women who walk on the brink of death with hunger survive by selling their bodies, which are the only things that make money, and the environment in which this situation is inured by society.

"Ayşe Sümbüle's mother, daughter-in-law of the house, Dürüye Hanım disappeared one day. A few months later they saw her in cars, in silk sables. She was said to be the mistress of a bulghur-seller." (Gürpinar, 2002: 296-297)

The great master of the house had a stroke. But his wife almost boasts that his daughter and daughter-in-law are mistresses to a wealthy man. Time is now the time to adapt, otherwise starving to death is inevitable:

"Everyone sells whatever makes money. We have no son or son-in-law left. You cannot earn, I cannot work. If our daughters do not bring money either, we will starve. Drink your milk, and now I will get you finely chopped meatballs from curly meat. A plate of desert afterwards. This is a matter of hunger and honor... Many of them have become like us, enjoy yourself." (Gürpinar, 2002: 301)

The war, which brought devastation for the whole society, legitimized prostitution for women, but this situation has not been included in paintings as much as it is reflected in the literature. One of the most important reasons for this is that the state cooperated with painters and ensured that paintings were made to give moral support to the public.

III. Conclusion

Although the Westernization movements started with the Tanzimat in Ottoman society, it would not be possible for women to acquire legal and social rights until the proclamation of the republic. Whether the woman was an odalisque or the wife of the house, she needed the patronage of a man because she did not have economic freedom. A woman who is under the protection of her father when she is young and her husband, when she gets married, cannot liberize. The environment of freedom that started with the Second Constitutional Monarchy increased the number of magazines where women would defend their rights, and although the problem of women's rights being a human right was underlined, the Ottoman code of civil law remained existing in legal terms. The social destruction experienced with the First World War, the male population not being able to return from the front, caused prostitution to become widespread and legitimate, and sexually transmitted diseases could not be prevented. The crooks who earned money from the impoverished people formed a class with the name "new rich". They came to light with all kinds of states of uncouthness. Regardless of whether a woman is an odalisque or not, in a class society dominated by patriarchal ideology, she is not considered equal to men. All these issues were reflected in painting and literature together until the war years. While the reflection of prostitution becoming widespread during the war years was seen in literature, it did not go beyond a few symbolic signs in the painting. The most important reason for this is that the General Staff Intelligence Department allocated a budget for the painters to establish a workshop in Şişli and to have the painters make heroic pictures in order to keep the morale of the people high.

References


19. Özen, Cavidan Göksoy; *İnas Sanayi-i Nefise Mektebinde Yetişen Kadın Ressamlarımız* (Female painters of ours who were brought up in İnas Sanayi-i Nefise School), MSFAU Institute of Social Sciences, Department of Archeology and Art History, Master Thesis (Published), Istanbul, 1985, p.6.


24. (Nedime İhsan, Kadınlar Dünyası, 15 April 1329, No: 12, p.3-4) (As cited in: Serpil Çakır; *Osmanlı Kadın Hareketi*, Metis Publications, Istanbul, 2011.)


Painting References

*Painting 1:* Osman Hamdi Bey, “Saçlarını Taratan Kız”, oil on canvas, 58x39 cm, Dolmabahçe Palace Collection

*Painting 2:* Osman Hamdi Bey, “İki Müzisyen Kız”, 1880, oil on canvas, 58x39 cm, Suna and İnan Kıraç Foundation Collection.

*Painting 3:* Namık İsmail, “Sedirde Uzanan Kadın”, 1917, oil on canvas, 131x185 cm, MSFAU Istanbul Museum of Painting and Sculpture.

*Painting 4:* Avni Lifij, Çaresiz İnsanlar, charcoal and watercolor on paper, 28x38 cm, MSFAU Istanbul Museum of Painting and Sculpture.

*Painting 5:* Resimli Ay cover picture, Number: 2, March 1340 (1922)