<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Role/Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dr. John D. Theodore</td>
<td>American Military University, JDT Management Consultants, President.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ph.D., Aristotelian University, Business Administration, University of Kansas, USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Moji Moatamedi</td>
<td>Honorary Vice Chair.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ph.D., at The University of Sheffield, MBA, Manchester Business School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>University of Manchester, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. R. Allen Shoaf</td>
<td>B.A., M.A., Ph.D. Cornell University, Teaching Assistant in the English Department, University of Florida, US</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor Maura Sheehan</td>
<td>Professor, International Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Director, International Centre for Management &amp; Governance Research (ICMGR)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ph.D. in Economics, UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Mehdi Taghian</td>
<td>Senior Lecturer, Faculty of Business and Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BL Deakin Business School, Melbourne Burwood Campus, Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Carl Freedman</td>
<td>B.A., M.A., Ph.D. in English, Yale University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Professor of English, Louisiana State University, US</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Agni Aliu</td>
<td>Ph.D. in Public Administration, South East European University, Tetovo, RM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Associate professor South East European University, Tetovo, Macedonia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Tsutomu Harada</td>
<td>Professor of Industrial Economics, Stanford University, Doctor of Business Administration, Kobe University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Wing-Keung Won</td>
<td>Ph.D., University of Wisconsin-Madison, Department of Finance and Big Data Research Center, Asia University, Taiwan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Xiaohong He</td>
<td>Professor of International Business, University of Quinnipiac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BS, Jilin Institute of Technology; MA, MS, Ph.D., (University of Texas-Dallas)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Carlos García Pont</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate Professor of Marketing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IIESE Business School, University of Navarra</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doctor of Philosophy (Management), Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master in Business Administration, IIESE, University of Navarra</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree in Industrial Engineering, Universitat Politècnica de Catalunya</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Web: iese.edu/aplicaciones/faculty/facultyDetail.asp</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dr. Söhnke M. Bartram</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Department of Accounting and Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lancaster University Management School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ph.D. (WHU Koblenz)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MBA/BBA (University of Saarbrücken)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Web: lans.ac.uk/staff/bartras1/</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dr. Bassey Benjamin Esu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B.Sc. Marketing; MBA Marketing; Ph.D Marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lecturer, Department of Marketing, University of Calabar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Consultant, Cross River State Tourism Development Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-ordinator, Sustainable Tourism Initiative, Calabar, Nigeria</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dr. Dodi Irawanto</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ph.D., M.Com, B.Econ Hons.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty of Economics and Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brawijaya University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malang, Indonesia</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dr. Ivona Vrdoljak Raguz</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University of Dubrovnik, Head, Department of Economics and Business Economics, Croatia</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dr. Charles A. Rarick</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ph.D.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor of International Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College of Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purdue University Northwest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hammond, Indiana US</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yue-Jun Zhang</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Business School, Center for Resource and Environmental Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hunan University, China</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dr. Albrecht Classen</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>M.A. (Staatsexamen), Ph.D. University of Virginia, German</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Director, Summer Abroad Program, Medieval Europe Travel Course</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dr. Brandon S. Shaw</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B.A., M.S., Ph.D., Biokinetics, University of Johannesburg, South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor Department of Sport and Movement Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Johannesburg, South Africa</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONTENTS OF THE ISSUE

i. Copyright Notice
ii. Editorial Board Members
iii. Chief Author and Dean
iv. Contents of the Issue

1. Impact of Staff Training and Development on Employee Performance: The Moderating Role of Work Engagement. 1-10
4. The Nexus of Perceived Organizational Support, Job Satisfaction, Job Motivation on Turnover Intentions of Pharmaceutical Sales Executives using Structural Equation Modeling. 45-53

v. Fellows
vi. Auxiliary Memberships
vii. Preferred Author Guidelines
viii. Index
Impact of Staff Training and Development on Employee Performance: The Moderating Role of Work Engagement

By Sylvia Erskine-Sackey
Accra Technical University

Abstract- The Technical University Act, 2016 (Act 922) converted 9 Polytechnics to Technical University status. Yet, the quality of technical and vocation education in Ghana has come under intense scrutiny in recent years. Scholars attribute this to inability of technical universities to identify and to initiate programs to meet the training and development needs of administrators and faculty, to adequately prepare them to deliver quality performance outcomes. This paper therefore sets out to i) determine the impact of staff training and professional development on employee performance and ii) examine the moderating role of work engagement on the impact of staff training and professional development on employee performance with emphasis on technical universities. Quantitative data collected from 245 academic and administrative employees of technical universities in Ghana using cross-sectional survey was analysed in Smart PLS.

Keywords: staff training, professional development, work engagement, employee performance, technical universities, ghana.

GJMBR-A Classification: JEL Code: M53, M51

© 2021. Sylvia Erskine-Sackey. This research/review article is distributed under the terms of the Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0). You must give appropriate credit to authors and reference this article if parts of the article are reproduced in any manner. Applicable licensing terms are at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/.
Impact of Staff Training and Development on Employee Performance: The Moderating Role of Work Engagement

Sylvia Erskine-Sackey

Abstract- The Technical University Act, 2016 (Act 922) converted 9 Polytechnics to Technical University status. Yet, the quality of technical and vocation education in Ghana has come under intense scrutiny in recent years. Scholars attribute this to inability of technical universities to identify and to initiate programs to meet the training and development needs of administrators and faculty, to adequately prepare them to deliver quality performance outcomes. This paper therefore sets out to i) determine the impact of staff training and professional development on employee performance and ii) examine the moderating role of work engagement on the impact of staff training and professional development on employee performance with emphasis on technical universities. Quantitative data collected from 245 academic and administrative employees of technical universities in Ghana using cross-sectional survey was analysed in Smart PLS. The study found that work engagement does not significantly moderate the impact of both staff training and professional development on the performance of academic and administrative employees in the technical universities surveyed. Results also suggest that staff training goals are set for the present work environment, hence, promotes work engagement whereas professional development is directed toward long-term growth for roles and responsibilities in future, thus positively impacts employee performance. The study recommends that technical universities should rather focus on professional development to prepare employees for future roles as that directly and greatly impacts performance than short-terms gains from training which leads to greater work engagement, but not performance.

Keywords: staff training, professional development, work engagement, employee performance, technical universities, ghana.

1. Introduction

Training and development is one of the major issues within any organization today because it has numerous purposes. Whether it is a small company with four to five employees or a large-scale organization with a large number of employees, adequate training and development is extremely necessary for daily business performance and day-to-day maintenance in any form of enterprise. Moreover, every company needs training and development in order to prevent any misleading activity in the future (Anlesinya, Bukari & Eshun, 2014; Ahmad et al., 2014). Training and development for individuals thus, improve work knowledge through a process of ensuring workers learn how to do their job well. At its core is the increased efficiency and productivity of the individuals where the learning achieved ultimately leads to improved competences and expertise for greater performance outcomes throughout the organization (Asante and Alemna, 2015; Tahir et al., 2014). Tahir et al. (2014) assert that it is essential to have productive employees because it improves an organization’s performance, thus companies invest in training because they believe that having a well-trained workforce gives them that competitive advantage (Ahmad et al. (2014). Performance, defined as the achievement or efficiency of work could be realized at the organizational, process and individual level, and the interrelationships among these components them will define the gain points of the organization. Implementing training and development thus, is a good thing because this benefits both the organization and the employees (Owusu-Mensah et al., 2015, Anlesinya et al., 2014).

According to Armstrong (2009), training is systemic development of the knowledge, skills and attitudes required by an individual to perform adequately a given task or job. Here the organization in order to ensure greater levels of dedication from workers, must make sure to integrate training into its policies which will enable the employees to exert themselves on the job. According to Nassazi (2013), the concept of professional development can be seen as the long-term, holistic growth of individuals in the organization where they are prepared for roles and responsibilities in future. From the foregoing, it is clear that employee performance is tied to the skills, abilities, experiences and knowledge acquired through training but this can be influenced by the level of engagement of the employees in their work (Owusu-Mensah et al., 2015; Saks (2006). Robinson & Judge (2017), define work engagement as the degree to which an individual feels engaged, pleased, and enthusiastic about the job he or she is doing. Therefore, increasing workforce engagement is likely to provide positive outcomes in workplace performance. It is evident that training and development positively impacts performance of
employees. However, will this impact be greater among employees with higher work engagement or lower work engagement?

In 2017, Ghana implemented the Technical University Act, 2016 (Act 922) to convert 9 Polytechnics to Technical University status. The purpose was to enhance technical training aimed at producing graduates with requisite combination of theory and practice to meet the technical demands of the middle-level workforce. Yet, the quality of technical and vocation education in Ghana has come under intense scrutiny in recent years. Scholars attribute the poor performance of graduates on the job to the failure of administrators and faculty to perform their duties well. Adomako (2017) for example traces the problem to inability of technical universities to identify the training and development needs of administrators and faculty, and to initiate programs to meet such needs to adequately prepare employees to perform at their optimum best. This paper therefore sets out to i) determine the impact of staff training and professional development on employee performance and ii) examine the moderating role of work engagement on the impact of staff training and professional development on employee performance with emphasis on technical universities. This will provide a lens to re-examine the efficacy of training and development programs and to re-strategize to obtain optimum benefits from these.

The paper adopts the Job-Demand Resources (JD-R) theory (Bakker and Demerouti, 2014, 2017) to explain moderating role of work engagement and propose that job performance is predicted by a combination of job characteristics and personal resources gained from training and development. Job demands include high work load, complex tasks, work conflicts, and work climate etc. One may think of job demands as parts of the work environment that reduces the energy of the employee because when meeting work demands necessitates a great deal of effort and the employee is unable to recover, they quickly become job stressors (Bakker and Demerouti, 2018). Job resources on the other hand are aspects of work that assist employees in achieving their objectives and dealing effectively with job demands (Demerouti and Bakker, 2011). These include learning and development, self-determination, motivation, fostering a conflict-management climate, increasing workplace justice for workers, providing positive performance reviews, and providing social support. The JD-R theory suggests that employees should actively pursue job resources – for example, by soliciting input, assistance, and growth opportunities. The study argues from a JD-R perspective therefore that training and development offers a job resource for employees to acquire and maintain relevant skills and competencies to effectively meet job demands for improved performance.

II. Literature Review

a) Training and Development – Overview

According to Armstrong (2009), training is systemic development of the knowledge, skills and attitudes required by an individual to perform adequately a given task or job. Training is a method that aims to improve the knowledge and skills of workers in order to advance and improve their performance at the workplace. Training offers understanding of the basic information needed to perform a specific task, knowledge to increase job performance and skills of the employee (Sheeba & Christopher, 2020). There are two major types of training organizations may undertake. There are on-the-job and off-the-job kinds of training. On the job kind of training is more of a practical form of training which is provided on the work premises of the employee which the learning is done by performing. On the other hand, off the job training usually adopts a theoretical approach, and the participants learn by acquiring the knowledge (Jehanzeb & Bashir, 2013). The concept of development on the other hand can be seen as training that leads to new skills and abilities, it is perhaps a term that is wider than that (Jehanzeb & Bashir, 2013). Development can also be seen as a long-term process for growing conceptual skills usually reserved for executives with the aim of gaining a general knowledge. Armstrong (2009) asserts that, employee development involves providing resources for education, development and training to enhance individual team success. Employee development is prioritized in order for them to reach their full potential. Training and development are critical to organizational growth and development. It is advantageous to both employers and employees of a company. Employees can become more effective if they are given the necessary training. Companies will be able to improve the performance of the existing workers through rigorous training and growth.

b) Employee Work Engagement

Work engagement is characterized as positive working-related accomplishment, composed of three dimensions: vigor, commitment and absorption (Schaufel, Salanova, Gonzalez-Romá, and Bakker, 2002). The first dimension, vigor, is described as working with high energy levels and determination, as well as mental stamina and a willingness to put in effort to complete work tasks. The second factor, commitment, refers to the state of engagement and motivation with one’s work, together with the significant and challenging experience. Finally, absorption is characterized by becoming thoroughly and happily consumed in work, despite difficulties in disconnecting from work activities (Schaufeli et al., 2002). So when employees have a combination of enthusiasm for their job and emotional involvement with it, they can be said...
to exhibit work engagement. Engaged workers are more likely to be involved, and are engaged in their work with zeal. Employees and organizations both benefit from work engagement because engaged employees are expected to perform better (Demerouti & Cropanzano, 2010). Employees who are engaged are more likely to feel happy. People who are happy at work are more open to new opportunities, more outgoing and supportive to others (Cropanzano & Wright, 2001). Bakker and Bal (2010), found that teachers who were engaged received high ratings from their supervisors indicating that the engaged teachers performed well in their various jobs. Salanova et al. (2005), found that employee engagement was essential for perceived employee efficiency and customer loyalty in the Spanish restaurants and hotels sector. Furthermore, Xanthopoulos et al. (2009) researched Greek fast food employees’ and found that their day-to-day work engagements were predictive of regular monetary returns. Given that engagement is perceived as an active, encouraging construct (Parker & Griffin 2011), it is argued that levels of employee work engagement could improve or decrease the impact of training and development on employee performance. Hence, what is the moderating role of employee work engagement on the relationship between training and development and employee performance in technical universities in Ghana?

III. Theoretical Framework and Hypothesis

a) Job-Demands Resource Theory

The theoretical perspective used in this research is the Job-Demands Resources (JD-R) theory (Bakker and Demerouti, 2014, 2017). This theory is used to explain work engagement and it proposes that job performance is predicted by a combination of job characteristics and personal resources which is dependent on employee work engagement (Bakker & Demerouti, 2014). Accordingly, employees are more likely to be engaged at work when they are faced with significant problems and have ample job and personal resources to cope with them (Bakker and Sanz-Vergel, 2013; Tadic et al., 2015). The JD-R theory consists of two distinct properties and characteristics which are job demands and job resources. The job demand may include a number of things, such as physical, social, or merely keeping up with work demands that is strenuous. There is also the potential for psychological or emotional demand if the employee is required to meet job requirements; which means that all jobs have at least one component that is going to increase the rate of stress (Bakker and Demerouti, 2018). Examples of some of these demands can include work load that is high, tasks that are complex in nature, conflicts, even work environments that are not favorable and working hours that are irregular. When meeting work demands necessitates a great deal of effort and the employee is unable to recover, job demands can quickly become job stressors.

Job resources on the other hand include the physical, psychological and social aspects of the job that aid in the achievement of work objectives, the reduction of job demands and the promotion of personal development (Bakker and Demerouti, 2018). Job resources are aspects of work that assist employees in achieving their objectives and dealing effectively with job demands (Demerouti and Bakker, 2011). These include learning and development, self-determination, motivation, fostering a conflict-management climate, increasing workplace justice for workers, providing positive performance reviews, and providing social support. The JD-R theory suggests that employees should actively pursue job resources and challenges – for example, by soliciting input, assistance, and growth opportunities, as well as initiating new and exciting ventures. There is substantial evidence for the JD-R theory (see Bakker and Demerouti, 2014, 2017; Bakker and Sanz-Vergel, 2013; Tadic et al., 2015).

In summary, the JD-R theory posits that job resources are positively linked to work engagement; job demands on the other hand can reinforce the positive relation between job resources and engagement; and work engagement ultimately has a positive link to performance (see also, Demerouti, 2014). Job resources are becoming more useful in meeting employees’ basic needs and desires, cultivating their growth, learning, and development, and providing more intrinsic motivation in the workplace. Organizations that offer adequate job resource in the form of training and development to workers will improve employee engagement and motivation in the workplace. As a result, job resources are the most important predictor for increasing employee engagement (Bakker & Demerouti, 2007) and ultimately employee performance. See the research model in Figure 1 below for details.
b) Impact of Training and Development on Employee Performance

Most organizations have long recognized the value of training for their advancement. As new technology emerges over time, some occupations and skills become obsolete, a growing focus is being put on the need for a professional and highly qualified workforce for good results. Training needs is any deficit in the output of employees or potential performance that can be remedied by appropriate training. There are many ways to overcome deficits in employee performance, and training is the only one of them (Dabale, Jagero & Nyauchi, 2014). Employee performance is described as an employee’s ability to complete a task according to predetermined accuracy, completeness, cost, and speed standards. Employee performance according to Nassazi (2013) is the individual output with regards to their process, relevance and results. According to Arinanye (2015), the metrics of performance are usually based on productivity, production, effectiveness, consistency, and attendance of work. According to April (2010), employee performance is positively influenced by the development of employee knowledge, skills, ability, competencies, and behavior, which benefits both the employee and the organization. Organizations that are committed to generating profit for its stakeholders, invest heavily in training and professional development of its staff in order to provide quality services to customers. Research carried out by Elnaga and Imran (2013), established the fact that training is one of the most important human resource management strategies because it improves the consistency of employees knowledge and skills, which leads to better employee success on the job. This paper argues staff training and professional development enhances the efficiency of employees, but only if it is adequately carried out on the basis of the deficiencies found in the expertise, skills of the workers concerned. Staff training d professional development creates benefits for both employees and the organization at large. Employees having received learning exhibit an enhanced level of knowledge, skill, and competency required for effective work performance. Thus, training and development positively impacts performance of the employees. The following hypotheses are put forward:

Hypothesis 1a: Staff training positively impacts employee performance.
Hypothesis 1b: Professional development positively impacts employee performance.

c) Impact of Training and Development on Work Engagement

Training and development has become an important strategic tool that enhances the performance of the employee thus organizations always create a huge budget for it with the hope of gaining strategic and competitive advantage in the business world. To complete a task on a job effectively and efficiently, people need skills and up-to-date knowledge. There is a need for training and development as roles and employment become more complex and complicated (Sheeba & Christopher, 2020). Training is a method that aims to improve the knowledge and skills of workers in order to advance and improve their performance at the workplace. Training offers understanding of the basic information needed to perform a specific task, knowledge to increase job performance and skills of the employee. Training is deemed to be successful only if it fills the knowledge/skill gap and trains workers for the future with a new set of skills (Sheeba & Christopher, 2020). Work engagement is a satisfying work-related state of mind marked by feelings of energy, commitment, and increased focus on role performance (Thava kumar & Nawaratne, 2015). Any organization that wants to achieve high levels of market performance
needs an engaged workforce with the requisite skills, experience, and expertise. Training and development has never been more important as a way of keeping workers motivated and maintaining a competitive edge in our current demanding and competitive market climate. The right training and development will significantly enhance employee engagement by developing creativity and inspiring people to learn new things and improve their results. Many people want to believe they are contributing to the part they play and that they are appreciated by their company. When done efficiently, training and development provides a new level of motivation and engagement for employees.

Employees feel appreciated for their contributions, and recognize that the organization is committed to helping them achieve their full potential. Hence, the impact of training and development on employee work engagement is positive. Thus,

Hypothesis 2a: Staff training has positive impact on work engagement.

Hypothesis 2b: Professional development has positive impact on work engagement.

d) Impact of Work Engagement on Employee Performance

According to Bakker et al. (2008), work engagement is an optimistic, satisfying, affective-motivational state of work-related well-being. Work engagement allows employees to become more invested in their job, thereby reducing or eliminating job burnout. An engaged employee for examples speaks more positively about the organization to customers and colleagues and have a deep desire to remain an employee of a particular organization despite the opportunities to work elsewhere (Schaufeli, 2013). This in turn contributes to higher performance for individuals and/or groups and become a strong basis for organizations' sustainability. The performance of the employee is considered to be the accomplishment of specific jobs by the employees of the company, weighed against precision, integrity, costor market values (Schaufeli, 2013). Work engagement has been theoretically linked to work success, since it means a strong motivating state that guides efforts of a person towards work and activities completion (Parker and Griffin 2011). A number of studies like Gorgievski, Bakker and Schaufeli, 2010; Sula et al., 2012; Bakker and Xanthopoulou, 2013; Barnes and Collier, 2013; Den Hartog and Belscha 2013, have shown a positive relation between working engagement and job performance. When an employee becomes genuinely engaged in his / her work, they work at the highest to fulfill the organization’s purpose and perform highly in their job roles. Employees who are engaged are more likely to feel positive feelings like satisfaction and excitement (Demerouti & Cropanzano, 2010). Since happy and optimistic people incorporate different ideas better, they are more likely to perform better (Tims, Bakker, Derks & van Rhenen 2013). These positive feelings contribute to a broader variety of thoughts and behaviors that translate training and development into performance outcomes for employees. Therefore, the study posits that:

Hypothesis 3: Work engagement has a positive impact on employee performance.

e) Training and Development, Work Engagement and Performance

Research carried out by Weil and Woodall (2005), asserts that organizations utilize training and development to close the gap existing amongst employees. They went on to say that there is a strong link between employee performance and training and development. Training programs are designed to improve an individual's performance in their current job, teach new skills for a future job or position, or promote overall growth for both the employee and the company. Thus, they identify training and development needs, devise a training method to meet those needs that have been identified, plan how to implement the training and development strategy, and finally evaluating the results (McCourt & Eldridge, 2003). In other words, employees with higher level of engagement in work are better at translating the benefits of training and development to generate improved performance. On the other hand, employees with lower levels of work engagement are indifferent to training and development, and less likely to take advantage of training opportunities to develop capacity to effectively execute tasks and improve personal productivity. From the foregoing, the study posits that:

Hypothesis 4a: Work engagement moderates the relationship between staff training and employee performance.

Hypothesis 4b: Work engagement moderates the relationship between professional development and employee performance.

IV. Methodology

The cross-sectional survey approach was used to gather data from both academic and administrative employees across Technical Universities in Ghana. The aim was to gather information about perceptions of training and development, and to ascertain how these impact performance in the context of their work engagement. Quantitative data was collected from administrators and academics in technical universities using structured questionnaire due to its advantages of ease of administering, rapid development and cost-effectiveness (Nueman, 2007). Notwithstanding, structured questionnaires may be characterized by respondents not providing accurate, and occurrence of data errors due to missing values. However, the cross-
sectional survey method was deemed most appropriate to collect data for this study. The data collection instrument comprised of Likert scale type close-ended questions, where respondents were asked to indicate the extent of their agreement or disagreement to statements about training and development, work engagement and performance in their respective institutions and units. The closed-ended questions were scored on a 5-point from 1 - strongly disagree to 5 - strongly agree. A total of 300 questionnaires were administered to respondents over a period of 5 weeks between February and March, 2021. At the end of the survey, 245 completed responses were collected and used in the analysis. The data was analysed using Partial Least Squares (PLS) Structural Equations Modelling (SEM) approach with SmartPLS software (Ringle et al., 2015). The choice of this approach and technique is rooted in predictive ability of SEM-PLS (Chin, 1998; Hair et al., 2016) which makes it suitable to examine the impact of work engagement on employee performance, and to assess the moderating effect of work engagement on this relationship.

V. Results of Analysis

The standard bootstrapping procedure (with 5,000 subsamples) available in Smart PLS 3 was run to test the significance of the hypothesized paths (Hair et al., 2013). Results for the measurement and structural models are presented below.

a) Measurement Model Validations

The validity and reliability of the measurement model was tested using Average Variance Extracted (AVE); Composite Reliability (CR) and Cronbach’s Alpha (α). The results in Table 1 below show that AVE values greater than 0.50 (AVE > 0.50), an indication of satisfactory convergent validity. Similarly, the constructs exhibit acceptable internal consistency of the measures, with Composite Reliability (CR > 0.70) and Cronbach’s alpha (α > 0.70) greater than 0.70 as recommended by Chin (1998). Next, the model was evaluated for discriminant validity to ascertain the independence of the constructs from one another (Hair et al., 2014). This was done in two way: the Fornell and Larcker criteria (Fornell and Larcker, 1981) and by the Heterotrait-Monotrait (HTMT) Ratio (Henseler et al., 2014). Results in Table 2 show that the square root of AVEs (shaded diagonal) are greater than the correlation between constructs, depicting acceptable discriminant validity according to the Fornell-Larcker criterion. Furthermore, as depicted in Table 3, all constructs show satisfactory discriminant validity at the HTMT0.85 criterion except for Professional Development which is slightly above (HTMT = 0.857) but deemed satisfactory (Henseler et al., 2014).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Reliability and Validity Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cronbach's Alpha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employee Performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work Engagement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2: Discriminant Validity Fornell-Larcker Criterion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employee Performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employee Performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work Engagement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3: Discriminant Validity Heterotrait-Monotrait Ratio (HTMT)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employee Performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work Engagement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
b) Structural Model Results

In all, the model comprised of six (7) hypothesized path relationships. Hypotheses H1a and H1b assessed the impact of staff training and professional development on employee performance respectively. Hypotheses H2a and H2b examined the impact of staff training and professional development on work engagement respectively. Hypothesis H3 assessed the relationship between work engagement and employee performance whereas hypotheses H4a and H4b investigated the moderating effect of work engagement on the relationships between staff training and professional development and employee performance respectively.

c) Main Model Results

Results in Table 4 below show support for hypotheses H1a, H1b, H2a and H2b. In other words, as hypothesized in H1a and H1b, the study found support for the proposition that staff training (β = 0.239, p value = 0.007, p ≤ 0.01) and professional development (β = 0.481, p value = 0.000, p ≤ 0.01) positively impact employee performance respectively. Similarly, results show that both staff training (β = 0.299, p value = 0.013, p ≤ 0.05) and professional development (β = 0.255, p value = 0.046, p ≤ 0.05) positively impact employee performance as hypothesized in H2a and H2b respectively. Interestingly, however, the results show that whilst staff training contributes more to work engagement of employees, professional development contributes more to employee performance. However, contrary to hypothesis H3, results in Table 4 and Figure 1 below for details.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis</th>
<th>Path Coefficient</th>
<th>T Statistics</th>
<th>P Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H1a: Staff Training -&gt; Employee Performance</td>
<td>0.239</td>
<td>2.722</td>
<td>0.007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H1b: Professional Development -&gt; Employee Performance</td>
<td>0.481</td>
<td>5.004</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H2a: Staff Training -&gt; Work Engagement</td>
<td>0.299</td>
<td>2.486</td>
<td>0.013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H2b: Professional Development -&gt; Work Engagement</td>
<td>2.555</td>
<td>1.999</td>
<td>0.046</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H3: Work Engagement -&gt; Employee Performance</td>
<td>0.119</td>
<td>1.131</td>
<td>0.259</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Figure 1: Model Results](image-url)

d) Moderation Model Results

In the second model, the study examined the moderating role of work engagement on the impact of staff training and professional development on employee performance. Again, the bootstrap procedure was run to test path significance. This was followed by the PLS algorithm to determine the path coefficient (β), and explanatory powers (R²) of the hypothesized paths. See Table 5 and Figure 2 below for details. The results do not provide evidence to support hypotheses H4a and H4b. In other words, contrary to hypothesis H4a, work engagement (β = 0.017, p value = 0.827, n.s) does not significantly moderate the relationship between staff training and employee performance, although the
relationship is positive. Similarly, contrary to hypothesis H4b, work engagement ($\beta = 0.012$, p value = 0.897, n.s) does not significantly moderate the impact of professional development on employee performance among academic and administrative staff in the technical universities surveyed. This implies that the level of work engagement does not necessarily improve or diminish the impact of staff training or professional development in the performance of employees.

### Table 5: Moderation Model Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis</th>
<th>Path Coefficient</th>
<th>T Statistics</th>
<th>P Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H4a: Work Engagement Moderator: Staff Training -&gt; Employee Performance</td>
<td>0.017</td>
<td>0.232</td>
<td>0.827</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H4b: Work Engagement Moderator: Professional Development -&gt; Employee Performance</td>
<td>0.012</td>
<td>0.136</td>
<td>0.892</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**VI. Discussion and Conclusion**

The findings support the assertion that training and development ensure workers learn how to do their job. The increased efficiency of the employees to implement the competences and expertise developed through training and professional development ultimately increases personal productivity and performance (Tahir et al., 2014). This affirms McKinsey's (2006) assertion that upgrading skills, capabilities and knowledge of the workforce is critical for organizational success. It is also evident that the skills, abilities, experiences and knowledge employees acquire training influence their level of engagement at work. According to Saks (2006), the work engagement of the employees can influence job satisfaction. In other words, the extent to which employees become immersed, engaged and enthusiastic about their job is determined by the training gained (Robinson & Judge, 2017). In order words, training and development can increase efficiency and improve employees' abilities, knowledge and expertise.

According to Armstrong (2009), training ensures greater levels of dedication from workers, must make sure to integrate training into its policies which will enable the employees to exert themselves on the job. On the other hand, professional development leads to new skills and abilities for future roles and responsibilities (Jehanzeb & Bashir, 2013). According to Nassazi (2013), professional development provides long-term, holistic growth of individuals in the organization for future roles and responsibilities. Hence, the long term goal of professional development accounts for its greater impact on employee performance than the short term goals of staff training, which rather improves level of employee work engagement and dedication due to satisfaction and job level skills. Training and development, thus, refers to a designed mechanism aimed at maintaining and improving the current and future performance of employees by enhancing their ability to work, change their attitudes or increase their skills and expertise in order to enhance the overall efficiency of employees and organizations (Imran & Tanveer, 2015).

Companies of all sizes are embracing "continual learning" and other aspects of learning and development as a means of attracting and retaining highly skilled employees. Indeed, the quality of workers
and the continuous development of their skills and productivity through training are now commonly recognized as critical factors in ensuring the long-term growth and sustainability of small enterprises and in addition to creating a corporate culture that promotes continuous learning (SAMDAMALI et al., 2018). Contrary, to the study’s argument, however, work engagement does not influence the impact of both staff training and professional development of their resultant performance outcomes significantly. Work engagement can simply be understood as being fired with internal motivation. Yet, the study finds that increasing workforce engagement among administrators and academic staff of technical universities does not lead to positive outcomes in their performance. In staff training, the emphasis is current, the use of work experiences is low, and goals are set for the present work environment, and participation is necessary if initiated. On the other hand, professional development is directed more to self and requires self-motivation to be able to find avenues for personal and career advancements (IMRAN & TANVEER, 2015). Hence, staff training leads more to work engagement, which ultimately does not impact employee performance. As a result, technical universities should rather focus on rolling out more professional development programs for administrators and faculty to prepare employees for future roles and to directly impact performance than short-terms gains from training which leads to greater work engagement.

**References Références Referencias**

16. doi:10.1080/1359432X.2010.532869


Impact of Strategic Human Resource Management Practices on Business Competitive Priorities Mediated by Organizational Citizenship Behavior in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies

By Ahmad Swedat

Abstract: This study aimed to investigate the impact of strategic human resource management practices (human resource planning, recruitment and selection, training and development, compensation, and performance appraisal) on business competitive priorities, (cost, quality, delivery, and flexibility) through testing the organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) as a mediating variable in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies. The research was conducted by selecting (57) manufacturing companies in Jordan as a sample. The sample of the study consisted of (162) questionnaires out of (224) that were randomly distributed to employees at different administrative levels. A simple and multiple regression analysis was conducted to test the hypotheses.

Keywords: recruitment and selection, compensations, training and development, organizational citizenship behavior, quality, flexibility, delivery.

GJMBR-A Classification: JEL Code: M10

Strictly as per the compliance and regulations of:

© 2021, Ahmad Sweda. This research/review article is distributed under the terms of the Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0). You must give appropriate credit to authors and reference this article if parts of the article are reproduced in any manner. Applicable licensing terms are at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/.
Impact of Strategic Human Resource Management Practices on Business Competitive Priorities Mediated by Organizational Citizenship Behavior in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies

Ahmad Swedat

Abstract- This study aimed to investigate the impact of strategic human resource management practices (human resource planning, recruitment and selection, training and development, compensation, and performance appraisal) on business competitive priorities, (cost, quality, delivery, and flexibility) through testing the organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) as a mediating variable in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies. The research was conducted by selecting (57) manufacturing companies in Jordan as a sample. The sample of the study consisted of (162) questionnaires out of (224) that were randomly distributed to employees at different administrative levels. A simple and multiple regression analysis was conducted to test the hypotheses. Findings from our study revealed that SHRM practices have a positive effect on business competitive priorities and organizational citizenship behavior. The results also found that organizational citizenship behavior has a positive impact on business competitive priorities. The results also revealed that organizational citizenship behavior partially mediated the relationship between SHRM practices and business competitive priorities.

Keywords: recruitment and selection, compensations, training and development, organizational citizenship behavior, quality, flexibility, delivery.

I. Introduction

Human resource (HR) is among the most beneficial assets that organizations can ever have to do towards gaining a competitive edge and face changes. Business organizations, in order to face the challenges, changes, and rapid growth in the corporate world, need to apply the best practices for HR that work continuously for planning, development, training, recruitment, and selection of the best qualifications, competencies, and experiences with great care, motivation, and evaluation of their performance (Bisharat et al; 2017). Organizations seek to achieve sustainable competitive advantage around the world by investing in their capabilities and competencies to become different from their competitors. Furthermore, organizations strive to achieve a competitive advantage by selecting the best practices and implementing innovative HRM practices with high performance to manage HR effectively and efficiently (Al-Qudah, et al; 2020). SHRM practices may differ from organization to organization and from country to country (Tangthong, et al., 2015). In this regard, most companies are constantly improving their HRM practices to achieve sustainable competitive advantage and increase their profitability, and productivity (Mansour, 2015). According to Tandoğan, (2018). The effective application of HRM practices in business enterprises will facilitate these organizations to achieve their goals, especially since these business organizations depend on their ability to survive and achieve competitive advantage on their qualified and trained HR. Therefore, businesses must maximize the skills, knowledge, and capabilities of their employees in order to motivate them to carry out their jobs so that the company gains superiority over their competitors and increases productivity growth as much as possible.

Organizations face many challenges in light of intensive competition, so organizations must take care of the human component; the success of organizations depends on this dynamic element. Additionally, the appropriate work environment must be created for HR to achieve success and the continuity of the organization, and highlight the concept of Organizational citizenship behavior (OCB). It is one of the methods of modern management, whose idea is adopted as a voluntary method and not linked to the role or official description, it is clear that this idea maintains the effectiveness and continuity of the organization. OCB became under the influence of organizational behavior and a branch of HRM (Sharm & Agrawal, 2015). OCB is considered to be a crucial factor in increasing organizational efficiency, and to enhance smoothly employee productivity in the organizations (Bizri, 2018; Chelagat, et al; 2015; Rahman & Chowdhuri, 2018; Yang et al; 2016) and is positively associated with the success of the organizations (Organ, et al; 2006). Also, organizations view OCB as an essential component for the
organization’s sustainability but these activities are seldom included in the formal job description (Jain & Rizvi, 2018). On the other hand, the absence of OCB among employees can risk the continuity of the organization (Ahmad & Zafar, 2018).

In addition to the dynamic changes resulting from the emergence of globalization, economic, technological, political, and demographic developments and changes in the needs and desires of customers, which led to a change in the priorities of competition between organizations over time. Once the organizations limited themselves to offering products at the lowest prices, this resulted in an increase in the number of competitors in each commercial sector and an emphasis on price competition. This has created the need to offer products with unique quality and characteristics of products available in the market. As a result of imitating competitors and producing similar products, unique products have again emerged the need to look for a new competitive priority called time or delivery speed. Many companies focused on offering their products when they wanted them to be on-demand. Then flexibility emerged as a competitive priority in light of the diversity of customer needs and desires, in order for the organization to achieve a strong competitive position it must be able to offer a variety of products or services in order to meet the changes in the needs and desires of the client. Certainly, changes in the nature of business competitive priorities are influenced by changes in global competition and customer requirements (kathuria, et al; 2018) However, competitive priorities (cost, quality, flexibility, ad delivery) are the basis for developing distinct capabilities in production systems, and are the main pillars in strategic operations management (Choudhari et al., 2010; Martin & Díaz 2009) and are considered the most important factor in internal operational capabilities (Peng et al; 2011).

a) Research Problem

Globalization pushes, Jordanian Manufacturing companies to operate in a more complex environment due to the integration of international markets, the emergence of intensive competition, and new rules of business due to mergers and alliances of companies, both at the level of companies and countries. One of the biggest challenges that companies face, since the advent of competitive advantage and new ways of competitive priorities for the most important goals that all manufacturing companies seek, is the constant change in ideas, technology, tastes, products, services, and the disappearance of geographical divisions in the face of globalization. It is necessary to confront change, keep pace with progress, and adapt to environmental changes. From this perspective, strategic human resource management (SHRM) practices are the way in which they are highlighted to address problems, employ high-performance capabilities of employees with well-training and skills developed in order to adapt with internal and external changes. In spite of the increasing movement towards recognition of the great impact of HR practices on the performance of employees and the organizations (Tandoğan, 2018; Mehmood, et al; 2017. Ali, et al., 2017; Altarawneh, 2016; Khawaja et al., 2014; Akhtar, et al; 2014; Darwish, et al; 2013; Katou, et al; 2007). There is still a lack of empirical studies that addressing the effect of SHRM practices on the business competitive priorities implementation. To the best researcher's knowledge, there are few studies available to measure SHRM practices on the business competitive priorities in developing countries, especially in the context of Jordan. In addition, a few studies had been conducted in the manufacturing sector. Almost all theories and evidence about the relationship between HRM practices and organizational performance depend on research in the United States, Europe, and East Asia (e.g. Çalişkan, 2010, Uysal, 2014; Gurbuz, & Ibrahim, 2011; Mättar, & Mathew, 2014; Gooderham et al., 2008; Vlachos, 2008;) Since there is a gap of research that has been done in the field of HRM practices and business competitive priorities in the context of developing countries. Just in previous studies concerning the relationships and impact of SHRM practices on individual and organizational performance, it uncovers too much the relationships and impact of SHRM practices on business competitive priorities. Therefore, the objective of this study is to determine the effect of SHRM practices on business competitive priorities in Jordanian manufacturing companies. Although a large number of researches were conducted on the impact of HRM practices on organizational performance, there is still a wide range of research opportunities or gaps in competitive priorities that need research attention to help further build rigor literature of SHRM practices and their impact on competitive priorities through OCB as the mediating variable. Additionally, there is a large absence in local studies to address the issue of Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB) in previous studies to measure the extent of mediation between the relationship between SHRM practices and competitive priorities for business in Jordanian companies in general and manufacturing companies in particular. There is no doubt that the importance of OCB plays a prominent role in the work environment as it works on the smooth flow of business into organizations without any obstacles and conflicts which curbing the efficiency and effectiveness of employees in their work.

Based on the previous gap, there are some reasons, and motives for choosing this topic. HR is the lifeblood of any business in itself. In other words, the success of any organization depends on the quality of HR. That is, the success of various businesses, such as the manufacturing sector, depends to a large extent on the performance of HR. However, organizations and
empirical studies have proven that “personnel” or HR is the backbone of performance success and are major determinants of productivity and profitability. To the author’s knowledge, there are no previous studies that examined the mediating role of OCB in the relationship between SHRM practices and the competitive business priorities of manufacturing organizations in the context of Jordan. By reviewing the literature on previous studies, the researcher noted that there are several studies around the world that focus on the impact of HRM practices on organizational performance. To date, this first study concerns how SHRM practices affect business competitive priorities through OCB in Jordanian manufacturing companies. Despite this, significant research attention has been paid to the relationship between SHRM practices and corporate and individual performance. Hence, this study was undertaken to fill this obvious research gap.

This study seeks to answer the following main question:
To what extent does the Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB) mediate the impact of SHRM Practices on Business Competitive Priorities in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies?

b) Research Questions
In light of the research problem, this study seeks to answer the following questions:
Q1: To what extent does SHRM practices (HRP, recruitment and selection, compensation, training and development, and performance evaluation) impact on business competitive priorities in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies?
Q2: To what extent does SHRM practices (HRP, recruitment and selection, compensation, training and development, and performance evaluation) impact on organizational citizenship behavior in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies?
Q3: To what extent does organizational citizenship behavior impact on business competitive priorities in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies?
Q4: How does organizational citizenship behavior mediate the relationship between SHRM practices and business competitive priorities in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies?

c) Research Objectives
In light of the research, objectives of the study are as follows:
1. To examine the impact of SHRM practices (HRP, recruitment and selection, compensation , training and development, and performance appraisal) on business competitive priorities in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies.
2. To examine the impact of SHRM practices (HRP, recruitment and selection, compensation, training and development, and performance appraisal) on organizational citizenship behavior in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies.
3. To examine the impact of organizational citizenship behavior on business competitive priorities in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies.
4. To examine the mediating impact of the organizational citizenship behavior on the relationship between SHRM practices (HRP, recruitment and selection, compensation , training and development, and performance appraisal) and business competitive priorities in Jordanian Manufacturing Firms.

II. Literature Review and Hypotheses Development

This section will discuss the literature related to strategic HRM practices and the competitive priorities of the business, the OCB, and their relationship with one another.

a) Strategic HRM practices
SHRM practices are a set of practices and functions designed to manage efficiently and effectively HR within the organization and link these practices with strategic objectives of the organization to achieve the goals of the organization, and improve the organization’s performance in the long term.

In this study, Five SHRM practices were selected as key dimensions of this study such as (HRP, recruitment and selection, training and development, compensation, and performance evaluation).

i. HR planning
Human resources planning (HRP) is one of the most significant HR practices in the organization. Organizations rely greatly on HRP to determine their current position and future needs of manpower (Sammel, 2018). According to Jacobson, (2010) HRP is a core HRM process that looks forward to preparing the organization for its current, and future workforce needs by ensuring that the right people are within the correct put at the right times in the right places. Bratton and Gold (2007) define HR planning as the process of systematically predicting demand and future supply of staff and deploying their skills to the organization's strategic objectives. Furthermore, HRP plays an important role in organizations as a means of optimizing the human element and alleviating HR problems. The importance of the organization of HRP is illustrated by the following (Sammel, 2018):

1. The importance of HRP is that it helps the organization to identify its future needs, thereby reducing the cost that may result from a shortage or increase in these resources and eliminating the negative repercussions of management in this case.
2. Facing changes and adaptability, where the organization faces changes in competitive forces,
markets, technology, and government legislation, these changes lead to changes in job content, skills requirements, worker preparation, and quality, which can be answered through the HRP process.

3. HRP is an essential part of the organization's strategic planning process. The strategic planning of the organization requires an analytical study of all environmental conditions and analysis of the various strengths and weaknesses of HR in the organization.

4. To create a stable dynamic balance between the organization's HR needs and the labor market, both at a single organization level and at a sectoral level.

5. HRP contributes to the replacement process, preventing the organization from disrupting productivity in different sectors. HRP planning is an effective way to identify those who leave the service and seek to provide and replace alternatives.

ii. Recruitment and Selection

Recruitment and selection play a great role in the survival of each organization and its effecting basically on improving the performance of an organization (Gamage, 2014). Basically, the recruitment and selection process aims to attract qualified staff to an organization that will perform its functions effectively and efficiently to achieve organizational objectives. Qualified staff will enhance the organization's successful performance, which will contribute significantly to the organization's values and objectives (Harky, 2018). In other words, recruitment and selection are the two phases of the recruitment process there is a difference between them, the Recruitment is the first process in the search for qualified candidates to fill the specified vacancies and motivate them to provide these jobs in the organization, subsequently being the process of screening procedures and other sequential selection of suitable candidates for the vacant positions, While the selection is the selection of the best candidates for various vacancies in the company and the decision of the official appointment after the interview and tests for this vacancy (Oaya, et al; 2017).

The more organizations succeed in recruiting and selecting candidates, the more likely they are to be recruited and to retain the satisfaction of staff. In addition, the effectiveness of the enterprise selection system can affect core business outcomes, such as productivity and financial performance (Ekwoaba, Ikeije & Ufoma, 2015). In addition, hiring the right staff in the right place at the right time is crucial to the survival and success of any organization (Ayanda, & Danlami, 2011).

The importance and benefits of recruitment and selection practices can be summarized with the following points (Kumari 2012):

1. It helps to create a pool of talent from potential candidates for the benefit of the organization.
2. To increase the group of job seekers at the lowest cost.
3. It helps increase the success rate of the selection process by reducing the number of visits to qualified or unqualified job applicants.
4. Helps identify and prepare potential job applicants who will be the right candidate for the job.
5. Finally, it helps to raise the organization and individual effectiveness of different recruitment methods and for all sorts of job applicants.

iii. Training and Development

Training is a process used to increase employees' knowledge and skills so that they can perform specific tasks (Suifan, 2015). While, development is a development-oriented educational activity that is more about growth than direct performance, while training is an activity geared towards acquiring specific knowledge and skills for the purpose of a job or task (Armstrong, 2008). Development may also help employees prepare for changes in their current jobs, such as changes resulting from new technology, business designs, or customers. Development, therefore, relates to preparing for a change in the form of new jobs, new responsibilities, or new requirements. Employee development is a necessary effort for a company to improve quality and meet the challenges of global competition and social changes (Noe, et al; 2004).

Training and development activities are at the heart of an organization's growth, as they are valuable tools because of their investment in the organization. It helps the organization to improve profitability, reduce costs, increase commitment, motivate its employees and release its capabilities. According to Thang, et al. (2010) stated Training and development lead to superior employee knowledge, skills, abilities, attitudes, and behaviors, ultimately enhancing the excellent financial and non-financial performance of organizations.

According to Cole (2002) & Kulkarni, (2013) Training can achieve several goals:

1. Expanding skills and competence: Training helps enhance the knowledge and technical skills of employees at each level of the organization. It enables them to learn new skills and knowledge continuously so that they remain up-to-date.
2. Enhancing competitive advantage: One of the important competitive advantages of the organization in a competitive environment is its workforce. It can retain the competencies and skills of the core workforce through continuous and regular training of its workforce.
3. High morale and enrichment of Team Spirit: Well-trained staff has increased confidence and motivation. In general, training helps to enhance team spirit and cooperation between staff. In fact, it
enhances the spirit of the group and makes members work harder to succeed as a group.
4. Low production cost: Training eliminates risks because trained staff are able to use materials and equipment better and economically, thereby reducing and avoiding waste.
5. Lower turnover: Training brings a sense of security in the workplace which reduces work turnover and avoids absenteeism.
6. Change Management: Training helps manage change by increasing staff understanding and involvement in the change process and also provides the skills and capabilities to adapt to new situations.
7. Improving organization and employee performance in the workforce: Training and development programs are updating the employee's knowledge and enhancing their personal skills, it helps avoid administrative obsolescence. With the use of these programs, it is easier for the department to evaluate job performance and accordingly, make decisions such as employee promotion, bonuses, compensation, and social welfare facilities. And so on. These training programs also help managers plan succession, retain staff, and motivate. It creates efficient and effective staff in the organization.

iv. Compensation

According to Dessler (2017) defined the compensation all shapes of wages or rewards that going to employees and arising from their work, it may be direct financial payments (payment in the structure of wages, salaries, incentive, commissions, and additional benefit) and indirect financial payments (fees in the form of financial benefits such as insurance). According to Ivancevich (2004), and Battacharyya & Sengupta (2014), there are a lot of objectives that compensations system are seeking to achieve for employees and organization as follows:
1. To establish internal and external a fair and equitable compensation.
2. Improving individual productivity and organizational efficiency.
3. Creating a positive image of the organization for attracting top talent in the labour market.
4. Control of the cost of human resources.
5. Improving human relations among staff.
6. Compliance with laws and regulations.

v. Performance Appraisal

The concept of performance appraisal has been defined differently by many scholars and researchers. According to Dessler (2015), performance appraisal is evaluating an employee's current and past performance relative to his or her performance standard. Performance appraisal is a technique used to measure the performance of an employee. Performance could be measured by the quality and quantity of work, and tasks, and their financial impact by immediate supervisor (Awais, 2018). Performance evaluation can be defined as testing, evaluating, measuring, and justifying the performance of employees over a specified period of time. Obisi (2011) defined the evaluation of performance as any work process that requires the development of labor standards and the assessment of the actual performance of staff in relation to specific standards.

The Performance Appraisal is an important engine that looks for better, more accurate, and cost-effective ways to evaluate employee performance and motivate them. Performance evaluation changes employee attitudes and behaviors and has an important impact on individual and organizational performance (Yongjun, 2013). According to Vashistha & Devdutt (2018), the organization's performance depends on the performance of its staff. The success of an organization, therefore, depends on its ability to accurately measure the performance of its employees and use its objectivity to improve it as a vital resource.

Performance evaluations are used for a number of reasons and can have a significant impact on salary management, performance feedback, promotions, training, development, and identifying individual strengths and weaknesses. Key performance appraisal objectives summarized below (Thurston, Wells, & McNall, 2010. Butali, & Njoroge, 2007):
1. To assist in promotions, transfers and termination decisions.
2. To identify the gap performance between the actual employee performance and performance expected that are required by organization.
3. To meet organizational expectations with employees' objectives
4. To help in designing programs and assessing the training and development needs of the employees.
5. To plan job rotations.
6. To facilitate and improve communication between directors and subordinates.
7. To Assist in managing wages and salaries, and determine compensation packages.
8. To provide feedback and guidelines for employees for better performance
9. To inculcation job satisfaction and inspiration him to work hard to achieve organizational goals.
10. To determine the HR program for selection, training and development, and to evaluate their effectiveness.
11. To increase employee effectiveness through maintaining strengths and eliminating weaknesses.

b) Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB)

Many researchers have addressed the concept of Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB) although there are similarities between them and agree that it is a positive action and behavior that supports
organizations, members, and work. According to Ranjhan & Mallick (2018) organizational citizenship behaviors (OCB) can be defined as voluntary behavior carried out by individuals in the organization without being asked to perform these roles; it exceeds job requirements and is not part of the job description or reward system. It contribute to the success of the organization and increase its efficiency and effectiveness of organization.

Scholars consider the importance of studying organizational citizenship behavior in four main factors (Hussain, 2015):

Studying it and determining its dimensions reduces the volume of disturbances and institutional problems carried out by workers and employees in various institutions. These oppositions are caused by the ambiguity in the job expectations of individuals within the business.

It reduces the need to use many resources and waste of scarce institutional resources. By emphasizing additional behaviors, roles, and tasks for the employee to perform.

It works to create a stimulating and creative work environment that makes the organization able to overcome the obstacles and challenges it faces.

It works to achieve job satisfaction and a state of organizational justice and reduces the rate of job turnover and the desire to leave work.

The Organ et al (2006) identified five main dimensions of OCB, the most common, which were used in my study as the main dimensions of OCB. Brief explanation for these dimensions as follows:

Altruism: These are the voluntary behaviors that employees perform in order to help others perform their tasks and solve problems.

Courtesy: Includes behaviors which prevent to cause problems and leads to taking the necessary step so as to diminish the effects of the problems in the future.

Sportsmanship: The desire of workers to endure harsh working conditions without complaint or grumbling.

Civic virtue: Voluntary behavior of the individual participating in the life of the organization, improving performance, reducing customer complaints, and improving the image of the organization in front of others.

Conscientiousness: It is the voluntary behavior of employees in roles that go beyond the requirements of the job in terms of attending meetings and complying with laws and regulations.

c) Business Competitive priorities (BCP)

The topic of competitive priorities in operations management literature has received considerable attention from researchers in recent years (Prajogo, & McDermott, 2011). Phusavat & Kanchana (2007) defined the competitive priorities as the dimensions that a company's production system must have to support the market demand in which the company wishes to compete. The importance of the competitive priorities stems from the fact that it focuses on the future of the company's manufacturing, which supports its strategic position in the market and is the driving force for the continuous improvement of the different values for the pressure of globalization, in addition, awareness of competitive priorities will be lead to a better selecting of future manufacturing strategies (Hung, 2014).

The most commonly used for business competitive priorities are cost, quality, delivery time, and flexibility. The four priorities can be explained in operational objectives. For example, reduce the cost of producing and distributing products (cost), reduce product variation and improve their performance (quality), reduce deadlines (delivery speed), increase meeting capacity (reliability delivery), increase reactive capacity for change in demand quantity, demand mix, and specifications Product (flexibility) (Canfield & Sellitto, 2018). Based on that the researcher adopting these competitive priorities, cost, quality, delivery, and flexibility as dimensions of this study: it will be clarified as follows:

Product price or reducing cost: Companies resort to making product prices much lower than their competitors in order to satisfy their customers (Diab, 2014).

Product quality: Manufacturing companies must make great efforts to offer products with superior features and functions over competitors with high quality in terms of free-defects reliability, durability, conformance to specifications and meeting customer expectations, design characteristics, and reduce environmental damage (Zhao, et al, 2002).

Flexibility production: Manufacturing companies should be flexible in production to keep pace with changes in production volume up and down and to accommodate changes in demand (Reid & Sanders, 2011).

Product delivery: On-time delivery of the product is a prerequisite for customer needs. Manufacturing companies must offer shorter delivery times and to meet the deadlines The measure of the operational success of industrial companies depends on the speed at which products are delivered to customers on time (Zhao, et al, 2002).

d) The relationship between SHRM Practices and Business Competitive Priorities

According to the literature review, several authors conducted that there is a positive impact of HRM on business competitive priorities. For example, Adil (2015) conducted a study to investigate eight SHRM practices (recruitment & selection, performance appraisal, training and development, compensation and rewards, employment security, job description, career
opportunities, decentralization, and empowerment) on the four competitive priorities (cost, quality, delivery, and flexibility) of the manufacturing performance in Karachi. The study found out the HRM practices has a strong impact on four competitive priorities of the manufacturing in Karachi. In addition, found out both performance appraisal and employment security have been found statistically significant to predict these four priorities in isolation too. In addition, the results of the structural model show that eight SHRM practices have a strong impact on the four competitive priorities of Karachi’s manufacturing performance when controlled for employee relationship and information sharing. Based on these findings, it can be concluded that senior management must clearly emphasize the ‘investment perspective’ in SHRM by bringing ‘right’ individuals into their business and thereby facilitating them with all the necessary information to help them make them well informed and rational decisions.

In contrast, while a study came that was conducted by Vivares-Vergara, et al. (2016) in contradiction with the review of the literature of previous studies, his study revealed that there was no statistically significant relationship between HRM practices and performance in competitive priorities. The study revealed that there is no significant correlation between HRM practices and performance in competitive priorities. With regard to employee factors, there were two important outcomes: first, when companies have advantages over individuals in making operational strategy decisions (motivation, personal goals, capabilities, etc.) better performance can be seen in competitive priorities; higher than job satisfaction and job performance, performance improves in competitive priorities.

Ahmed and Schroeder (2003), measure the impact of HRM practices on operational performance, their research focused on manufacturing plants operating in four countries (Germany, Italy, Japan, and the United States of America). The results of the studies showed that organizational performance is positively linked to each of the seven HRM practices, and found out the five of the HRM practices studied contributed to performance improvement competitive priorities. The remaining practices (job security and differences in position) did not show a direct impact on competitive priorities but did create obstacles to implementing other practices. Plants working in totally different businesses and/or nations utilize and emphasize HRM practices. Compensation was found to be important for the operating performance measure, while compensation was found to be not important for measuring intangible performance. Santos (2000), conducted a study to investigate the relationship between functional areas for manufacturing and HR through the analysis of HRM practices that are linked to the priorities of competitive strategy and manufacturing based on quality and performance delivery, flexibility, and cost. He concluded that must be there coherence between the competitive priorities of the manufacturing strategy and HR Practices must be practiced throughout the organization in order to achieve competitiveness.

Based on the previous discussion, the following hypotheses are proposed:

\[ H1: \text{There is a statistically significant positive impact of SHRM practices on the Business competitive priorities in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies.} \]

Through the following sub-hypotheses:

\[ H1-1: \text{There is a statistically significant positive impact of HR planning on Business competitive priorities in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies.} \]

\[ H1-2: \text{There is a statistically significant positive impact of recruitment and selection on the Business competitive priorities in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies.} \]

\[ H1-3: \text{There is a statistically significant positive impact of compensation on the Business competitive priorities in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies.} \]

\[ H1-4: \text{There is a statistically significant positive impact of training and development on the Business competitive priorities in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies.} \]

\[ H1-5: \text{There is a statistically significant positive impact of performance appraisal on Business competitive priorities in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies.} \]

e) The relationship between SHRM practices and OCB

Effective practices of each HRM function can enhance OCB of employees within the organization, and facilitate the improvement of individual and organizational performance and productivity. In addition, HRM practices can encourage specific behaviors and attitudes and discourage undesirable behaviors (Anna. et al; 2019; Begum, et al; 2014). According to Anna. et al; (2019). When HRM functions are performed within an organization characterized by a stimulating work environment and a creative climate, managers and employees work with a team spirit. It induces and motivates them to undertake creative behaviors and encourage them to go beyond their job requirements, such as: helping each other, performing additional role duties, sharing information and knowledge, and instilling a spirit of cooperation among employees. For this reason, OCB is an important factor that can contribute to the survival of the organization (Dash & Pradhan, 2014). HRM contains the policies, practices, and systems that affect employee behaviors, attitudes, and performance (Noe. et al; 2015). According to Wei, et al, (2010), Good HRM practices help individuals engage in OCB for the benefit of the organization. HR practices such as employee selection procedures, evaluation practices, and rewards, will affect the behavior of employees. Bolino & Turnley (2003) Argued that the
organization can use the prosperity of OCB by employing good practices of HRM such as recruitment and selection, training and development, compensation, and performance evaluation. Such practices can build a strong organizational culture with norms that encourage participation in OCB and make managers an example for their staff. According to Ranjhan & Mallick, (2018) HR Practices play an important role in building an appropriate environment and maintaining a culture in which OCB flourishes. In addition, these behaviors go a long way in maintaining an organizational culture that promotes positive employee engagement, commitment, and motivation, which helps enterprises gain a competitive advantage. Several previous studies support this. For example, a study was conducted by Tinti et al; (2017) to investigate the impact of HR policies and practices on OCB. The results revealed a significant impact of HR policies and practices on OCB and demonstrate that only professional participation has shown a significant relationship. They also conclude that HR policies and practices influence the dissemination of the organizational image and creative suggestions of OCB factors. The results refer to suggestions where managers can act to effectively extract OCB behaviors from their employees. Besides that, the empirical study conducted by Chaisanit, & Punyasiri (2020) to check the relationship between perceived HRM practices and OCB, and to investigate the mediating role of employee engagement between them. The study found out that perceived HRM practices were positively related to OCB. While the study revealed also that employee engagement played a partial mediating role in the relationship between perceived HRM practices and OCB. Nikoletta & Nawangsari, (2019) conducted a study to measure the impact of HRM practices on OCB at Mall of Indonesia, the results of a study that revealed HRM practices have a positive effect on OCB and discovered some HRM practices have a weak effect on OCB, but performance appraisals have a most significant impact on OCB. Recruitment of staff, training, and development, compensation and reward, performance appraisal with them a positive influence positively on OCB of Kelapa Gading Mall. While, the results of the study confirmed by Fajar & Soling (2017) to measure the effectiveness of the HRM practices on employee OCB in ICT companies. However, each dimension of HRM practices, with the exception of training, has a positive significance, but there is no strong indication to encourage the conduct of OCB activities that have been demonstrated by employees in the IT company. A lot of researchers investigated the effects of HRM practices on OCBs (Guest et al., 2004; Zhang et al., 2008). Jangsririwattana (2017) investigates the structural relationship between HRM practices, OCB, and turnover intention of a civil aviation organization in Thailand. The study findings were revealed that not all HRM practices influence the employee’s OCB and turnover intention. Excluding recruitment has a positive effect on OCB and organizational support has negatively affected employee turnover intention.

Based on the previous discussion, the following hypotheses are proposed:

H2: There is a statistically significant positive impact of SHRM practices on the Organizational Citizenship Behavior in Jordan Manufacturing Companies.

Its branch from it; the following sub-hypotheses:

H2.1: There is a statistically significant positive impact of HR planning on the Organizational Citizenship Behavior in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies.

H2.2: There is a statistically significant positive impact of recruitment and selection Organizational Citizenship Behavior in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies.

H2.3: There is a statistically significant positive impact of training and development on the Organizational Citizenship Behavior in Jordan Manufacturing Companies.

H2.4: There is a statistically significant positive impact of compensation on the Organizational Citizenship Behavior in Jordan Manufacturing Companies.

H2.5: There is a statistically significant positive impact of performance appraisal on the Organizational Citizenship Behavior in Jordan Manufacturing Companies.

f) The relationship between OCB and Business Competitive Priorities

Most previous studies confirmed that there is a strong relationship between organizational citizenship behavior and organizational performance and its effectiveness and achieving competitive advantage, productivity, and increasing individual performance. For instance, Ranjan & Millick (2018) conducted a study to explore the role of OCB in creating a competitive advantage for Indian health organizations through the moderating role of HR practices. The result of the study has indicated there is a positive relationship between OCB and competitive advantage significantly moderated by HR practices. Basically, OCB has been linked to overall organizational performance and effectiveness, further, thus types of employee behaviors are important to compete among the competitors and achieve an advantage in business. OCB is informal but it is an integral part of the official job description, which is voluntary behavior. However, the dimensions of OCB (altruism, conscientiousness, sportsmanship, courtesy, civic virtue), are the most important factors for achieving the organization's objectives and developing its competitive advantage.

Kumar, & Thapliyal, (2017) conducted a study to measure the impact of OCB on organizational effectiveness. The results of the study have revealed OCB: altruism, sportsmanship, and civic virtue have the highest and significant correlation with organizational
effectiveness. In addition, this study indicated that altruism, sportsmanship, conscience, courtesy and civic virtue is positively and significantly linked to organizational effectiveness. There is a positive relationship between OCB and organizational effectiveness. OCB has been considered to be one of the most impactful factors influencing organizational effectiveness (Castro, et al; 2004 Turnipseed, and Rassuli, 2005). Another study conducted by Basu et al (2017) to explore the relationship between OCB and job performance, and to examine the mediating role of social capital influencing the relationship between OCB and job performance. The present study was applied to 501 employees working in 15 healthcare organizations in Kolkata of India through a questionnaire survey, by using Likert type rating the founding of this study shows that OCB had a significant impact on job performance. In addition, social capital found a significant mediator between OCB and job performance. Chelagate, et al. (2015), conducted a study to determine the impact of OCB on employee performance in banking in Kenya. The results of the study indicated that altruism and courtesy were positive and important for enhancing staff performance. The study found that OCB is a key factor in improving employee performance. Mallick, et al; (2014), they had conducted a study to examine the relationship between OCB and HR practices with its corresponding impact on job performance. The findings of the study revealed that OCB is having a significant relationship with job performance with the different dimensions of OCB. The study found that the altruistic dimension has the strongest relationship with job performance. Furthermore, HR practices have significantly moderated the relationship between OCB and job performance. In addition, the findings of the study have advocated that the involvement of employees in altruistic behavior enhances productivity and performance at the workplace. In addition, Researchers have shown that organizational citizenship behavior (OCBs) makes important contributions to the effective individual, team, and organization (Organ, Podsakoff, & MacKenzie, 2006).

Based on the previous discussion, the following hypotheses are proposed:

H 3: There is a statistically significant positive impact of organizational citizenship behavior (OCBs) on Business competitive priorities the in Jordan Manufacturing Companies.

G) The mediating role of OCB in the relationship between SHRM practices and Business Competitive Priorities

Organizational citizenship behaviors (OCB) as a mediating variable in the relationship between SHRM practices and competitive business priorities have not been examined before. In this study, we will investigate the mediating influence of organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) on the relationship between SHRM practices and business competitive priorities. While the researcher found that there are some previous studies related to the topic of research, as the study of organizational citizenship behavior is a mediating role between HRM practices and the performance of the company. For example, Babai et al, (2012) examine the mediation effects of organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) on the relationship between selected HRM practices and firm performance. The results of the study found that organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) fully mediated the relationship between reward practices and quality services and partially mediated the relationships between performance appraisal practices and quality of service. Therefore, The study emphasized that HRM practices play an important role in improving OCB among employees as well as improving the performance of companies. Another study conducted by Dizgah et, al (2011) to clarify the relationship between high-performance practices and corporate entrepreneurship and also tries to demonstrate the mediator role of citizenship behavior and procedural justice in this relationship. This study showing that high-performance HR practices are positively related to corporate entrepreneurship, and this relationship is mediating by OCB and procedural justice. A similar study conducted by Zhang et al. (2008), found that HR practices are largely and positively linked to corporate entrepreneurship, and this relationship has intensified with moderator variables such as OCB and procedural justice. Additionally, revealed the results of the study conducted by Sreelakshmi (2016), OCB mediated partially on the relationship between empowerment and organizational performance perceived. The study of Babaie, et al; (2012) is consistent with a study conducted by Sun et al. (2007). Show that OCB have mediating effects high working HR practices on performance. However, Iam et al, (2009) conducted a study to investigate how employees' organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) mediates the relationships among perceived HRM practices (retention-oriented compensation and formalized training ) on the employee's intention to leave the jobs, this study used (152) employees as a sample from a Sino- Japanese joint venture located in China. The results of this study revealed that retention-oriented compensation and formalized training are positively related to the engagement of the OCB. While they were negatively associated with attention to leave their jobs. In addition, they were discovered the OCB mediate the effects of retention-oriented compensation and formalized training on employees the intention to leave.
Supriyanto et al. (2020) conducted research to analyze the role of OCB and work satisfaction on mediate the effect of spiritual leadership on employees’ performance at Bank BRI Syariah Malang. Research results indicated that spiritual leadership did not directly impact employee performance. Job satisfaction mediated the impact of spiritual leadership on employee performance. In another study by Hsiao & Wang (2020), they found that OCB mediated the relationship between proactive personality and functional performance. Results are presented with strong evidence that a high degree of personal and proactive between the coaches and athletes a significant impact decisively on OCB and job performance.

From the previous discussion, we can assume that there is a mediating influence of Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB) on the possible relationship between SHRM practices and the business competitive priorities. Therefore, we can formulate the forth hypothesis:

**H4**: Organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) mediates the relationship between SHRM practices and Business competitive priorities in Jordan Manufacturing Companies.

### h) Conceptual Framework Model

Based on the literature survey, we specify a conceptual framework model for the study described below:

![Conceptual Framework Model](image)

**Source**: Conceptual framework model developed by researcher depended on previous studies as shown in the table (1)

![Research Framework](image)

**Table 1**: Model References

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Variable</th>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Independence variables</td>
<td>(Al-AFef, 2018; Mandanat &amp; Khasawneh, 2018; Al-Shawabkeh, 2016; Abu doula, &amp; Obeidat, 2007)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mediating variables</td>
<td>(Al-Khasawneh, &amp; Shari, 2017; Runhaar et al., 2013)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dependent variables</td>
<td>(Idris, &amp; Naqshbandi, 2018; Adil, 2015; Jitpaiboon, 2014; Prabhu et al, 2020; Awwad et al. 2013; Santos, 2000)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### III. Research Methodology

#### a) Sampling Strategy and Data Collection

The target population of this study is determined and consisted of fifty-seven companies that are listed and licensed on the Amman Stock Exchange (ASE). A self-questionnaire was developed for data collection. Questionnaires are distributed randomly to workers at various administrative levels working in Jordanian manufacturing companies. The sampling technique used a simple random sampling technique, which can represent the population and ensure that every element in the community has an equal chance to be selected in the sample to increase efficiency, reduce cost, and effort. The sample size is (162) administrative employees such as (General Manager / Deputy General Manager, Director of Human Resources Department, Head of Human Resources Department, Production Manager, and Administration Officer). To enhance the response rate, the questionnaires are delivered and collected in person and by email. A cover letter has been attached explaining the aim and objectives of the research and a brief idea of the purpose of the study. A total of 224 questionnaires are distributed to administrative workers in industrial companies in Jordan, and 162 questionnaires are returned, indicating a response rate of 72.3%. It recommended that the feasible sample size be between 100 and 200, in order to be sufficient for data analysis (Bisharat et al. 2016).
b) Measures

A five-point Likert scale was used to express respondent's opinions with each element. The sample was asked to choose the level of their agreement that the answer ranging from strongly agree (5), to strongly disagree (1). The questionnaire consisted of two parts. The first one included personal and demographic characteristics. The second part of the questionnaire included a number of elements to measure research variables including SHRM practices, OCB, and business competitive priorities. For data collection, a questionnaire consists of 29 items was used, to measure OCB and 27 items to measure business competitive priorities.

The elements used were adopted by previous studies, a questionnaire was developed and changed by eight academic referees to ensure that each element measures what it intends to measure, and to avoid complexity and unclear in the formulation of the questions. This is explained below:

**SHRM Practices**: This study focused on five HRM practices commonly discussed in the literature including HR planning, recruitment, selection, training and development, compensation, and performance appraisal. The SHRM Practices questionnaire was adopted from Al-AFeef, 2018, Mandanat & Khasawneh, 2018; Abu doula, & Obeidat, 2007). Organizational citizenship behavior (OCB): represented by five dimensions that have been commonly identified in the literature were included in this study ((Altruism, Courtesy, Civic virtue, Sportsmanship, and Conscientiousness).

OCB questionnaire was adopted from (Al-Khasawneh, & Shari, 2017, Runhaar et al., 2013). Business competitive priorities: four dimensions were included in this study (cost, quality, delivery, and flexibility), the questionnaire was adopted from (Idris, & Naqshbandi, 2018, Adil, 2015, Jitpaiboon, 2014, Prabhu et al, 2020, Awwad et al 2013; Santos, 2000).

c) Data analysis

We adopted the descriptive and analytical method in conducting this study to check the impact of SHRM practices on the business competitive priorities of Jordanian manufacturing Companies through the organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) as Mediating Variable. Data were statistically analyzed using SPSS VR 23. Pearson Correlation was used to test the correlation between each dimension and its constructs. Multiple regression analysis was used to study the relationship between the independent variables and dependent variables. Hierarchical regression analysis path analysis was used to test the mediating impact of OCB on the relationship between SHRM practices and business competitive priorities. Barron and Kenny model followed (1986) to perform a mediation analysis.

d) Validity and Reliability

Questionnaire validity means to measure what was developed to measure it. The face and content validity of the study instrument was confirmed by presenting it to a number of assistant professors who are experts and professionals from different faculty members in business administration, public administration, economics, HRM, and operations management, the purpose questionnaire validly to ensure that all paragraphs of the study tool (questionnaire) are clear and also easy to understand by respondents. The required modifications were made to the questionnaire by modifying, deleting or adding paragraphs from it to achieve a balance between the contents of the questionnaire in its paragraphs to reach its final form.

**Reliability**: The purpose of the questionnaire reliability is to give this question the same result if it is redistributed more than once in the same circumstances. In order to ensure the Internal reliability of the study tool has been applied on the exploratory sample consisting of (50) persons, then Cronbach Alpha coefficient was calculated; table (2) shows that. Table (2): shows the result of reliability (Cronbach Alpha).

**Table 2**: The results of table (2) showing that all the alpha Cronbach coefficient values for all variables were higher than (0.7), which is a very acceptable ratio. Because it is higher than the acceptable ratio (0.7) (Pallant, 2010). Therefore, the reliability of internal consistency is high and can be used to achieve the objectives of the study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Domain</th>
<th>Cronbach Alpha</th>
<th>Item No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Human Resources Planning</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Employment (recruitment, selection, appointment)</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Training and development</td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Compensations: (and bonuses, wages, and incentives)</td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Performance evaluation</td>
<td>0.91</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>describes SHRM practices</td>
<td>0.97</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Altruism</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Courtesy</td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Civic virtue</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
e) **Multicollinearity test**

Multicollinearity test used to examine if there are high inter-correlations among the independent constructs within the structural model (inner model). In addition, it is also used to ensure the absence of a multi-linear problem, which inflates the standard deviations (square root of the variance) of the variables and makes the important tests (T-statistical tests) of these variables unreliable.

Table (3) shows that the value of the inflationary variance coefficient (VIF) for all independent variables is less than 10 and the Tolerance values are more than (0.05) according to Gujarati & Porter (2010). This is an indication of the absence of a high correlation between the independent variables; therefore there is no objection to including all variables within the multiple regression models. As a result, there is no problem with the research data, this indicates the validity of the model and the adoption of data for analysis based on the Multicollinearity test (Hair et al, 2011).

### Table 3: Result of the Variance Inflation Rate (VIF) and Tolerance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Independent variable</th>
<th>Tolerance</th>
<th>VIF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HR planning</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>2.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment and Selection</td>
<td>0.24</td>
<td>4.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compensation</td>
<td>0.29</td>
<td>3.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and Development</td>
<td>0.21</td>
<td>4.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performance appraisal</td>
<td>0.27</td>
<td>3.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Altruism</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>3.072</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courtesy</td>
<td>0.29</td>
<td>3.497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civic virtue</td>
<td>0.29</td>
<td>3.404</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sportsmanship</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>2.738</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conscientiousness</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>2.751</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### IV. Hypotheses test and Study Findings

a) **The first hypothesis and sub-hypotheses**

Multiple regression analysis was used to test H1, and to detect the impact of SHRM practices on the business competitive priorities in Jordanian manufacturing companies, table (4) showing that:

Table (4) shows that the total correlation (R) equals (0.767), which indicates a strong relationship between SHRM practices and business competitive priorities. The coefficient of determination (R square) is (0.588) which indicates that SHRM practices (the independent variable) explains 58.8% of any change in business competitive priorities (dependent variable), where "f" value reached (97.603) by statistically significant (0.000). Thus, the first research hypothesis was accepted as there is a positive impact of SHRM practices on business competitive priorities at a significant level (α≤0.05). H1 was supported.

Simple linear Regression were used to test sub-hypotheses (H1-H5), table (5) showing that:
The positive impact of training and development on business competitive priorities was supported. The coefficient of determination (R square) is 0.478 which indicates that training and development explains 47.8% of any change in business competitive priorities at a significant level (p<0.05). H1-3 was supported. Table (5) shows that the correlation (R) equals 0.429 which indicates that training and development explains 50.7% of any change in business competitive priorities at a significant level (p<0.05). H1-2 was supported. Table (5) shows that the correlation (R) equals 0.655 which indicates a strong relationship between recruitment and selection and business competitive priorities. The coefficient of determination (R square) is 0.427 which indicates that training and development explains 42.7% of any change in business competitive priorities, where “f” value reached (119.356) by statistically significant (0.000). Thus, the H1-4 was supported as there is a positive impact of training and development on business competitive priorities at a significant level (p<0.05). H1-5 was supported. Table (5) shows that the correlation (R) equals 0.654 which indicates a strong relationship between compensations and business competitive priorities. The coefficient of determination (R square) is 0.478 which indicates that training and development explains 47.8% of any change in business competitive priorities, where “f” value reached (146.302) by statistically significant (0.000). Thus, the H1-5 was accepted as there is a positive impact of training and development on business competitive priorities at a significant level (p<0.05). H1-5 was supported.

b) The second hypothesis and sub-hypotheses

Multiple regression analysis was used to test this hypothesis, and to detect the impact of SHRM practices on the OCB in Jordanian manufacturing companies, table (6) showing that

Table 6: Result of the (Multiple Regressions) to detect the impact of SHRM practices on the Organizational Citizenship Behaviour in Jordan Manufacturing Companies (n= 162)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Independent variable</th>
<th>“f” value</th>
<th>“f” sig</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R²</th>
<th>“f” value</th>
<th>“f” sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HR planning</td>
<td>1.771</td>
<td>0.079</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment and Selection</td>
<td>0.097</td>
<td>0.923</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compensation</td>
<td>1.939</td>
<td>0.054</td>
<td>0.736</td>
<td>0.541</td>
<td>36.775</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and Development</td>
<td>0.521</td>
<td>0.603</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performance appraisal</td>
<td>3.989</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Dependent variable: Organizational Citizenship Behaviour.

Table (6) shows that the total correlation (R) equals 0.736, which indicates a strong relationship between SHRM practices and OCB. The coefficient of determination (R square) is 0.541 which indicates that SHRM practices (the independent variable) explains 54.1% of any change in OCB (dependent variable). Where “f” value reached (36.775) by statistically significant (0.000). Thus, the H2 was accepted as there...
is a positive impact of SHRM practices on OCB at a significant level ($\alpha \leq 0.05$). H2 was supported.

Simple linear Regression was used to test this hypothesis, and to detect the impact of HR planning on OCB in Jordanian manufacturing companies, table (6) showing that:

**Table 7:** Result of the (Simple Linear Regressions) used to test sub-hypotheses (H1-H5) for H2, (n= 162)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Independent variable</th>
<th>$t$ value</th>
<th>$t$ sig</th>
<th>$R$</th>
<th>$R^2$</th>
<th>$F$ value</th>
<th>$F$ sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HR planning</td>
<td>9.026</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.581</td>
<td>0.337</td>
<td>81.465</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment and selection</td>
<td>9.940</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.618</td>
<td>0.382</td>
<td>98.813</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and development</td>
<td>10.730</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.647</td>
<td>0.418</td>
<td>115.136</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compensation</td>
<td>12.105</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.691</td>
<td>0.478</td>
<td>146.535</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Dependent variable: Organizational Citizenship Behavior

Table (7) shows that the correlation (R) equals (0.581), which indicates a strong relationship between HR planning and OCB. The coefficient of determination (R square) is (0.337) which indicates that HR planning explains 33.7% of any change in OCB, where $t$ value reached (81.465) by statistically significant (0.000). Thus, the H2-1 was accepted as there is a positive impact of HR planning on OCB at a significant level ($\alpha \leq 0.05$). H2-1 was supported.

**Table 8:** Result of the (Multiple Regressions) to detect the impact of OCB on business competitive priorities in Jordan Manufacturing Companies (n= 162)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Independent variable</th>
<th>$t$ value</th>
<th>$t$ sig</th>
<th>Beta</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>$R^2$</th>
<th>$F$ value</th>
<th>$F$ sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Altruism</td>
<td>1.657</td>
<td>0.100</td>
<td>0.132</td>
<td>0.823</td>
<td>0.678</td>
<td>65.711</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courtesy</td>
<td>2.713</td>
<td>0.007</td>
<td>0.230</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civic virtue</td>
<td>2.606</td>
<td>0.010</td>
<td>0.218</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sportsmanship</td>
<td>1.144</td>
<td>0.254</td>
<td>0.086</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conscientiousness</td>
<td>3.449</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>0.260</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Dependent variable: Business competitive priorities

Table (8) shows that the total correlation (R) equals (0.823), which indicates a strong relationship between OCB and business competitive priorities. The coefficient of determination (R square) is (0.678) which...
indicates that OCB explains 67.8% of any change in OCB, where "f" value reached (65.711) by statistically significant (0.000). Thus, the H3 was accepted as there is a positive impact of OCB on the business competitive priorities at a significant level (α≤0.05). H3 was supported.

d) The fourth hypothesis
Regression analysis path analysis was used to test the mediating impact of OCB on the relationship between SHRM practices and business competitive priorities. Barron and Kenny model followed (1986) to perform a mediation analysis, table (8) show that:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Independent variable</th>
<th>Dependent variable</th>
<th>Beta</th>
<th>&quot;F&quot; sig</th>
<th>&quot;t&quot; value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SHRM practices-</td>
<td>BCP</td>
<td>0.750</td>
<td>205.293</td>
<td>000*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHRM practices-</td>
<td>OCB</td>
<td>0.722</td>
<td>174.296</td>
<td>000*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCB</td>
<td>BCP</td>
<td>0.821</td>
<td>329.758</td>
<td>000*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHRM practices + OCB</td>
<td>BCP</td>
<td>0.583</td>
<td>209.507</td>
<td>000*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9 shows the series of regression equations to find out the mediation test on OCB. This test was run according to the instructions of Barron and Kenny (1986). The first equation shows the regression between Independent (SHRM practices in BCP). The second equation is the result of regression between Independent (SHRM practices in OCB). And in the third, Independent (OCB in BCP). And the final equation both (SHRM practices and OCB in BCP) and mediation variable (OCB) were used as independent variables. The values of the table (9) also fulfill all the conditions for mediation. Figure (2) showing that:

After the mediator variable was added the (β) value impact of the independent variable was dropped from 0.750 to 0.583, and is still significant but not complete. which means that the OCB is partially mediated impact between SHRM practices and Business competitive priorities in Jordanian Manufacturing Firms. This indicating the mediating influence of OCB is helpful in the positive impact of SHRM practices on business competitive priorities in Jordan Manufacturing Companies. H4 was supported.

Figure 2: Clearly illustrates the impact of the mediating variable on the relationship between the independent variable on the dependent

V. Discussion and Conclusion

This study was aimed to shed new light on strategic human resource management (SHRM) by examining the impact of SHRM practices on Business competitive priorities through testing the organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) as a mediating variable in Jordanian Manufacturing Companies. The results of the study indicated that there is a statistically significant impact of SHRM practices (HRP, recruitment and selection, compensation, training and development, and performance appraisal) on business competitive priorities in Jordanian manufacturing companies. The results of the current study matched with the study of
Adil (2015) the study found out the HRM practices (recruitment & selection, performance appraisal, training and development, compensation and rewards, employment security, job description, career opportunities, decentralization, and empowerment) have a strong impact on four competitive priorities (cost, quality, delivery, and flexibility) of the manufacturing in Karachi. In contrast, the results of the study (Vivares-Vergara, et al., 2016) contradict the present study. The results of the study also showed that there is no significant relationship between HRM practices and the performance of competitive priorities. The researcher interprets this result for the difference in the population and sample of the study and the time and place in which the study was conducted. The findings of the study tests also indicated that there is a statistically significant impact of SHRM practices (HRP, recruitment and selection, compensation, training and development, performance evaluation) on the organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) in Jordanian manufacturing companies. These results are consistent with several studies indicating a positive relationship between SHRM practices and OCB (Chaisanit, & Punyasiri, 2020; Tinti, et al., 2017; Nikoletta & Nawangsari, 2019; Guest et al., 2004; Zhang et al., 2008) The results of these studies revealed that HRM practices positively affect organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) and that there is a strong relationship between them. In contrast, the results of the present study are contradicted with a study by Watty-Benjamin, & Udechukwu, (2014) the results of this study revealed that HRM practices did not predict OCB and intentions to leave. The researcher interprets this result for the different study population, sample, place and time that was conducted in the study. These results are in agreement with the results of the study (Harsasi & Muzammil, 2017), which showed that increasing good HRM practices and organizational commitment leads to an increase in OCB that can lead to an increase in the performance of the organization as a whole. But the results of the current study differed with the results of the study (Thamarat, 2017), which showed that not all HRM practices affect employee OCB and employee turnover intentions.

The results of the study tests also revealed that there is a statistically significant impact of organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) on the business competitive priorities in Jordanian manufacturing companies. The results of the current study matched the results of the study that conducted by Ranjan & Millick (2018). The study results indicated a positive correlation between OCB and competitive advantage which is largely supervised by HR practices. Basically, organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) has been linked to overall organizational performance and effectiveness, so the types of employee behaviors are important for competing among competitors and achieving an edge in the business. Nevertheless, the dimensions of OCB (altruism, conscientiousness, sportsmanship, courtesy, and civic virtue), are the most important factors for achieving the goals of the organization and developing its competitive advantage. In addition, The results of the current study are identical to the results of the studies (kumar, & Thapliyal, 2017; Castro, et. al. 2004 Turnipseed, and Rassuli, 2005) They discovered that OCB is one of the most influencing factors affecting organizational effectiveness. Additionally, these studies indicated that altruism, sportsmanship, conscientiousness, courtesy and civic virtues are positively and significantly related to organizational effectiveness. In addition, the results of the current study are corresponding to the results of the study of Babai et al., (2017). This study found that OCB had a significant effect on job performance. The results of the current study are matching to the results of the studies of (Chelagat, et al., 2015; Mallick, et al; 2014).

The study found that OCB is a major factor in improving employee performance. They revealed also that OCB has a significant relationship with functional performance with different dimensions of OCB. The results of the study tests also revealed that organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) is a partially mediating the relationship between SHRM practices and Business competitive priorities in Jordan Manufacturing Companies. The results of the current study are in absolute conformity with the results of the study of Babai et al., (2012) whereas, this Study found that organizational citizenship behavior (OCB) fully mediated the relationship between reward practices and quality services and partially mediated the relationships between performance appraisal practices and service quality. However, the results of the present study are in aligning with the results of the study of by Dizgah, et al., (2011). This study also found organizational citizenship behavior and procedural justices are mediating between high-performance HR practices (job design, participation, employment, mobility, job security, and performance evaluation) and corporate entrepreneurship. However, each of the six dimensions of HR practices (job design, engagement, recruitment, mobility, job security, and evaluation) is closely and positively related to corporate entrepreneurship. Besides that, match the results of the current study with the study of Sree Lakshmi, (2016). Whereas, the study revealed that OCB partially mediated the relationship between empowerment and perceived organizational performance. The current study is consistent with a study conducted by Sun et al. (2007). Showed that the role for OCB has partially mediating effects high working HR practices on performance. In addition, the current study is similar with a study conducted by lam et al., (2009). Showed that OCB mediates the effects of retention-oriented compensation and formalized training on employees the intention to leave. Furthermore, the current study is consistent with a study conducted by
Hsiao & Wang (2020). They found that OCB mediated the relationship between proactive personality and functional performance. The researcher interprets this result for the role that the organizational citizenship behavior plays as a mediating variable in supporting the relationship between SHRM practices and business competitive priorities in Jordanian manufacturing firms. However, This indicating the mediating variable influence of OCB is helpful in amplifying the positive impact of SHRM practices on business competitive priorities in Jordan Manufacturing Companies. Whereas, the various dimensions of OCB such as altruism, conscience, civic virtue, courtesy, and sportsmanship are influenced by SHRM practices that lead to improved business competitive priorities. According to Ranjhan, S., & Mallick, E. (2018) the OCB resulting from the interaction relationships has an important influence on the competitive advantage of the firm. Because OCB is an expression of the intangible behaviors of a network of relationships where it is difficult to imitate relationship networks over time. Making it more resistant to corrosion through competition. Without a doubt, OCB supports the relationship between SHRM practices and business competitive priorities.

In sum, the results of this study concluded that SHRM practices play a critical role in enhancing employee OCB and business competitive priorities alike. Therefore, to improve business competitive priorities in manufacturing firms, managers must improve SHRM practices that have an impact on OCB and which in turn influence business competitive priorities. In addition, Manufacturing Firms must continually strive to improve strategic HRM practices in an effort to ensure their continuity, gain a competitive advantage, and increase their profitability and productivity.

VI. Recommendations of the Study

In light of the findings the researcher suggested a number of the following recommendations:

1. The researcher recommends the necessity of continuing to develop strategic HRM practices (HR planning, recruitment and selection, compensation, training and development, and performance evaluation) in Jordanian manufacturing companies to keep up with the challenges of dynamic competitive business environments.

2. The necessity for Jordanian manufacturing companies to adhere to strategic planning for HR, in terms of quantity and quality, through integration and alignment of HR plans with operational strategic goals.

3. Given the importance to the recruitment and selection practice, the researcher suggests that Jordanian manufacturing companies should pay attention to the practice of recruitment and selection by attracting the qualified talents and competent to achieve the company's competitive advantage that's reflected in its performance.

4. The researcher recommends that Jordanian manufacturing companies to pay attention to develop the practice of training and development continuously by providing the most recent advanced training programs that benefit the organization, and employing the best technological methods in the training process.

5. The researcher recommends that Jordanian manufacturing companies should adopt organizational citizenship behaviors that must be adopted to maintain OCB among the organization’s employees, as it has a major role in maintaining competitive advantage strategies.

6. HR managers and practitioners should focus more on positive employee behaviors in their companies. Since intangible organizational resources are important to be carefully managed, they create a sustainable competitive advantage over time.

7. Managers of Jordanian manufacturing companies must align strategic HRM practices with business strategies for competitive priorities, relying on reducing costs, continuously improving product quality, fast delivery, and flexibility in production processes.

8. The researcher recommends the Jordanian manufacturing companies to continue using the business competitive priorities as a tool or strategies to gain competitive advantage and maintain its strategic position in the market.

9. The researcher recommends that Jordanian manufacturing companies work to reduce total production costs through the use of modern technical methods that are able to reduce costs and save effort and time for workers, as long as it does not affect the quality of the product.

10. The researcher recommends that managers of Jordanian manufacturing companies maintain their reputation in the market by increasing the speed of delivery and the necessity to adhere to delivery dates on time by training workers on training programs that develop their capabilities through the use of modern technological tools.

11. The researcher recommends that the Jordanian manufacturing companies pay attention to the quality of the product so that the products conform to the specifications and standards, are guaranteed high performance, and are distinguished by durability, reliability, and long-lasting.

Research Limitations and Areas for Future Research

Despite the keen interest that was taken in the development and implementation of the present study. However, it is not without some limitations that offer promising areas for future research.
Firstly, this study was conducted on the manufacturing sector. Therefore, caution should be exercised in generalizing these results to other sectors. That’s why, we recommend that researchers conduct studies in other sectors in order to increase the reliability of the results to be generalizable.

Secondly, the study sample was restricted to the Jordanian manufacturing companies listed in the Amman Financial Market, which form part of the manufacturing sector as a whole. Therefore, the study sample was limited and its members were characterized by cultural homogeneity. Therefore, we suggest applying this study to a larger sample or conducting comparative studies between different geographical areas.

Third, the study was limited to examining five HRM practices and their impact on four business competitive priorities through organizational citizenship behavior as mediating variable. Therefore, we recommend that future research be directed to conducting a study of new dimensions of HRM practices and new dimensions of competitive priorities. Future research on the business competitive priorities in the academic environment through strategic HRM practices should include other constructs, like innovation and customer focus, which will expand literature on business competitive priorities studies in an academic environment.

References Références Referencias


76. Organizational citizenship behavior as mediator. Palgrave Commun, 6 (33). 1-8

77. Organizational citizenship behaviors. The Service Industries Journal, 32(8), 1209–1227.


Balanced Scorecard Perspectives and Institutional Performance of Private Tertiary Institutions

By Francis Osei-Kuffour

Valley View University

Abstract - Business managers around the globe have tested the effectiveness of the Balanced Scorecard (BSC) model since its inception in the early 90s in their bid to enhance business performance to achieve financial sustainability and transform developments in their economies. Other sectors of world economies have tried to emulate the BSC concept to achieve institutional goals for financial freedom. Research on the investigation of the replicability of the BSC model and its effectiveness in addressing the continued financial sustainability challenges of educational institutions, especially the private ones, is scarce. This study aimed to increase awareness of the influence of BSC application in addressing financial performance challenges besetting the private educational sector.

Keywords: balanced scorecard, financial performance, learning and growth, internal business processes, customers.

GJMBR-A Classification: JEL Code: J62, M00

© 2021. Francis Osei-Kuffour. This research review article is distributed under the terms of the Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0). You must give appropriate credit to authors and reference this article if parts of the article are reproduced in any manner. Applicable licensing terms are at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/.
Balanced Scorecard Perspectives and Institutional Performance of Private Tertiary Institutions

Francis Osei-Kuffour

Abstract: Business managers around the globe have tested the effectiveness of the Balanced Scorecard (BSC) model since its inception in the early 90s in their bid to enhance business performance to achieve financial sustainability and transform developments in their economies. Other sectors of world economies have tried to emulate the BSC concept to achieve institutional goals for financial freedom. Research on the investigation of the replicability of the BSC model and its effectiveness in addressing the continued financial sustainability challenges of educational institutions, especially the private ones, is scarce. This study aimed to increase awareness of the influence of BSC application in addressing financial performance challenges besetting the private educational sector. This descriptive-correlational study examined the relationship between BSC perspectives and institutional financial performance of private tertiary institutions. Forty-five out of the 77 private tertiary institutions in the Greater Accra, Ashanti, Central, and Western Regions of Ghana were randomly sampled to answer a self-constructed survey. Descriptive statistics, based on the central tendency with SPSS and Regression Process v3.2 by Hayes model, were used to analyze the data. The extent of BSC application in private tertiary institutions’ performance reviews was small. The study also revealed low levels of financial performance indicators. The study, however, revealed a moderate, positive significant relationship between BSC perspectives and institutional financial performance. The study recommends that private tertiary institutions should, as part of their strategic evaluation, review institutional performance based on BSC perspectives to enhance financial performance for sustainability and development in the new normal.

Keywords: balanced scorecard, financial performance, learning and growth, internal business processes, customers.

1. Introduction

Governing Councils and Boards of Trustees of private educational institutions meet either annually, bi-annually, or quinquennium, to strategically plan on how their institutions will progress into the future in today’s competitive environment as they strive to restructure and reform their institutions to provide quality education in training fruitful members of society.

The visions and strategies for quality service provision, growth, and sustainability are communicated to the workforce through management, the drivers of the strategic planning process. Management is expected to devise tactics to achieve the long-term objectives of stakeholders as expectations are relayed down to the operational managers and the workforce for implementation (The Institute of Chartered Accountants, Ghana [ICAG], 2015).

Fiduciary duties of managers require that outcomes of tactics adopted for achieving short to medium-term and long-term objectives of institutions are reviewed, based on the financial and non-financial matrix, and made known to governing bodies for assessment of management’s stewardship and long-term institutional survival (Malgwi & Dahiru, 2014). Such strategic evaluative processes seemed absent in educational institutions, especially the private ones. This phenomenon places limitations in assessing institutions’ financial and non-financial performance, which partly accounts for the continued reverberation of financial sustainability challenges of private educational institutions (Mugo & Ngahu, 2015; Addo, 2018; Afful, 2019; Ferdinand, 2020; Molele & Tefu, 2020).

Strategic performance assessment by management to reduce financial sustainability challenges is one of the critical areas in institutional operations. In recent times, the urge to improve performance measurement of not-for-profit institutions has increased for several reasons, among which management decision-making and the institution’s going concern and external credibility are the most important (Vu, 2018).

Educational institutions in the private sector form part of the most dynamic and fast-growing ventures in world economies because they have made significant impacts on the world’s socio-economic development over the years. They make considerable contributions to the provision of quality educational services to the population (Kharusi & Murthy, 2017; Yanka, 2017). It is, therefore, imperative that researchers investigate and recommend all possible intervention mechanisms for the long-term survival of private sector educational institutions.

Various studies have looked at the review and adoption of the balanced scorecard framework in higher educational institutions (Aljardali et al., 2012; Al-Hosaini & Sofian, 2015; Bissessar, 2017; Aboajela & Amar,
Gündüzalp & Arabacı, 2017; Vu, 2018; Camilleri, 2021). However, none of the studies considered the replicability of the balanced scorecard framework and its influence on the financial performance of private tertiary institutions.

The study sought to address this research gap by ascertaining the extent of the balanced scorecard model application in performance measurement and its relationship with financial performance in private tertiary institutions. The results of the study focused on a national and international audience of educational institutions, especially the private ones, who seek innovative means of facing new challenges in order to improve the quality of education whiles sustaining their institutions for long-term survival.

The crust of this study was to help address the financial sustainability challenges of private educational institutions by increasing awareness of the relationship which exists between the balanced scorecard perspectives and financial performance. Consequently, this study sought to address the following questions:

1. What is the extent of balanced scorecard model replicability in private tertiary institutions?
2. Is there a significant relationship between balanced scorecard perspectives and the financial performance of private tertiary institutions?

The null hypothesis of this study is:

1. There is no significant relationship between balanced scorecard perspectives and the financial performance of private tertiary institutions.

Given the ever-expanding technical, regulatory, and competitive climate, Gupta and Sharma (2017) alluded that managers are supposed to achieve financial as well as non-financial goals in their bid to satisfy multiple stakeholders and stay financially sustainable. The researchers further asserted that, as a result of the tangible and intangible expectations of stakeholders, current performance measurement had been the balanced scorecard approach developed by Kaplan and Norton in 1991.

Robert S. Kaplan and David Norton’s work appeared in their seminal article published in the Harvard Business Review. Chapter two of their conceptual framework book: ‘A Conceptual Framework of Balanced Scorecard Approach’ asserted that the evolution of the balanced scorecard idea began with the conviction that managers ought to measure more than financial results to stay sustainable, and proposed a matrix with four types of measures: financial, internal processes, learning and growth, and customer (Kaplan & Norton, 2010).

According to the authors, the balanced scorecard model expects institutional managers to view performance measurement as a set of a cause-and-effect relationship between the four balanced scorecard perspectives, as shown in Figure 1. The model is also seen as a strategic planning and management system that takes into account non-financial aspects of institutional performance, such as customer satisfaction and business processes, to create a picture of how the company is likely to perform going forward (Gupta & Sharma, 2017).
Kaplan and Norton (as cited in Gupta & Sharma, 2017; Farokhi et al., 2018; Dudic et al., 2020) asserted that the strategic ties between the balanced scorecard perspectives enable managers to use ‘if-then’ sensitivity analysis to assess their approach to institutional management. The aim is to provide continuous progress in each of the three non-financial perspectives, which are tracked to determine if they eventually translate into sustainable financial results. Accordingly, the balanced scorecard perspectives tell institutions the knowledge, skills, and systems that employees will need (Learning & Growth) to innovate and build the right strategic capabilities and efficient processes (Internal Business Process), which deliver specific value to customers and eventually lead to positive financial performance for sustainability.

Figure 1 pictures that the learning and growth outcomes (lowest level in the hierarchy) lead to improved internal business processes and procedures (second level), which in turn improves the value proposition offered to customers (third level) and finally culminate into financial performance, considered to be the highest level, for sustainability. The balanced scorecard transforms the mission and strategy of an institution into a full set of performance evaluative actions (Farokhi et al., 2018) because the model enables an institution to recognize its benefits, as well as its shortcomings, and thus strengthen its operations (Dudic et al., 2020).

II. Learning and Growth Perspective

The learning and growth perspective seeks to build institutional capacity by improving knowledge, skills, and technology. Theories of learning and growth hold that learning and growth within an institution drive the success of institutional processes and customer satisfaction that leads to financial stability (Oracle & Affiliates, 2013). In this perspective, Kaplan and Norton asserted that institutions measure their ability to provide the employee capacity and skills, along with the technology and institutional climate, necessary to support institutional strategy. Strategic efforts to increase the skills and knowledge of employees enable institutions to make higher investments, which are required to achieve the desired strategic skill coverage ratio to attract and retain competent employees who enhance institutional internal and external branding.

The learning and growth perspective deals with the building up of a mechanism to fill gaps in knowledge, processes, information system, and
institutional culture and to be continually innovative (Gupta & Sharma, 2017). According to the authors, these attributes are expected to, all things being equal, lead to smooth running of an organization because the perspective works at the ability of employees and quality of information. The learning and growth perspective identifies sets of skills and processes that drive educational institutions to continuously improve their critical internal processes (Vu, 2018).

The learning and growth perspective places emphasis on the investment in employees who are responsible for critical internal processes to achieve organizational set targets because if institutions take care of their employees, employees will, in turn, take care of customers (Al-Hosaini & Sofian, 2015; Bissessar, 2017). The learning and growth perspective is argued to facilitate the performance of the other three perspectives (Camilleri, 2021).

Mair (2016) placed the learning and growth perspective into human capital, information capital, and organizational capital. Sarkin (2016) added that these categorizations deal with employee capabilities (core competencies and skills), information systems capabilities and strategy awareness, involvement, and motivation, which form the bottom foundation of institutional strategy and show how intangible assets determine the performance of the critical internal processes for financial performance.

III. Internal Business Processes Perspective

This perspective seeks to improve process efficiency for operational excellence and lower cycle time. Internal business processes revolve around the efficiency and effectiveness of an institution’s operations (Gupta & Sharma, 2017). The internal business processes perspective encompasses key business processes that institutions have to perform well in order to deliver customer value and satisfaction to take care of customers (Al-Hosaini & Sofian, 2015; Bissessar, 2017). According to Kaplan and Norton, a key process described in the balanced scorecard model is innovation, which enables empowerment through learning and growth for an efficient internal business process (Al-Hosaini & Sofian, 2015; Bissessar, 2017).

Efficient internal business processes enhance academic branding and urge-up enrollment because it strengthens strategy that broadens marketing’s application in the education sector by identifying institutional unique competitive advantages that differentiate one institution from another and builds relationships with current and prospective stakeholders in the long term (Manea & Purcaru, 2017; Bissessar, 2017; Aboajela & Amar, 2017; Camilleri, 2021). This assertion implies that increased brand awareness and customer loyalty as a result of efficient service provision increase brand association and demand for products and services with a resultant growth in revenue for financial performance.

Gordon et al. (2016) believed that brand association stems from brand image composed of sets of memories regarding the brand in customers’ minds. Mondkar (2017) added that brand image is the total impression formed in customers’ minds from the features of an institutional behavior and processes. Vazifehdoost and Negahdari (2018) considered brand association as the strength of a customers’ positive outlook towards a brand in terms of emotional bond and long-term attachment, which are unearthed through efficient and innovative processes for customer satisfaction.

IV. Customer Perspective

The customer perspective seeks to improve customer acquisition and retention. Customer services are based on identifying and satisfying customer needs and exceeding customer expectations, and measure value propositions that an institutional strategy has identified for targeted customer groups because customer focus and satisfaction form integral parts in the key objectives of any institution (Gupta & Sharma, 2017; Camilleri, 2021).

The customer perspective involves how institutions need to consider customers in order to succeed and achieve institutional mission. A critical consideration of customers begins with employee empowerment through learning and growth for an efficient internal business process (Al-Hosaini & Sofian, 2015; Bissessar, 2017).

V. Financial Perspective

The financial perspective seeks to lower cost and increase revenue, a measure of financial performance for sustainability. The theory of financial perspective acts as a focal point or culmination of all the objectives and measures in the other perspectives (Gupta & Sharma, 2017). The financial perspective reflects the degree of success of the other balanced scorecard perspectives in achieving institutional strategic objectives, placing it at the highest level in the hierarchy of balanced scorecard perspectives because decisions made under the other perspectives will ultimately culminate in financial results. This is usually actualized through the provisions of institutions’ mission and vision statements and their transformation into financial performance (Aboajela & Amar, 2017). The cause and effect trend can be seen through the financial index, irrespective of whether they are: tangible or intangible.

Financial performance measures an institution’s financial health over a period of time as a result of management initiatives used to generate revenue to
achieve and fulfill their fiduciary duties (Naz et al., 2016). Profitability, revenue, and capital, and financial resource utilization are all indicators of an institution’s financial performance (Matar & Eneizan, 2018). According to Mugambi (2016), the financial health of an institution illustrates whether it will be able to perform its duties and meet the needs of its stakeholders over time, calculated by the measurement of revenue surplus over expenditure, the availability of cash to cater for expenses and the comparison of institutional assets and liabilities.

Financial performance is a measure of what an institution has accomplished over a period of time which shows favorable conditions obtained from useful data about fund flow, usage, effectiveness, and performance (Dragusin et al., 2016; Batchimeg, 2017). The study measures financial performance using institutional self-sufficiency, which considered liquidity, financial leverage, and debt service coverage of private tertiary institutions.

Liquidity looks at the extent to which liabilities being matured in the next year can be repaid from quick assets. It can be measured by calculating the ratio between current assets to current liabilities (Cernostana, 2017; Kharusi & Murthy, 2017). Financial leverage considers the extent to which an institution utilizes its borrowed funds. It is measured by the ratio of total debt to equity. Institutions that are more leveraged are likely to face negative results as there is the risk of default in case the institution is unable to meet its obligations (ICAG, 2015).

The debt service coverage ratio, which divides an institution’s earnings before interest and taxes by interest expenses, indicates an institution’s ability to generate enough cash to pay its interest expenses on outstanding debts (Wijewardana & Munasinghe, 2015). One of the pillars of financial sustainability, according to Leon (2001), is effective management with strategic planning that measures the total financial performance of an institution, which determines the sturdy state of institutions’ financial success.

Institutions’ ability to create and earn operating revenue to meet the cost of current operations as well as future commitments without impairments in future activities to enhance survival and growth as a result of the ability to evaluate financial and non-financial performance promotes institutional survival (Esampally & Joshi, 2016; Beg, 2016; Wachira, 2018).

VI. Replication of Balanced Scorecard in Private Tertiary Institutions

Readings on the balanced scorecard model from previous studies show that there are scanty existing literature in exploring its applicability in operations of private tertiary institutions. The BSC model has widely been adopted and replicated in the corporate business world for improved performance, and thousands of other enterprises were projected to use the model by 2017 (Kaplan & Norton, 2010). Other not-for-profit organizations have also replicated the model to enhance performance through efficient provision of services (Bisbe & Barrubes, 2016).

Private educational institutions’ service provision may not be motivated solely for profitability but are expected to, at least, break even and continue in business for the good of their owners and society (Oketch et al., 2010). As a result, private tertiary institutions have adopted educational strategies that broaden marketing applications by identifying unique competitive advantages that differentiate one institution from another as a result of enrollment crisis and build relationships with current and prospective stakeholders in the long term (Manea & Purcaru, 2017).

According to Rohn (as cited in Aljardali et al., 2012), the vision and mission of these institutions focus mainly on stakeholder satisfaction through the provision of clear structures for continuous quality improvement, the establishment of a culture of academic quality, evaluation of efficient use of resources for academic programs, documentation of contribution of activities towards the institutional mission, promotion of academic excellence, and determination of priorities on future planning and survival, among others.

 Provision of quality services to students is a key ingredient in attracting and retaining students, for decreasing trends in enrollment are equivalent to operating deficits, especially at tuition-dependent educational institutions (Pavlov & Katsamakas, 2019). The provision of quality services leads to excellence in business education as it deals with customers’ perceptions about the supremacy of an institution’s services as compared to others within similar categories or close substitutes. Educational institution’s failure to satisfy students as a result of process inefficiencies impact negatively on students’ recruitment, retention, and ultimately, the financial performance of private tertiary institutions (Narteh, 2018).

Sudirman (2012) demonstrated how the balanced scorecard could well be implemented in Hasanuddin University of Indonesia. The author placed organizational structure, policy, systems and procedures, staff performance, infrastructure, and facilities under the learning and growth perspective, whereas academic atmosphere, good governance, social responsibility, learning process, and research came under internal business processes. The study further placed learning quality, learning accessibility, and mutual benefit under customer perspective, whereas funding from grants, government, and society was placed under the financial perspective. The study concluded that the proposed BSC approach would help Hasanuddin University to translate its vision, mission,
and strategies into series of measurement indicators for enhanced financial performance for sustainability.

In a study that sought to replicate the balanced scorecard in Trinidadian higher education, Bissessar (2017) placed measures such as student satisfaction survey, a culture of care, number and rate of staff publications, a culture of students as life-long learners, and mentor for new staff under customer perspective whiles value creation, meeting established standards, global networking, and sharing were placed under the internal business processes perspective. Under the learning and growth perspective, the study placed staff satisfaction, budget spent on teacher professional development, most improved worker, and creation of professional communities/collaboration. Cost efficiency and productivity and beneficial use of tangible and intangible resources were, however, placed under the financial perspective. The study concluded that the adoption of the balanced scorecard model is expected to increase revenues and surpluses that can be ploughed into Trinidadian higher education institutions for further growth and development.

Aljardali et al. (2012) looked at the adoption of the balanced scorecard in Lebanese public higher education institutions and proposed a model for the creation of a framework for performance measurement. In measuring customer perspective, the study placed students’ satisfaction survey, alumni evaluation, alumni satisfaction survey, and the number of alumni in public service. Meeting service standards, numbers of new services introduced, number of internships available, and number of departments in specialized areas were placed under the internal business processes perspective. Measurements under learning and growth included the number of faculty presentations, percentage of budget spent on staff development, number of courses incorporating new technologies, and number of curriculum reviews. Tuition fee comparison, year-end budget variance, and budget allocation to instruction were some of the measures that were placed under the financial perspective. The study called on Deans in Lebanese higher education institutions to begin the process of implementing a balanced scorecard to achieve performance for sustained operations.

Al-Hosaini and Sofian (2015) reviewed relevant perspectives of the balanced scorecard in the context of higher educational institutions. The study revealed that applicability of the balanced scorecard in higher educational institutions is possible and that the balanced scorecard perspectives are relevant for higher educational institutions. The study concluded that the model could be used to monitor educational institutions performance and enable them to adjust to emerging challenges that come as a result of implementing key strategies for long-term sustainability.

In a study that looked at applicability of balanced scorecard system in primary schools according to opinions of education inspectors, managers, and teachers at Elazığ Province- Turkey, Gündüzalp and Arabacı, (2017) sampled opinions of 110 managers, 340 teachers, and 20 inspectors and found that participants generally approve the implementation of the balanced scorecard in educational institutions because BSC improves school performance and development.

Aboajela and Amar (2017) used a quantitative approach to gather data from public universities and explored the acceptance, importance, and usefulness of the balanced scorecard as one of the performance measurement techniques in Libyan higher education. Results indicated that decision-makers in Libyan higher education institutions, moderately, use the balanced scorecard to evaluate institutional performance which was considered highly useful in enhancing the sustenance of their institutions.

Camilleri (2021) investigated the adoption of the balanced scorecard in the performance measurement appraisal system of higher education service providers within the Southern European countries. Purposive sampling was used to identify respondents who were academic members working in Southern European high education institutions with more than 10,000 students from 82 countries. The study found that performance reviews, based on the balanced scorecard, will help higher educational institutions’ leaders to identify institutional value-creating activities. The study concluded that higher education institutions’ leaders could utilize the BSC model as a reasonable performance measurement tool to evaluate institutional improvements in financial results, among other positive outcomes, for survival.

Al-mawali et al. (2010) studied balanced scorecard usage and financial performance of branches in the Jordanian banking industry and found that there is a positive relationship between balanced scorecard perspectives and financial performance.

Olasunkanmi and Asaolu (2019) studied balanced scorecard and private universities’ performance in South-Western, Nigeria, using three private universities in a descriptive survey design with 300 structured questionnaires and interviews. The study revealed that the balanced scorecard is suitable and that private universities have the capacity to implement the system for performance evaluation.

Based on the ongoing discussion, Figure 2 represents the conceptual framework of the proposed replication of the balanced scorecard model in the operations of private tertiary institutions. This study adopted the resource-based theory, which suggests that financial and non-financial resources constitute valuable and unique properties that are key to the success of an institution (Andrews et al., 2015). The
resource-based theory is relevant to this study given that it aids in understanding educational institutions’ unique internal characteristics to generate, manage and control institutional resources to provide unique services to society and survive.

VII. Methodology

a) Research Design

The study employed a descriptive correlational design and parametric inferential statistics to examine the relationship between balanced scorecard perspectives and financial performance.

b) Population and Sampling Technique

The study was conducted among 45 private tertiary institutions from four regions in Ghana. This sample was randomly selected from a population of 77 to answer a self-constructed questionnaire.
c) **Instrumentation**

The study used a standardized questionnaire as the tool for collecting data. The questionnaire used 4-point Likert Scale and Vagias (2006) response anchors. Expert validators evaluated the validity of the research instruments. Balanced scorecard perspectives yielded Cronbach alpha of 0.750. In determining the power of the association between the study variables, Cohen's (1998) absolute correlation values were used. In determining the strength of relationships among the study variables, Cohen (1998) absolute correlation values were used where $r = .10$ to $.29$ (small), $r = .30$ to $.49$ (moderate), and $r = .50$ to 1.0 (high).

d) **Analysis of Data**

MS-Excel and IBM Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) were used to analyze the descriptive statistics. The relationship between the balanced scorecard perspectives and financial performance was determined using Pearson Product-Moment Correlation.

e) **Ethical Consideration**

Ethical considerations were observed during the data collection exercise. Participants were assured that the survey would not collect identifying information, which makes them and their data anonymous and confidential.

VIII. **Results and Discussion**

The study aimed to assess the extent of balanced scorecard application in the operations of private tertiary institutions and the relationship between balanced scorecard perspectives and financial performance. The results are presented in this section. **The extent of balanced scorecard application**

The study ascertained from the respondents the extent of balanced scorecard application in the operations of private tertiary institutions. The findings, in terms of means and standard deviations, are as shown in Table 1. Respondents disagreed that managers of private tertiary institutions review performance based on balanced scorecard perspectives ($M= 2, SD= 0.63$), which was verbally interpreted as poor.

The results indicated that private tertiary institutions apply, to a small extent, the principles of the balanced scorecard in the review of institutional performances. The study assessed the financial health of private educational institutions. Liquidity ratio, Debt-to-Equity ratio, and debt servicing coverage ratio were calculated using five-year average financial statements extracts from respondents. Results of the calculated figures showed average percentage liquidity, debt-to-equity, and debt service

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Extent of Balanced Scorecard Application (N=45)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mean</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My institution invests in faculty and staff training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My institution carries out inter-faculty peer review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My institution reviews response rate of customers requests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My institution has a Quality Assurance Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My institution carry out students’ satisfaction surveys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My institution measures student’s satisfaction index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My institution reviews teaching cost per student on yearly basis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My institution allocates resources based on activity levels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My institution organizes Parent Consultative Forums</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My institution carry out alumni tracer studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Balanced Scorecard Perspectives</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend: 4 = Strongly Agree, 3 = Agree, 2 = Disagree, 1 = Strongly Disagree

The results imply that private tertiary institutions do not review their activities based on the balanced scorecard perspectives. The results confirm Sudirman, 2012, Aljdrali et al., 2012, and Al-Hosaini & Sofian, 2015 studies that educational institutions lag behind the adoption of the balanced scorecard in performance measurement processes.
coverage of 49, 75, and 34, respectively. These results indicated that private tertiary institutions could meet less than half of their current obligations, have three units of debt for every unit of equity, and had only enough cash to cover 34 percent of annual debts payment, respectively. Liquidity and debt service coverage ratio results were lower than average percentage figures of 60 and 100, respectively. The financial leverage result was higher than recommended average percentage of 45 (Cernostatna, 2017; Lattz, 2017).

The relationship between balanced scorecard perspectives and financial performance was investigated using the Pearson Correlation Coefficient. The findings are as shown in Table 2. Results showed a statistically moderate, significant positive relationship between the variables, \( r = 0.412, n = 45, p = 0.005 \). The results imply that the better the review of performance based on balanced scorecard perspectives, the better the financial performance.

### Table 2: Relationship between Balanced Scorecard Perspectives and Financial Performance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Balanced Scorecard Perspectives</th>
<th>Pearson Correlation</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>.412</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.005</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The study, therefore, rejects the null hypothesis that there is no significant relationship between balanced scorecard perspectives and financial performance. Results support Al-mawali et al. (2010) study, which found a positive relationship between balanced scorecard perspectives and institutional financial performance.

The core of this study was to examine the replicability and the influence of the balanced scorecard perspectives on the financial performance of private tertiary institutions. The data collected and analyzed revealed that private tertiary institutions do not review operational performance based on balance scorecard perspectives. Financial performance measures were below recommended averages. The study, however, found a moderate, positive significant relationship between balanced scorecard perspectives and financial performance.

Favorable financial performance for sustainability is vital to all businesses including, private tertiary institutions. The study, therefore, recommends the replicability of the balanced scorecard model in private tertiary institutions’ performance review processes. The causal relationships among the perspectives encourage feedback loops which guide strategic planning processes for continuous operations.

The study again recommends training and getting management commitment of private tertiary institutions’ managers and employees. A clear understanding of concepts and meanings are rudimentary requirements in the successful implementation of any new concept. Training leaders and employees on the applicability of the balanced scorecard perspectives in day-to-day operations will help to avoid resistance to change, lack of commitment, and fear of accountability by departmental heads.

A clear strategic map should also be developed and performance indicators clearly identified in addition to the causal relationship between strategic objectives. The linkages among the perspectives aid in strategic analyses because employees better trained in quality customer care reduce process cycle time and service defects.

The study further recommends a constant review process. The effectiveness and real benefit of the balanced scorecard’s replicability are achieved through an efficient review process. The review process will help in fine-tuning the key performance indicators and identify corrective actions and new initiatives.

This study adds to the existing scholarly works on the implementation of the balanced scorecard in the educational sector. Adoption of the balanced scorecard within this sector is becoming more and more important because educational institutions, for that matter, private tertiary institutions, need to identify and replicate the balanced scorecard perspectives in their performance review processes to reap the benefit of the model as evident in the corporate business setting to remain financially sustainable. This study faced a limitation in data gathering, which was gathered during the corona virus pandemic. Participants in online data gathering may not contribute valid data, especially in stressful life events (Al-Salom, 2017) such as the Covid-19 pandemic. This data-gathering procedure might affect the validity of the facts and figures provided by the respondents. Future qualitative research is required to identify the challenges of replicating the balanced scorecard in private tertiary institutions.

### References Références Referencias

private-tertiary-education-near-collapse-nab-report-confirms/


This page is intentionally left blank
The Nexus of Perceived Organizational Support, Job Satisfaction, Job Motivation on Turnover Intentions of Pharmaceutical Sales Executives using Structural Equation Modeling

By Theophilus Ehidihamen OAMEN & Oamen Sophia OMORENUWA

Obafemi Awolowo University

Abstract- In developing countries, there is arguably little or no research study done to evaluate the outcome of path analysis of Job satisfaction (JS), Job motivation (JM), Perceived organizational support (POS), and Turnover Intentions (TIs) on sales professionals in the pharmaceutical marketing industry, using structural equation modeling techniques (SEM). The objective of the study was to evaluate the direct and indirect effects of the relationship between Job satisfaction (JS), Job motivation (JM), Perceived organization support (POS), and Turnover intentions (TI). TI was operationalized as an Intention-to-leave firm for another in the same Industry (TWI) and Intention-to-leave industry entirely (TWO).

Keywords: job satisfaction, job motivation, perceived organization support, turnover intentions, structural equation modeling, pharmaceutical marketing, human resource management.

GJMBR-A Classification: JEL Code: M19

© 2021. Theophilus Ehidihamen OAMEN & Oamen Sophia OMORENUWA. This research/review article is distributed under the terms of the Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0). You must give appropriate credit to authors and reference this article if parts of the article are reproduced in any manner. Applicable licensing terms are at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/.
The Nexus of Perceived Organizational Support, Job Satisfaction, Job Motivation on Turnover Intentions of Pharmaceutical Sales Executives using Structural Equation Modeling

Theophilus Ehidiamen OAMEN & Omen Sophia OMORENUWA

Abstract - In developing countries, there is arguably little or no research study done to evaluate the outcome of path analysis of Job satisfaction (JS), Job motivation (JM), Perceived organizational support (POS), and Turnover Intentions (TIs) on sales professionals in the pharmaceutical marketing industry, using structural equation modeling techniques (SEM). The objective of the study was to evaluate the direct and indirect effects of the relationship between Job satisfaction (JS), Job motivation (JM), Perceived organization support (POS), and Turnover intentions (TI). TI was operationalized as an Intention-to-leave firm for another in the same Industry (TWI) and Intention-to-leave industry entirely (TWO). A cross-sectional study with self-administered questionnaires to pharmaceutical sales executives using random sampling. 406 out of 500 questionnaires were received (81.2%). Results revealed positive relationship existed between JM and JS (p<0.01, β=0.394), POS and JS (p<0.01, β=0.422), TWI and TWO (p=0.046, β=0.124). JS and TWO (p=0.015, β=-0.178), POS and TWI (p=0.023, β=-0.084, SE=0.035, p=0.002). Lower TYE predicted TWI (p=0.002, β=-0.224, p=0.016), compared to Indigenous firms (β=-0.082, p=0.043). Total years of industry experience (TYE) revealed negative relationships. TWI fully mediated the relationship between JS and TWO (β =0.002, p=0.05).TWI was a partial mediator between POS and TWO (β=0.029, p=0.003). Employees in multinational firms showed a negative relationship between JS and TWI (β=-0.224, p=0.016), compared to Indigenous firms (β=-0.082, p=0.043). Total years of industry experience (TYE) revealed negative relationships with JS (β=-0.084, SE=0.041, p=0.043), and POS (β=-0.114, SE=0.035, p=0.002). Lower TYE predicted higher JS. The study suggests employee-centered policies to support JS, JM, and minimize TI.

Keywords: job satisfaction, job motivation, perceived organization support, turnover intentions, structural equation modeling, pharmaceutical marketing, human resource management.

I. Introduction

Many studies have been done on employer-employee relationships in organizations, bordering on Job satisfaction (JS), Job motivation (JM), perceived organization support (POS), and turnover intentions (TIs). It is common knowledge to human resource managers that the employee is a focal resource of an organization as it seeks to achieve its corporate objectives. [1-3] Several human resource management (HRM) studies have examined the hypothesized causal and correlational relationships between Job satisfaction (JS), Job motivation (JM), perceived organizational support (POS), turnover intention (TI), and Job performance (JP) within the domains of organizational support theory. [4-5] POS was derived from the concept of organizational support theory (OST) propounded by Eisenberger et al., (2001) on the basis that there exists an exchange of good faith between the employee and organization/employer when there is an exchange of value as perceived by the employee. [6, 7] POS is associated with enhanced employee retention/stay, improved satisfaction, and commitment. [6, 8] Some attributes of POS include; remuneration rates based on industry standards, training & development opportunities, marketing support, job security as perceived by the employee, incentives and reward for performance, and career growth opportunities. However, the employee’s perception of these attributes influences their estimation of support from management. [9, 10] However, research studies have identified POS as a precursor for employee motivation and JS. [11] Several studies have shown no relationship between POS and JM. [10, 12] However, some studies have suggested that a strong relationship exists between JS and POS [6-7, 13-14] Job satisfaction (JS) is a positive state of mind of an employee towards/with their jobs. JS tends to improve employee retention and supports positive behavioral tendencies in the workplace. The higher an employee's level of satisfaction implies better motivation and job performance. [15-17] JM as a concept, has been extensively explored in several research studies and is
an essential element that drives an employee to pursue organizational goals in the workplace. [18, 19] JM is also an ongoing concern in organizations and is known to be a precursor/driver of overall employee performance. [20, 21] An attractive incentive structure is also known to drive motivation in employees. [22] JM conceptually refers to the drive either internally or externally that enables an employee to perform his given tasks maximally. JM is an important stimulant for satisfactory Job performance (JP). [23] TI refers to the chances, probability, or possibility of an employee leaving the organization. [24] Although many reasons may be responsible for this intention, it is linked to the overall welfare structure provided for the employee, which may or may not delay actualization. [24, 25]. Predisposing factors for TI include; negative work stress, low JS, low JM, uninspiring remuneration/salary, the influence of demographic factors, delayed prospects for promotion or career progression. [24] In present work environments, firms are in constant flux as far as motivating and retaining employees are concerned in the pharmaceutical marketing industry. This is essential for maintaining consistency, keeping productive employees, and competitiveness in the given industry. Studies have shown that decreased work output and productivity are linked to a lack of motivation among employees. [6-7, 26]

To the best of our knowledge, no study has examined the overall relationship between JM, JS, POS, and TI within the pharmaceutical sales and marketing industry in a developing country like Nigeria, using structural equation modeling techniques. The focus of this study was to evaluate industry attractiveness to employees involved in drug marketing and distribution in Nigeria.

II. Methods

a) Study setting

The research study was conducted in Nigeria. Nigeria is a developing country with a growing population of over 200 million residents with a landmass of 923,768 km2 and is arguably the most populous African Country. [27]

b) Study design

A cross-sectional, quantitative research study that used literature-guided questionnaires administered to field medical and sales professionals across the six geopolitical zones in Nigeria.

c) Eligibility Criteria

A cohort of pharmaceutical sales and medical representatives operating in Nigeria were sampled for the study. They must work for either multinational or indigenous pharmaceutical companies. Also excluded were Independent sales representatives and freelancers. This criterion is based on the assumption that employees from both multinational and indigenously owned pharmaceutical companies have an organized sales and human resource structure or departments.

d) Sample population and Sample size determination

The population consists of all pharmaceutical sales representatives in Nigeria. The sample size calculation was determined using the Raosoft sample size calculator. Also, sample size determination for the study applied a 5% margin of error and 95% confidence level. [28] The sample size obtained was 377 from a sample population of more than 20,000 sales and marketing professionals across the six geopolitical zones in Nigeria. The targeted sample population of 20,000 was used in this study because the estimated sample size does not change significantly for a population greater than 20,000. This computational approach was used because of the absence of a central database of pharmaceutical sales and marketing professionals in Nigeria. [29]

Sampling technique & Data Collection

The random sampling method was adopted for the administration of the questionnaires in the study.

e) Design of Questionnaire

A structured questionnaire was developed based on an extensive search of relevant studies and from experts in pharmaceutical marketing. The questionnaire was composed of two sections; Section A consists of individual and occupation-based demographic variables. Section B consists of discrete choice questions.
III. Measures of Study Variables

Key study variables used for evaluating constructs were obtained from adapting established measurement scale as shown in Figure 1.

a) Job Motivation (JM)

JM was measured on a single item question- ‘Are you motivated in your current job’ on a dichotomous scale of ‘yes or no’ as adapted from studies by Tremblay et al., (2009) and Saltson & Nsiah (2009) [10, 30]

b) Job satisfaction (JS)

This was measured using both a single-item on a dichotomous scale to determine overall satisfaction; ‘Are you satisfied with your present job?’ similar to studies by Scarpello &Campbell (1983), and Mann et al., (2020). [6, 31]

c) Turnover Intention (TI)

TI was measured using a dichotomous scale (yes or no) to two questions; 1) Intention to leave organization to another organization in same Industry (TW1), and 2) Intention to leave the pharmaceutical industry for another Industry entirely (TWO) if the opportunity arises respectively. [24, 25]

d) Perceived Organizational Support (POS)

POS was computed from responses to five (5) questions graded on a 3-point Likert scale. It was from a survey tool that was adapted from Eisenberger et al., (1986) [8] with the internal consistency of 0.829 (Cronbach alpha coefficient) for 5 items constituting POS (availability of work tools, career prospects, reward system, incentive structure, and marketing support)

e) Control Variables

In this study, demographic variables such as; marital status, qualifications, gender, years of experience, and age of respondents were used as control variables. This was done to avoid confounding effects of these variables on the outcomes of the path model. [6]

f) Occupational Demographic Variables

In the study, the type of firm and total years of experience in the pharmaceutical industry were respectively used as independent variables to test their impact on POS, JM, JS, TWO, and TWI.

g) Data Analysis

Data were analyzed using IBM Statistical Package for Social Sciences version 25 and Analysis of Moments Software (Amos-23). Descriptive statistics such as mean, standard deviation were used to describe demographic data. Inferential statistical measures were performed using SPSS AMOS-23.

h) Test for Mediation (Indirect effects)

Mediation tests of each path of the path model were computed using the bootstrapping method with 5000 samples with replacement with bias-corrected confidence Intervals of 95% in SPSS Amos. Statistically significant mediation effect was confirmed by the absence of absolute zero between lower confidence interval (LCI) and the Upper confidence Interval (UCI) values.
i) Study Hypothesis

The hypotheses of the study as stated in the null were as follows:

1. There is no direct effect between the independent and dependent variables in the path model-H1
2. There is no mediation effect of JS & TWI, in the interrelationship between POS, TWI, TWO, JM, and JS in the path model (mediation effects)- H2
3. There is no difference in paths between employees in indigenously owned pharmaceutical firms and multinational firms (Multi-group path analysis)- H3
4. There is no effect of total years of experience (TYE) in Industry on the relationship between POS, JS, JM, and TI.-H4

IV. Results and Discussion

a) Demographic Characteristics of Respondents

A total of 406 valid responses were collected out of 500 questionnaires distributed, representing an 81.2% return rate; this was above the calculated sample size of 377. Hence the dataset was adequate for further analysis. The majority of respondents were males (n=293, 72.2%) compared to females (n=113, 27.8%). A significant proportion of respondents were from indigenously owned pharmaceutical companies (n=249, 61.3%) and the remaining from Multinational pharmaceutical companies (n=157, 38.7%). A minority of respondents (n=16, 3.9%) and (n=2, 5%) were aged between 20 to 25 years, and greater than 50 years respectively. The bulk of respondents (n=355, 87.5%) were within the age bracket of 26 to 40 years and a cumulative 8.1% (n=33) were aged between 41 to 50 years. In terms of years of experience in the present place of employment, 68 (16.7%) respondents representing had less than 1-year work experience. 316 (77.8%) had a cumulative experience of between 1 to 10 years. 20 (4.9%) had between 11 to 20 years' experience and the least represented (n=5, 1.2%) had less than 20 years of work experience. Also, Total Industry experience had a mean value of 2.53 (SD=0.86) years of experience compared to a mean of 2.19 (SD=0.82) for years spent in their present companies. The salary grade per year of respondents was $1,000 (n=120, 29.6%), $3,000 (n=230, 56.7%), $5,000 (n=40, 9.9%), $6000 (n=9, 2.2%), and greater than $7,000 (n=7, 1.7%) respectively.

b) Model fit characteristics of Path Model

To achieve an optimum fit to test for the hypothesis of the mediation model, several adjustments to fit parameters were performed in other to achieve a proper model for the study. Final model produced the following values; chi-square X²=0.516 (cut-off=>0.05), GFI=0.999 (cut-off=≥0.95), AGFI=0.990 (cut-off=≥0.95), CMIN/DF=0.421 (cut-off=<5); TLI=1.035 (cut-off=≥0.95), NF1=0.998 (cutoff=≥0.95), RMR=0.006 (cutoff=<0.08), RMSEA=0.001 (cutoff=<0.08, and CFI=0.999 (cutoff= ≥0.90). The final measurement model suggests that Turnover Intentions expressed as TWI & TWO, POS, JM, JS are suitable constructs for further analysis.

c) Path Analysis of Final Measurement Model

The model revealed five (5) critical paths shown in Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Path</th>
<th>Independent Variable (IV)</th>
<th>Mediating Variable (MV)</th>
<th>Dependent Variable (DV)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>JM</td>
<td>JS</td>
<td>TWI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>POS</td>
<td>JS</td>
<td>TWI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>JS</td>
<td>TWI</td>
<td>TWO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>JM</td>
<td>TWI</td>
<td>TWO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>POS</td>
<td>TWI</td>
<td>TWO</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 showed that Path A expressed as JS mediating the relationship between IV (JM) and DV (TWI). Path B showed that JS is a mediating variable between the predictive relationship between POS and TWI. Path C showed that TWI served as a mediator between JS and TWO. Path D showed that the relationship between the independent variable POS and the dependent variable TWO. Finally, Path E showed the hypothetical relationship between POS and TWO under the mediating influence of TWI

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dependent Variable</th>
<th>Relations</th>
<th>Independent Variable</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
<th>Critical Ratio</th>
<th>p-value</th>
<th>Inference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>JS</td>
<td>&lt; ---</td>
<td>JM</td>
<td>0.394</td>
<td>0.056</td>
<td>7.051</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JS</td>
<td>&lt; ---</td>
<td>POS</td>
<td>0.422</td>
<td>0.081</td>
<td>5.194</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TWI</td>
<td>&lt; ---</td>
<td>JS</td>
<td>-0.093</td>
<td>0.077</td>
<td>-1.208</td>
<td>0.227</td>
<td>not significant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
d) **Direct effects of Independent variables (IV) and Dependent variables (DV)**

Table 2, showed that a significant positive relationship existed between JM and JS (p<0.01, $\beta=0.394$), POS and JS (p<0.01, $\beta=0.422$), TWI and TWO (p=0.046, $\beta=0.124$). JS and TWO (p=0.015, $\beta=-0.178$), POS, and TWI (p=0.023, $\beta=-0.235$) respectively produced significantly negative relationships. Also, non-significant negative relationships existed between JS and TWI (p<0.227) as well as a non-significant positive relationship between JM and TWO (p=0.724), JM and TWI (p=0.782). The positive relationships between JM and JS showed that as the employees’ motivation increases, their level of satisfaction with their jobs also increases. In the same vein, increased POS leads to higher satisfaction with Job. This finding is supported by research studies done by Maan et al., (2020) and Alcover et al., (2018) in which significant relationships were obtained. This study showed that the more the turnover intentions of an employee to exit the present company to another company in the same industry (TWI), the higher the intention to exit the pharmaceutical industry entirely (TWO). These results are in harmony with the findings of other studies. [24, 32] The negative, inverse relationship between JS & TWO, and, POS & TWI in the study imply that lower satisfaction levels increase the intention to leave the industry entirely. This showed that the level of industry attractiveness for field staff improves as steps to improve JS are implemented. This consequently leads to higher employees’ retention and improved competitiveness. [33, 34] This inference holds or is valid when the welfare of staff is optimal as revealed by a positive relationship between POS and TWI. Therefore, the alternate hypothesis that direct effects exist between study variables is supported by the study results. Hence we fail to accept the null hypothesis (H1)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Path Relationships</th>
<th>Direct Effect</th>
<th>Indirect Effect</th>
<th>Confidence Interval</th>
<th>p-value</th>
<th>Conclusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>MV</td>
<td>DV</td>
<td>estimate</td>
<td>p-value</td>
<td>estimate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JM</td>
<td>JS</td>
<td>TWI</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0.782</td>
<td>0.037</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POS</td>
<td>JS</td>
<td>TWI</td>
<td>0.235</td>
<td>0.023</td>
<td>0.039</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JS</td>
<td>TWI</td>
<td>TWO</td>
<td>-0.178</td>
<td>0.015</td>
<td>0.012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JM</td>
<td>TWI</td>
<td>TWO</td>
<td>0.025</td>
<td>0.724</td>
<td>0.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POS</td>
<td>TWI</td>
<td>TWO</td>
<td>0.099</td>
<td>0.002</td>
<td>0.029</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: p-value < 0.01; p-value < 0.05, LCI=lower confidence interval, UCL=upper confidence interval

e) **Indirect effects (Mediation) among Study Variables**

Table 3 showed that significant indirect (mediation) effects only existed in two scenarios; firstly, TWI fully mediated the relationship between JS and TWO (regression coefficient=0.002, p=0.05). Secondly, TWI expressed partial mediation between POS and TWO (regression coefficient=0.029, p=0.003). Other relationships between IV, MV, and DV did not have any statistically significant indirect effects. The study hypothesis was tested on the mediation effects of JS and TWI in the path model. The full mediation observed in the analysis showed that although employees’ level of motivation does not influence their likelihood to exit the pharmaceutical industry, the presence of TWI increases the likelihood and intention of the employee to leave the industry. This invariably means that lowered TWI, imply lowered TWO (p<0.05; $\beta=0.124$). Furthermore, partial mediation effect occurred due to the mediation effect of TWI on the significant relationship between POS and TWO. In other words, the effect of decreased POS on the increased tendency for the employee to exit is further exacerbated when there is an existing intention to leave the company for another company in the pharmaceutical industry. [1, 24]The study outcomes in testing the null hypothesis (H2) showed that the null hypothesis was accepted for Paths A, B, and C whereas failed to accept the null hypothesis for Paths D and E where full and partial mediation occurred respectively.
Table 4: Multi-group path analysis comparing Indigenous versus Multinational Pharmaceutical firms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dependent Variable</th>
<th>Independent Variable</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>p-value</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>p-value</th>
<th>Z-score</th>
<th>Inference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>JS</td>
<td>&lt;--- JM</td>
<td>0.394</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>0.445</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>0.541</td>
<td>parity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JS</td>
<td>&lt;--- POS</td>
<td>0.422</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>0.273</td>
<td>0.007</td>
<td>1.148</td>
<td>parity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TWI</td>
<td>&lt;--- JS</td>
<td>-0.093</td>
<td>0.227</td>
<td>-0.224</td>
<td>0.016</td>
<td>-1.089</td>
<td>multinational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TWI</td>
<td>&lt;--- JM</td>
<td>0.020</td>
<td>0.782</td>
<td>0.069</td>
<td>0.481</td>
<td>0.394</td>
<td>parity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TWI</td>
<td>&lt;--- POS</td>
<td>-0.235</td>
<td>0.023</td>
<td>-0.082</td>
<td>0.495</td>
<td>-0.967</td>
<td>Indigenous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TWO</td>
<td>&lt;--- JM</td>
<td>0.025</td>
<td>0.724</td>
<td>-0.171</td>
<td>0.057</td>
<td>-1.71*</td>
<td>parity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TWO</td>
<td>&lt;--- JS</td>
<td>-0.178</td>
<td>0.015</td>
<td>-0.183</td>
<td>0.040</td>
<td>-0.045</td>
<td>parity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TWO</td>
<td>&lt;--- TWI</td>
<td>0.124</td>
<td>0.046</td>
<td>0.155</td>
<td>0.044</td>
<td>0.304</td>
<td>parity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: p-value < 0.01; p-value < 0.05, parity=when there is no statistical difference in effects between groups.

Table 4 shows comparative path analysis between Indigenous and multinational firms concerning the relationship between study variables using statistical tools. [35] The results showed that employees in multinational firms have a negative predictive relationship between JS and TWI ($\beta=-0.224$, $p=0.016$) compared to those from Indigenous firms ($\beta=-0.093$, $p=0.227$). The Z-score difference obtained was 1.089 below the mean. Also, employees in Indigenous firms showed a significant negative relationship between POS and TWI ($\beta=-0.235$, $p=0.023$) compared to those from multinational firms ($\beta=-0.082$, $p=0.495$) with a Z-score difference of 0.967 below the mean. This finding suggests that field staffs in indigenous companies tend to show lower levels of POS. And consequently, higher levels of TWI compared to those from multinational companies. This finding suggests the need for indigenous companies to incorporate some relevant human resource policies of multinational companies. In the same vein, employees in multinational firms showed a higher tendency ($\beta=-0.224$, $p=0.016$) to change jobs within the same pharmaceutical industry when they experience low levels of satisfaction with their jobs compared to employees from indigenous firms. ($\beta=-0.093$, $p=0.227$) Hence, it presupposed that the intra-industry turnover intention depicted as TWI may be linked to feelings of slow career progression, concerns about job security amongst others. This finding is supported by other studies. [32]The null hypothesis (H3) was thereby rejected based on the presence of statistically significant differences between Indigenous and multinational firms in the multi-group path analysis.

Table 5: The causal relationship between Total years of experience in Industry with Study Variables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dependent Variable</th>
<th>Relations</th>
<th>Independent variable</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>Standard error.</th>
<th>Critical ratio</th>
<th>p-value</th>
<th>Inference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>JM</td>
<td>&lt;--- TYE</td>
<td>-0.033</td>
<td>0.046</td>
<td>-0.714</td>
<td>0.476</td>
<td>not significant</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JS</td>
<td>&lt;--- TYE</td>
<td>-0.084</td>
<td>0.041</td>
<td>-2.025</td>
<td>0.043</td>
<td>significant</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TWI</td>
<td>&lt;--- TYE</td>
<td>0.013</td>
<td>0.022</td>
<td>0.575</td>
<td>0.565</td>
<td>not significant</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TWO</td>
<td>&lt;--- TYE</td>
<td>0.003</td>
<td>0.023</td>
<td>0.132</td>
<td>0.895</td>
<td>not significant</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POS</td>
<td>&lt;--- TYE</td>
<td>-0.114</td>
<td>0.035</td>
<td>-3.171</td>
<td>0.002</td>
<td>significant</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 showed the predictive relationship between Total years of experience in Industry (TYE) with JM, JS, POS, TWI, and TWO. Significant relationships only existed between TYE and JS ($\beta=-0.084$, $SE=0.041$, $p=0.043$), and TYE and POS ($\beta=-0.114$, $SE=0.035$, $p=0.002$). These results highlight the possibility that the lower the total years of experience in the industry, the higher their level of Job satisfaction. This inference suggests that staffs with longer lengths of stay tend to show higher levels of dissatisfaction with their jobs. This may be as results of poor career progression, work fatigue, lower than anticipated remuneration. [36-38] Hence, the study suggests that job role improvements and management responsibilities would improve JS in this category of employees. This finding is in line with a study by Maan et al., (2020) [6]that identified that POS needs differ among employees. [39] The null hypothesis (H4) was also rejected due to the presence of statistical differences in the path analysis.
Implications of study outcomes on human resource management (HRM) in the pharmaceutical marketing Industry

The model presented in this study has simplified the relationship between POS, JS, JM, and TI (operationalized as TWI and TWO) and also depicted several interacting scenarios in the pharmaceutical marketing industry. The key objective of the study was to simplify by evaluating the complex relationships between POS, JS, JM, and TI (expressed by two constructs; TWI and TWO) to highlight the impact on the HRM of field force employees in the pharmaceutical sales and marketing industry in Nigeria. The study outcomes improved our understanding of the factors influencing intra- and inter-industry attractiveness to pharmaceutical marketing employees. Based on the results of this study, there are, however, implications for HRM in the pharmaceutical marketing industry. Firstly, there is the need for operational managers to ensure that the work environment and tooling are optimal for the field staff. Therefore, it reduced the tendency for increased work dissatisfaction and turnover intentions. Secondly, indigenously owned firms need to adapt and incorporate advanced human resource policies from multinational firms. The theme of this research work is to add to the existing literature on the impact of demographics, JM, and JS on pharmaceutical sales staff in the pharmaceutical distribution space in Nigeria. Moreover, this study provides a template with which strategic and policy managers can formulate policies that will create more enabling work environments for the industry.

The study addressed the issue of comparative analysis of relationships between JS, JM, POS, TWO, and TWI in the light of privately owned indigenous firms versus multinational firms; the results revealed that employees in indigenous firms tend to consider organizational support (POS) as very critical to informing their decision or willingness to leave one firm to another within the pharmaceutical industry. This assertion is, however, not the case with employees in multinational firms. This significant difference in perception may be assumedly associated with a better working environment and developed human resource management systems. [34, 40-42] This calls for increased incorporation of HR principles available in multinational companies.

V. Conclusion

This study adds to the existing literature on HRM in the pharmaceutical marketing industry as it throws more light on the complex interrelationships between POS, JS, JM, and TI as they affect the field sales and marketing workforce. This study is relevant based on high employee turnover rates prevalent in the pharmaceutical industry. Outcomes of this study will shape how management in companies formulates their personnel policies to support employee retention and job satisfaction. Therefore, industry attractiveness to employees can be enhanced by improving or employing measures to enhance employee motivation or a sense of belonging. This study is relevant to an international audience as it highlights the use of structural equation modeling techniques to improve understanding of the factors influencing intra and inter-industry turnover decisions within the context of the pharmaceutical marketing industry in a developing country.

Limitations of the study

There were several limitations to the study. Firstly, the study addressed the human resource needs of pharmaceutical field staff; hence there is a need to assess the study variables to other stakeholders in the sector. Secondly, the study design used was cross-sectional, hence it is suggested that a longitudinal approach is applied to evaluate the study constructs and variables. Thirdly, apart from the type of firm and total experience in the industry, demographic variables such as age, gender, work experience in the present company, and salary cadre were not included in the analysis due to the possibility of confounding effects on the study outcomes.

Abbreviations

JS-Job satisfaction, JM-Job motivation, POS-Perceived organizational support, TI-Turnover Intention, TWI-Intention to exit firm to another firm in the pharmaceutical Industry, TWO-Intention to leave firm to another firm in a different Industry, JP-Job performance, IV-Independent variable, MV=mediator variable, DV-Dependent variable, HRM=Human Resource Management, Structural equation modeling- SEM, lower confidence interval- LCI, Upper confidence Interval- UCI

References

4. Hu C, Wand S, Yang CC, Wu TY. When mentors feel supported relationships with mentoring functions
9. Wayne SJ, Shore LM, Liden RC. Perceived organizational support and leader-member exchange; a social exchange perspective. Academy of Management Journal. 1997;21(5); 88-111
11. Yu C, Frenkel SJ. Explaining task performance and creativity from perceived organizational support theory: which mechanisms are more important? Journal of Organizational Behavior. 2013;34; 1165-81
17. Alam S, Shahi M. Factors affecting job satisfaction, motivation, and turnover rate of medical promotion officer (MPO) in the pharmaceutical industry; a study based in Khulna city. Asian Business Review. 2015;1(2); 126-31
18. Irakoze E, David KG. Linking Motivation to Employees’ Performance; the Mediation of Commitment and Moderation of Delegation Authority. International Business Research 2019;12; 9; 13-28
23. Maduka CE, Okator O. Effect of Motivation on Employee Productivity; A study of Manufacturing Companies in Nnewi. International Journal of Managerial Studies and Research. 2014;2(7);137-47


34. Mariappanadar S. An emic approach to understanding culturally indigenous and alien-human resource management practices in global companies. Research and Practice in Human Resource Management. 2005;10(1);101-121


36. Sood K, Jain K. Impact of Employee retention on medical representatives of pharmaceutical companies. 2020;3(11); 292-8.


MEMBERSHIPS
FELLOWS/ASSOCIATES OF MANAGEMENT AND BUSINESS RESEARCH COUNCIL
FMBRC/AMBRC MEMBERSHIPS

INTRODUCTION

FMBRC/AMBRC is the most prestigious membership of Global Journals accredited by Open Association of Research Society, U.S.A (OARS). The credentials of Fellow and Associate designations signify that the researcher has gained the knowledge of the fundamental and high-level concepts, and is a subject matter expert, proficient in an expertise course covering the professional code of conduct, and follows recognized standards of practice. The credentials are designated only to the researchers, scientists, and professionals that have been selected by a rigorous process by our Editorial Board and Management Board.

Associates of FMBRC/AMBRC are scientists and researchers from around the world are working on projects/researches that have huge potentials. Members support Global Journals’ mission to advance technology for humanity and the profession.

FMBRC
FELLOWS OF MANAGEMENT AND BUSINESS RESEARCH COUNCIL

FELLOW OF MANAGEMENT AND BUSINESS RESEARCH COUNCIL is the most prestigious membership of Global Journals. It is an award and membership granted to individuals that the Open Association of Research Society judges to have made a substantial contribution to the improvement of computer science, technology, and electronics engineering.

The primary objective is to recognize the leaders in research and scientific fields of the current era with a global perspective and to create a channel between them and other researchers for better exposure and knowledge sharing. Members are most eminent scientists, engineers, and technologists from all across the world. Fellows are elected for life through a peer review process on the basis of excellence in the respective domain. There is no limit on the number of new nominations made in any year. Each year, the Open Association of Research Society elect up to 12 new Fellow Members.
Benefit

To the Institution
Get Letter of Appreciation
Global Journals sends a letter of appreciation of author to the Dean or CEO of the University or Company of which author is a part, signed by editor in chief or chief author.

Exclusive Network
Get Access to a Closed Network
A FMBRC member gets access to a closed network of Tier 1 researchers and scientists with direct communication channel through our website. Fellows can reach out to other members or researchers directly. They should also be open to reaching out by other.

Certificate
Certificate, LoR and Laser-Memento
Fellows receive a printed copy of a certificate signed by our Chief Author that may be used for academic purposes and a personal recommendation letter to the dean of member's university.

Designation
Get Honored Title of Membership
Fellows can use the honored title of membership. The "FMBRC" is an honored title which is accorded to a person’s name viz. Dr. John E. Hall, Ph.D., FMBRC or William Walldroff, M.S., FMBRC.

Recognition on the Platform
Better Visibility and Citation
All the Fellow members of FMBRC get a badge of "Leading Member of Global Journals" on the Research Community that distinguishes them from others. Additionally, the profile is also partially maintained by our team for better visibility and citation. All fellows get a dedicated page on the website with their biography.
FUTURE WORK
GET DISCOUNTS ON THE FUTURE PUBLICATIONS
Fellows receive discounts on future publications with Global Journals up to 60%. Through our recommendation programs, members also receive discounts on publications made with OARS affiliated organizations.

GJ ACCOUNT
UNLIMITED FORWARD OF EMAILS
Fellows get secure and fast GJ work emails with unlimited forward of emails that they may use them as their primary email. For example, john [AT] globaljournals [DOT] org.

PREMIUM TOOLS
ACCESS TO ALL THE PREMIUM TOOLS
To take future researches to the zenith, fellows receive access to all the premium tools that Global Journals have to offer along with the partnership with some of the best marketing leading tools out there.

CONFERENCES & EVENTS
ORGANIZE SEMINAR/CONFERENCE
Fellows are authorized to organize symposium/seminar/conference on behalf of Global Journal Incorporation (USA). They can also participate in the same organized by another institution as representative of Global Journal. In both the cases, it is mandatory for him to discuss with us and obtain our consent. Additionally, they get free research conferences (and others) alerts.

EARLY INVITATIONS
EARLY INVITATIONS TO ALL THE SYMPOSIUMS, SEMINARS, CONFERENCES
All fellows receive the early invitations to all the symposiums, seminars, conferences and webinars hosted by Global Journals in their subject.
PUBLISHING ARTICLES & BOOKS

EARN 60% OF SALES PROCEEDS
Fellows can publish articles (limited) without any fees. Also, they can earn up to 70% of sales proceeds from the sale of reference/review books/literature/publishing of research paper. The FMBRC member can decide its price and we can help in making the right decision.

REVIEWERS

GET A REMUNERATION OF 15% OF AUTHOR FEES
Fellow members are eligible to join as a paid peer reviewer at Global Journals Incorporation (USA) and can get a remuneration of 15% of author fees, taken from the author of a respective paper.

ACCESS TO EDITORIAL BOARD

BECOME A MEMBER OF THE EDITORIAL BOARD
Fellows may join as a member of the Editorial Board of Global Journals Incorporation (USA) after successful completion of three years as Fellow and as Peer Reviewer. Additionally, Fellows get a chance to nominate other members for Editorial Board.

AND MUCH MORE

GET ACCESS TO SCIENTIFIC MUSEUMS AND OBSERVATORIES ACROSS THE GLOBE
All members get access to 5 selected scientific museums and observatories across the globe. All researches published with Global Journals will be kept under deep archival facilities across regions for future protections and disaster recovery. They get 10 GB free secure cloud access for storing research files.
ASSOCIATE OF MANAGEMENT AND BUSINESS RESEARCH COUNCIL

ASSOCIATE OF MANAGEMENT AND BUSINESS RESEARCH COUNCIL is the membership of Global Journals awarded to individuals that the Open Association of Research Society judges to have made a substantial contribution to the improvement of computer science, technology, and electronics engineering.

The primary objective is to recognize the leaders in research and scientific fields of the current era with a global perspective and to create a channel between them and other researchers for better exposure and knowledge sharing. Members are most eminent scientists, engineers, and technologists from all across the world. Associate membership can later be promoted to Fellow Membership. Associates are elected for life through a peer review process on the basis of excellence in the respective domain. There is no limit on the number of new nominations made in any year. Each year, the Open Association of Research Society elect up to 12 new Associate Members.
**Benefit**

**To the institution**

**Get letter of appreciation**
Global Journals sends a letter of appreciation of author to the Dean or CEO of the University or Company of which author is a part, signed by editor in chief or chief author.

**Exclusive Network**

**Get access to a closed network**
A AMBRC member gets access to a closed network of Tier 2 researchers and scientists with direct communication channel through our website. Associates can reach out to other members or researchers directly. They should also be open to reaching out by other.

**Certificate**

**Certificate, LoR and Laser-Momento**
Associates receive a printed copy of a certificate signed by our Chief Author that may be used for academic purposes and a personal recommendation letter to the dean of member's university.

**Designation**

**Get honored title of membership**
Associates can use the honored title of membership. The “AMBRC” is an honored title which is accorded to a person’s name viz. Dr. John E. Hall, Ph.D., AMBRC or William Walldroff, M.S., AMBRC.

**Recognition on the Platform**

**Better visibility and citation**
All the Associate members of ASFRC get a badge of "Leading Member of Global Journals" on the Research Community that distinguishes them from others. Additionally, the profile is also partially maintained by our team for better visibility and citation. All associates get a dedicated page on the website with their biography.
**FUTURE WORK**

**GET DISCOUNTS ON THE FUTURE PUBLICATIONS**
Associates receive discounts on the future publications with Global Journals up to 60%. Through our recommendation programs, members also receive discounts on publications made with OARS affiliated organizations.

---

**GJ ACCOUNT**

**UNLIMITED FORWARD OF EMAILS**
Associates get secure and fast GJ work emails with 5GB forward of emails that they may use them as their primary email. For example, john [AT] globaljournals [DOT] org.

---

**PREMIUM TOOLS**

**ACCESS TO ALL THE PREMIUM TOOLS**
To take future researches to the zenith, fellows receive access to almost all the premium tools that Global Journals have to offer along with the partnership with some of the best marketing leading tools out there.

---

**CONFERENCES & EVENTS**

**ORGANIZE SEMINAR/CONFERENCE**
Associates are authorized to organize symposium/seminar/conference on behalf of Global Journal Incorporation (USA). They can also participate in the same organized by another institution as representative of Global Journal. In both the cases, it is mandatory for him to discuss with us and obtain our consent. Additionally, they get free research conferences (and others) alerts.

---

**EARLY INVITATIONS**

**EARLY INVITATIONS TO ALL THE SYMPOSIUMS, SEMINARS, CONFERENCES**
All associates receive the early invitations to all the symposiums, seminars, conferences and webinars hosted by Global Journals in their subjec.
Publishing Articles & Books

Earn 60% of sales proceeds

Associates can publish articles (limited) without any fees. Also, they can earn up to 30-40% of sales proceeds from the sale of reference/review books/literature/publishing of research paper.

Reviewers

Get a remuneration of 15% of author fees

Fellow members are eligible to join as a paid peer reviewer at Global Journals Incorporation (USA) and can get a remuneration of 15% of author fees, taken from the author of a respective paper.

And Much More

Get access to scientific museums and observatories across the globe

All members get access to 2 selected scientific museums and observatories across the globe. All researches published with Global Journals will be kept under deep archival facilities across regions for future protections and disaster recovery. They get 5 GB free secure cloud access for storing research files.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>ASSOCIATE</strong></th>
<th><strong>FELLOW</strong></th>
<th><strong>RESEARCH GROUP</strong></th>
<th><strong>BASIC</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$4800</td>
<td>$6800</td>
<td>$12500.00</td>
<td>APC per article</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lifetime designation</td>
<td>lifetime designation</td>
<td>organizational</td>
<td>GJ Community Access</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Certificate**, LoR and Momento
- 2 discounted publishing/year
- **Gradation** of Research
- 10 research contacts/day
- 1 GB Cloud Storage
- GJ Community Access

- **Certificate**, LoR and Momento
- **Unlimited** discounted publishing/year
- **Gradation** of Research
- **Unlimited** research contacts/day
- 5 GB Cloud Storage
- Online Presence Assistance
- GJ Community Access

- **Certificates**, LoRs and Momentos
- **Unlimited** free publishing/year
- **Gradation** of Research
- **Unlimited** research contacts/day
- **Unlimited** Cloud Storage
- Online Presence Assistance
- GJ Community Access

© Copyright by Global Journals | Guidelines Handbook
**Preferred Author Guidelines**

We accept the manuscript submissions in any standard (generic) format.

We typeset manuscripts using advanced typesetting tools like Adobe In Design, CorelDraw, TeXnicCenter, and TeXStudio. We usually recommend authors submit their research using any standard format they are comfortable with, and let Global Journals do the rest.

Alternatively, you can download our basic template from https://globaljournals.org/Template.zip

Authors should submit their complete paper/article, including text illustrations, graphics, conclusions, artwork, and tables. Authors who are not able to submit manuscript using the form above can email the manuscript department at submit@globaljournals.org or get in touch with chiefeditor@globaljournals.org if they wish to send the abstract before submission.

**Before and During Submission**

Authors must ensure the information provided during the submission of a paper is authentic. Please go through the following checklist before submitting:

1. Authors must go through the complete author guideline and understand and agree to Global Journals’ ethics and code of conduct, along with author responsibilities.
2. Authors must accept the privacy policy, terms, and conditions of Global Journals.
3. Ensure corresponding author’s email address and postal address are accurate and reachable.
4. Manuscript to be submitted must include keywords, an abstract, a paper title, co-author(s’) names and details (email address, name, phone number, and institution), figures and illustrations in vector format including appropriate captions, tables, including titles and footnotes, a conclusion, results, acknowledgments and references.
5. Authors should submit paper in a ZIP archive if any supplementary files are required along with the paper.
6. Proper permissions must be acquired for the use of any copyrighted material.
7. Manuscript submitted must not have been submitted or published elsewhere and all authors must be aware of the submission.

**Declaration of Conflicts of Interest**

It is required for authors to declare all financial, institutional, and personal relationships with other individuals and organizations that could influence (bias) their research.

**Policy on Plagiarism**

Plagiarism is not acceptable in Global Journals submissions at all.

Plagiarized content will not be considered for publication. We reserve the right to inform authors’ institutions about plagiarism detected either before or after publication. If plagiarism is identified, we will follow COPE guidelines:

Authors are solely responsible for all the plagiarism that is found. The author must not fabricate, falsify or plagiarize existing research data. The following, if copied, will be considered plagiarism:

- Words (language)
- Ideas
- Findings
- Writings
- Diagrams
- Graphs
- Illustrations
- Lectures

© Copyright by Global Journals | Guidelines Handbook
Authorship Policies

Global Journals follows the definition of authorship set up by the Open Association of Research Society, USA. According to its guidelines, authorship criteria must be based on:

1. Substantial contributions to the conception and acquisition of data, analysis, and interpretation of findings.
2. Drafting the paper and revising it critically regarding important academic content.
3. Final approval of the version of the paper to be published.

Changes in Authorship

The corresponding author should mention the name and complete details of all co-authors during submission and in manuscript. We support addition, rearrangement, manipulation, and deletions in authors list till the early view publication of the journal. We expect that corresponding author will notify all co-authors of submission. We follow COPE guidelines for changes in authorship.

Copyright

During submission of the manuscript, the author is confirming an exclusive license agreement with Global Journals which gives Global Journals the authority to reproduce, reuse, and republish authors’ research. We also believe in flexible copyright terms where copyright may remain with authors/employers/institutions as well. Contact your editor after acceptance to choose your copyright policy. You may follow this form for copyright transfers.

Appealing Decisions

Unless specified in the notification, the Editorial Board’s decision on publication of the paper is final and cannot be appealed before making the major change in the manuscript.

Acknowledgments

Contributors to the research other than authors credited should be mentioned in Acknowledgments. The source of funding for the research can be included. Suppliers of resources may be mentioned along with their addresses.

Declaration of funding sources

Global Journals is in partnership with various universities, laboratories, and other institutions worldwide in the research domain. Authors are requested to disclose their source of funding during every stage of their research, such as making analysis, performing laboratory operations, computing data, and using institutional resources, from writing an article to its submission. This will also help authors to get reimbursements by requesting an open access publication letter from Global Journals and submitting to the respective funding source.

Preparing your Manuscript

Authors can submit papers and articles in an acceptable file format: MS Word (doc, docx), LaTeX (.tex, .zip or .rar including all of your files), Adobe PDF (.pdf), rich text format (.rtf), simple text document (.txt), Open Document Text (.odt), and Apple Pages (.pages). Our professional layout editors will format the entire paper according to our official guidelines. This is one of the highlights of publishing with Global Journals—authors should not be concerned about the formatting of their paper. Global Journals accepts articles and manuscripts in every major language, be it Spanish, Chinese, Japanese, Portuguese, Russian, French, German, Dutch, Italian, Greek, or any other national language, but the title, subtitle, and abstract should be in English. This will facilitate indexing and the pre-peer review process.

The following is the official style and template developed for publication of a research paper. Authors are not required to follow this style during the submission of the paper. It is just for reference purposes.
Manuscript Style Instruction (Optional)

- Microsoft Word Document Setting Instructions.
- Font type of all text should be Swis721 Lt BT.
- Page size: 8.27” x 11’’, left margin: 0.65, right margin: 0.65, bottom margin: 0.75.
- Paper title should be in one column of font size 24.
- Author name in font size of 11 in one column.
- Abstract: font size 9 with the word “Abstract” in bold italics.
- Main text: font size 10 with two justified columns.
- Two columns with equal column width of 3.38 and spacing of 0.2.
- First character must be three lines drop-capped.
- The paragraph before spacing of 1 pt and after of 0 pt.
- Line spacing of 1 pt.
- Large images must be in one column.
- The names of first main headings (Heading 1) must be in Roman font, capital letters, and font size of 10.
- The names of second main headings (Heading 2) must not include numbers and must be in italics with a font size of 10.

Structure and Format of Manuscript

The recommended size of an original research paper is under 15,000 words and review papers under 7,000 words. Research articles should be less than 10,000 words. Research papers are usually longer than review papers. Review papers are reports of significant research (typically less than 7,000 words, including tables, figures, and references)

A research paper must include:

a) A title which should be relevant to the theme of the paper.
b) A summary, known as an abstract (less than 150 words), containing the major results and conclusions.
c) Up to 10 keywords that precisely identify the paper’s subject, purpose, and focus.
d) An introduction, giving fundamental background objectives.
e) Resources and techniques with sufficient complete experimental details (wherever possible by reference) to permit repetition, sources of information must be given, and numerical methods must be specified by reference.
f) Results which should be presented concisely by well-designed tables and figures.
g) Suitable statistical data should also be given.
h) All data must have been gathered with attention to numerical detail in the planning stage.

Design has been recognized to be essential to experiments for a considerable time, and the editor has decided that any paper that appears not to have adequate numerical treatments of the data will be returned unrefereed.

i) Discussion should cover implications and consequences and not just recapitulate the results; conclusions should also be summarized.
j) There should be brief acknowledgments.
k) There ought to be references in the conventional format. Global Journals recommends APA format.

Authors should carefully consider the preparation of papers to ensure that they communicate effectively. Papers are much more likely to be accepted if they are carefully designed and laid out, contain few or no errors, are summarizing, and follow instructions. They will also be published with much fewer delays than those that require much technical and editorial correction.

The Editorial Board reserves the right to make literary corrections and suggestions to improve brevity.
It is necessary that authors take care in submitting a manuscript that is written in simple language and adheres to published guidelines.

All manuscripts submitted to Global Journals should include:

**Title**

The title page must carry an informative title that reflects the content, a running title (less than 45 characters together with spaces), names of the authors and co-authors, and the place(s) where the work was carried out.

**Author details**

The full postal address of any related author(s) must be specified.

**Abstract**

The abstract is the foundation of the research paper. It should be clear and concise and must contain the objective of the paper and inferences drawn. It is advised to not include big mathematical equations or complicated jargon.

Many researchers searching for information online will use search engines such as Google, Yahoo or others. By optimizing your paper for search engines, you will amplify the chance of someone finding it. In turn, this will make it more likely to be viewed and cited in further works. Global Journals has compiled these guidelines to facilitate you to maximize the web-friendliness of the most public part of your paper.

**Keywords**

A major lynchpin of research work for the writing of research papers is the keyword search, which one will employ to find both library and internet resources. Up to eleven keywords or very brief phrases have to be given to help data retrieval, mining, and indexing.

One must be persistent and creative in using keywords. An effective keyword search requires a strategy: planning of a list of possible keywords and phrases to try.

Choice of the main keywords is the first tool of writing a research paper. Research paper writing is an art. Keyword search should be as strategic as possible.

One should start brainstorming lists of potential keywords before even beginning searching. Think about the most important concepts related to research work. Ask, “What words would a source have to include to be truly valuable in a research paper?” Then consider synonyms for the important words.

It may take the discovery of only one important paper to steer in the right keyword direction because, in most databases, the keywords under which a research paper is abstracted are listed with the paper.

**Numerical Methods**

Numerical methods used should be transparent and, where appropriate, supported by references.

**Abbreviations**

Authors must list all the abbreviations used in the paper at the end of the paper or in a separate table before using them.

**Formulas and equations**

Authors are advised to submit any mathematical equation using either MathJax, KaTeX, or LaTeX, or in a very high-quality image.

**Tables, Figures, and Figure Legends**

Tables: Tables should be cautiously designed, uncrowned, and include only essential data. Each must have an Arabic number, e.g., Table 4, a self-explanatory caption, and be on a separate sheet. Authors must submit tables in an editable format and not as images. References to these tables (if any) must be mentioned accurately.
Figures

Figures are supposed to be submitted as separate files. Always include a citation in the text for each figure using Arabic numbers, e.g., Fig. 4. Artwork must be submitted online in vector electronic form or by emailing it.

Preparation of Electronic Figures for Publication

Although low-quality images are sufficient for review purposes, print publication requires high-quality images to prevent the final product being blurred or fuzzy. Submit (possibly by e-mail) EPS (line art) or TIFF (halftone/photographs) files only. MS PowerPoint and Word Graphics are unsuitable for printed pictures. Avoid using pixel-oriented software. Scans (TIFF only) should have a resolution of at least 350 dpi (halftone) or 700 to 1100 dpi (line drawings). Please give the data for figures in black and white or submit a Color Work Agreement form. EPS files must be saved with fonts embedded (and with a TIFF preview, if possible).

For scanned images, the scanning resolution at final image size ought to be as follows to ensure good reproduction: line art: >650 dpi; halftones (including gel photographs): >350 dpi; figures containing both halftone and line images: >650 dpi.

Color charges: Authors are advised to pay the full cost for the reproduction of their color artwork. Hence, please note that if there is color artwork in your manuscript when it is accepted for publication, we would require you to complete and return a Color Work Agreement form before your paper can be published. Also, you can email your editor to remove the color fee after acceptance of the paper.

Tips for Writing a Good Quality Management Research Paper

Techniques for writing a good quality management and business research paper:

1. Choosing the topic: In most cases, the topic is selected by the interests of the author, but it can also be suggested by the guides. You can have several topics, and then judge which you are most comfortable with. This may be done by asking several questions of yourself, like "Will I be able to carry out a search in this area? Will I find all necessary resources to accomplish the search? Will I be able to find all information in this field area?" If the answer to this type of question is "yes," then you ought to choose that topic. In most cases, you may have to conduct surveys and visit several places. Also, you might have to do a lot of work to find all the rises and falls of the various data on that subject. Sometimes, detailed information plays a vital role, instead of short information. Evaluators are human: The first thing to remember is that evaluators are also human beings. They are not only meant for rejecting a paper. They are here to evaluate your paper. So present your best aspect.

2. Think like evaluators: If you are in confusion or getting demotivated because your paper may not be accepted by the evaluators, then think, and try to evaluate your paper like an evaluator. Try to understand what an evaluator wants in your research paper, and you will automatically have your answer. Make blueprints of paper: The outline is the plan or framework that will help you to arrange your thoughts. It will make your paper logical. But remember that all points of your outline must be related to the topic you have chosen.

3. Ask your guides: If you are having any difficulty with your research, then do not hesitate to share your difficulty with your guide (if you have one). They will surely help you out and resolve your doubts. If you can't clarify what exactly you require for your work, then ask your supervisor to help you with an alternative. He or she might also provide you with a list of essential readings.

4. Use of computer is recommended: As you are doing research in the field of management and business then this point is quite obvious. Use right software: Always use good quality software packages. If you are not capable of judging good software, then you can lose the quality of your paper unknowingly. There are various programs available to help you which you can get through the internet.

5. Use the internet for help: An excellent start for your paper is using Google. It is a wondrous search engine, where you can have your doubts resolved. You may also read some answers for the frequent question of how to write your research paper or find a model research paper. You can download books from the internet. If you have all the required books, place importance on reading, selecting, and analyzing the specified information. Then sketch out your research paper. Use big pictures: You may use encyclopedias like Wikipedia to get pictures with the best resolution. At Global Journals, you should strictly follow here.
6. **Bookmarks are useful:** When you read any book or magazine, you generally use bookmarks, right? It is a good habit which helps to not lose your continuity. You should always use bookmarks while searching on the internet also, which will make your search easier.

7. **Revise what you wrote:** When you write anything, always read it, summarize it, and then finalize it.

8. **Make every effort:** Make every effort to mention what you are going to write in your paper. That means always have a good start. Try to mention everything in the introduction—what is the need for a particular research paper. Polish your work with good writing skills and always give an evaluator what he wants. Make backups: When you are going to do any important thing like making a research paper, you should always have backup copies of it either on your computer or on paper. This protects you from losing any portion of your important data.

9. **Produce good diagrams of your own:** Always try to include good charts or diagrams in your paper to improve quality. Using several unnecessary diagrams will degrade the quality of your paper by creating a hodgepodge. So always try to include diagrams which were made by you to improve the readability of your paper. Use of direct quotes: When you do research relevant to literature, history, or current affairs, then use of quotes becomes essential, but if the study is relevant to science, use of quotes is not preferable.

10. **Use proper verb tense:** Use proper verb tenses in your paper. Use past tense to present those events that have happened. Use present tense to indicate events that are going on. Use future tense to indicate events that will happen in the future. Use of wrong tenses will confuse the evaluator. Avoid sentences that are incomplete.

11. **Pick a good study spot:** Always try to pick a spot for your research which is quiet. Not every spot is good for studying.

12. **Know what you know:** Always try to know what you know by making objectives, otherwise you will be confused and unable to achieve your target.

13. **Use good grammar:** Always use good grammar and words that will have a positive impact on the evaluator; use of good vocabulary does not mean using tough words which the evaluator has to find in a dictionary. Do not fragment sentences. Eliminate one-word sentences. Do not ever use a big word when a smaller one would suffice.

14. **Arrangement of information:** Each section of the main body should start with an opening sentence, and there should be a changeover at the end of the section. Give only valid and powerful arguments for your topic. You may also maintain your arguments with records.

15. **Never start at the last minute:** Always allow enough time for research work. Leaving everything to the last minute will degrade your paper and spoil your work.

16. **Multitasking in research is not good:** Doing several things at the same time is a bad habit in the case of research activity. Research is an area where everything has a particular time slot. Divide your research work into parts, and do a particular part in a particular time slot.

17. **Never copy others’ work:** Never copy others’ work and give it your name because if the evaluator has seen it anywhere, you will be in trouble. Take proper rest and food: No matter how many hours you spend on your research activity, if you are not taking care of your health, then all your efforts will have been in vain. For quality research, take proper rest and food.

18. **Go to seminars:** Attend seminars if the topic is relevant to your research area. Utilize all your resources.

19. **Refresh your mind after intervals:** Try to give your mind a rest by listening to soft music or sleeping in intervals. This will also improve your memory. Acquire colleagues: Always try to acquire colleagues. No matter how sharp you are, if you acquire colleagues, they can give you ideas which will be helpful to your research.

20. **Think technically:** Always think technically. If anything happens, search for its reasons, benefits, and demerits. Think and then print: When you go to print your paper, check that tables are not split, headings are not detached from their descriptions, and page sequence is maintained.
**21. Adding unnecessary information:** Do not add unnecessary information like "I have used MS Excel to draw graphs." Irrelevant and inappropriate material is superfluous. Foreign terminology and phrases are not apropos. One should never take a broad view. Analogy is like feathers on a snake. Use words properly, regardless of how others use them. Remove quotations. Puns are for kids, not grunt readers. Never oversimplify: When adding material to your research paper, never go for oversimplification; this will definitely irritate the evaluator. Be specific. Never use rhythmic redundancies. Contractions shouldn't be used in a research paper. Comparisons are as terrible as clichés. Give up ampersands, abbreviations, and so on. Remove commas that are not necessary. Parenthetical words should be between brackets or commas. Understatement is always the best way to put forward earth-shaking thoughts. Give a detailed literary review.

**22. Report concluded results:** Use concluded results. From raw data, filter the results, and then conclude your studies based on measurements and observations taken. An appropriate number of decimal places should be used. Parenthetical remarks are prohibited here. Proofread carefully at the final stage. At the end, give an outline to your arguments. Spot perspectives of further study of the subject. Justify your conclusion at the bottom sufficiently, which will probably include examples.

**23. Upon conclusion:** Once you have concluded your research, the next most important step is to present your findings. Presentation is extremely important as it is the definite medium though which your research is going to be in print for the rest of the crowd. Care should be taken to categorize your thoughts well and present them in a logical and neat manner. A good quality research paper format is essential because it serves to highlight your research paper and bring to light all necessary aspects of your research.

**Informal Guidelines of Research Paper Writing**

**Key points to remember:**
- Submit all work in its final form.
- Write your paper in the form which is presented in the guidelines using the template.
- Please note the criteria peer reviewers will use for grading the final paper.

**Final points:**

One purpose of organizing a research paper is to let people interpret your efforts selectively. The journal requires the following sections, submitted in the order listed, with each section starting on a new page:

**The introduction:** This will be compiled from reference matter and reflect the design processes or outline of basis that directed you to make a study. As you carry out the process of study, the method and process section will be constructed like that. The results segment will show related statistics in nearly sequential order and direct reviewers to similar intellectual paths throughout the data that you gathered to carry out your study.

**The discussion section:**

This will provide understanding of the data and projections as to the implications of the results. The use of good quality references throughout the paper will give the effort trustworthiness by representing an alertness to prior workings.

Writing a research paper is not an easy job, no matter how trouble-free the actual research or concept. Practice, excellent preparation, and controlled record-keeping are the only means to make straightforward progression.

**General style:**

Specific editorial column necessities for compliance of a manuscript will always take over from directions in these general guidelines.

**To make a paper clear:** Adhere to recommended page limits.

**Mistakes to avoid:**
- Insertion of a title at the foot of a page with subsequent text on the next page.
- Separating a table, chart, or figure—confine each to a single page.
- Submitting a manuscript with pages out of sequence.
- In every section of your document, use standard writing style, including articles ("a" and "the").
- Keep paying attention to the topic of the paper.
• Use paragraphs to split each significant point (excluding the abstract).
• Align the primary line of each section.
• Present your points in sound order.
• Use present tense to report well-accepted matters.
• Use past tense to describe specific results.
• Do not use familiar wording; don't address the reviewer directly. Don't use slang or superlatives.
• Avoid use of extra pictures—include only those figures essential to presenting results.

Title page:
Choose a revealing title. It should be short and include the name(s) and address(es) of all authors. It should not have acronyms or abbreviations or exceed two printed lines.

Abstract: This summary should be two hundred words or less. It should clearly and briefly explain the key findings reported in the manuscript and must have precise statistics. It should not have acronyms or abbreviations. It should be logical in itself. Do not cite references at this point.

An abstract is a brief, distinct paragraph summary of finished work or work in development. In a minute or less, a reviewer can be taught the foundation behind the study, common approaches to the problem, relevant results, and significant conclusions or new questions.

Write your summary when your paper is completed because how can you write the summary of anything which is not yet written? Wealth of terminology is very essential in abstract. Use comprehensive sentences, and do not sacrifice readability for brevity; you can maintain it succinctly by phrasing sentences so that they provide more than a lone rationale. The author can at this moment go straight to shortening the outcome. Sum up the study with the subsequent elements in any summary. Try to limit the initial two items to no more than one line each.

Reason for writing the article—theory, overall issue, purpose.
• Fundamental goal.
• To-the-point depiction of the research.
• Consequences, including definite statistics—if the consequences are quantitative in nature, account for this; results of any numerical analysis should be reported. Significant conclusions or questions that emerge from the research.

Approach:
• Single section and succinct.
• An outline of the job done is always written in past tense.
• Concentrate on shortening results—limit background information to a verdict or two.
• Exact spelling, clarity of sentences and phrases, and appropriate reporting of quantities (proper units, important statistics) are just as significant in an abstract as they are anywhere else.

Introduction:
The introduction should "introduce" the manuscript. The reviewer should be presented with sufficient background information to be capable of comprehending and calculating the purpose of your study without having to refer to other works. The basis for the study should be offered. Give the most important references, but avoid making a comprehensive appraisal of the topic. Describe the problem visibly. If the problem is not acknowledged in a logical, reasonable way, the reviewer will give no attention to your results. Speak in common terms about techniques used to explain the problem, if needed, but do not present any particulars about the protocols here.

The following approach can create a valuable beginning:
• Explain the value (significance) of the study.
• Defend the model—why did you employ this particular system or method? What is its compensation? Remark upon its appropriateness from an abstract point of view as well as pointing out sensible reasons for using it.
• Present a justification. State your particular theory(-ies) or aim(s), and describe the logic that led you to choose them.
• Briefly explain the study's tentative purpose and how it meets the declared objectives.

© Copyright by Global Journals | Guidelines Handbook
**Approach:**

Use past tense except for when referring to recognized facts. After all, the manuscript will be submitted after the entire job is done. Sort out your thoughts; manufacture one key point for every section. If you make the four points listed above, you will need at least four paragraphs. Present surrounding information only when it is necessary to support a situation. The reviewer does not desire to read everything you know about a topic. Shape the theory specifically—do not take a broad view.

As always, give awareness to spelling, simplicity, and correctness of sentences and phrases.

**Procedures (methods and materials):**

This part is supposed to be the easiest to carve if you have good skills. A soundly written procedures segment allows a capable scientist to replicate your results. Present precise information about your supplies. The suppliers and clarity of reagents can be helpful bits of information. Present methods in sequential order, but linked methodologies can be grouped as a segment. Be concise when relating the protocols. Attempt to give the least amount of information that would permit another capable scientist to replicate your outcome, but be cautious that vital information is integrated. The use of subheadings is suggested and ought to be synchronized with the results section.

When a technique is used that has been well-described in another section, mention the specific item describing the way, but draw the basic principle while stating the situation. The purpose is to show all particular resources and broad procedures so that another person may use some or all of the methods in one more study or referee the scientific value of your work. It is not to be a step-by-step report of the whole thing you did, nor is a methods section a set of orders.

**Materials:**

*Material may be reported in part of a section or else they may be recognized along with your measures.*

**Methods:**

- Report the method and not the particulars of each process that engaged the same methodology.
- Describe the method entirely.
- To be succinct, present methods under headings dedicated to specific dealings or groups of measures.
- Simplify—detail how procedures were completed, not how they were performed on a particular day.
- If well-known procedures were used, account for the procedure by name, possibly with a reference, and that's all.

**Approach:**

It is embarrassing to use vigorous voice when documenting methods without using first person, which would focus the reviewer's interest on the researcher rather than the job. As a result, when writing up the methods, most authors use third person passive voice.

Use standard style in this and every other part of the paper—avoid familiar lists, and use full sentences.

**What to keep away from:**

- Resources and methods are not a set of information.
- Skip all descriptive information and surroundings—save it for the argument.
- Leave out information that is immaterial to a third party.

**Results:**

The principle of a results segment is to present and demonstrate your conclusion. Create this part as entirely objective details of the outcome, and save all understanding for the discussion.

The page length of this segment is set by the sum and types of data to be reported. Use statistics and tables, if suitable, to present consequences most efficiently.

You must clearly differentiate material which would usually be incorporated in a study editorial from any unprocessed data or additional appendix matter that would not be available. In fact, such matters should not be submitted at all except if requested by the instructor.
Content:
- Sum up your conclusions in text and demonstrate them, if suitable, with figures and tables.
- In the manuscript, explain each of your consequences, and point the reader to remarks that are most appropriate.
- Present a background, such as by describing the question that was addressed by creation of an exacting study.
- Explain results of control experiments and give remarks that are not accessible in a prescribed figure or table, if appropriate.
- Examine your data, then prepare the analyzed (transformed) data in the form of a figure (graph), table, or manuscript.

What to stay away from:
- Do not discuss or infer your outcome, report surrounding information, or try to explain anything.
- Do not include raw data or intermediate calculations in a research manuscript.
- Do not present similar data more than once.
- A manuscript should complement any figures or tables, not duplicate information.
- Never confuse figures with tables—there is a difference.

Approach:
As always, use past tense when you submit your results, and put the whole thing in a reasonable order.

Put figures and tables, appropriately numbered, in order at the end of the report.

If you desire, you may place your figures and tables properly within the text of your results section.

Figures and tables:
If you put figures and tables at the end of some details, make certain that they are visibly distinguished from any attached appendix materials, such as raw facts. Whatever the position, each table must be titled, numbered one after the other, and include a heading. All figures and tables must be divided from the text.

Discussion:
The discussion is expected to be the trickiest segment to write. A lot of papers submitted to the journal are discarded based on problems with the discussion. There is no rule for how long an argument should be.

Position your understanding of the outcome visibly to lead the reviewer through your conclusions, and then finish the paper with a summing up of the implications of the study. The purpose here is to offer an understanding of your results and support all of your conclusions, using facts from your research and generally accepted information, if suitable. The implication of results should be fully described.

Infer your data in the conversation in suitable depth. This means that when you clarify an observable fact, you must explain mechanisms that may account for the observation. If your results vary from your prospect, make clear why that may have happened. If your results agree, then explain the theory that the proof supported. It is never suitable to just state that the data approved the prospect, and let it drop at that. Make a decision as to whether each premise is supported or discarded or if you cannot make a conclusion with assurance. Do not just dismiss a study or part of a study as "uncertain."

Research papers are not acknowledged if the work is imperfect. Draw what conclusions you can based upon the results that you have, and take care of the study as a finished work.
- You may propose future guidelines, such as how an experiment might be personalized to accomplish a new idea.
- Give details of all of your remarks as much as possible, focusing on mechanisms.
- Make a decision as to whether the tentative design sufficiently addressed the theory and whether or not it was correctly restricted. Try to present substitute explanations if they are sensible alternatives.
- One piece of research will not counter an overall question, so maintain the large picture in mind. Where do you go next? The best studies unlock new avenues of study. What questions remain?
- Recommendations for detailed papers will offer supplementary suggestions.

© Copyright by Global Journals | Guidelines Handbook
**Approach:**

When you refer to information, differentiate data generated by your own studies from other available information. Present work done by specific persons (including you) in past tense.

Describe generally acknowledged facts and main beliefs in present tense.

---

**The Administration Rules**

Administration Rules to Be Strictly Followed before Submitting Your Research Paper to Global Journals Inc.

*Please read the following rules and regulations carefully before submitting your research paper to Global Journals Inc. to avoid rejection.*

*Segment draft and final research paper:* You have to strictly follow the template of a research paper, failing which your paper may get rejected. You are expected to write each part of the paper wholly on your own. The peer reviewers need to identify your own perspective of the concepts in your own terms. Please do not extract straight from any other source, and do not rephrase someone else's analysis. Do not allow anyone else to proofread your manuscript.

*Written material:* You may discuss this with your guides and key sources. Do not copy anyone else's paper, even if this is only imitation, otherwise it will be rejected on the grounds of plagiarism, which is illegal. Various methods to avoid plagiarism are strictly applied by us to every paper, and, if found guilty, you may be blacklisted, which could affect your career adversely. To guard yourself and others from possible illegal use, please do not permit anyone to use or even read your paper and file.
CRITERION FOR GRADING A RESEARCH PAPER (COMPILATION)
BY GLOBAL JOURNALS

Please note that following table is only a Grading of "Paper Compilation" and not on "Performed/Stated Research" whose grading solely depends on Individual Assigned Peer Reviewer and Editorial Board Member. These can be available only on request and after decision of Paper. This report will be the property of Global Journals.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topics</th>
<th>Grades</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A-B</td>
<td>C-D</td>
<td>E-F</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Abstract</strong></td>
<td>Clear and concise with appropriate content, Correct format. 200 words or below</td>
<td>Unclear summary and no specific data, Incorrect form</td>
<td>No specific data with ambiguous information</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Introduction</strong></td>
<td>Containing all background details with clear goal and appropriate details, flow specification, no grammar and spelling mistake, well organized sentence and paragraph, reference cited</td>
<td>Unclear and confusing data, appropriate format, grammar and spelling errors with unorganized matter</td>
<td>Out of place depth and content, hazy format</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Methods and Procedures</strong></td>
<td>Clear and to the point with well arranged paragraph, precision and accuracy of facts and figures, well organized subheads</td>
<td>Difficult to comprehend with embarrassed text, too much explanation but completed</td>
<td>Incorrect and unorganized structure with hazy meaning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Result</strong></td>
<td>Well organized, Clear and specific, Correct units with precision, correct data, well structuring of paragraph, no grammar and spelling mistake</td>
<td>Complete and embarrassed text, difficult to comprehend</td>
<td>Irregular format with wrong facts and figures</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Discussion</strong></td>
<td>Well organized, meaningful specification, sound conclusion, logical and concise explanation, highly structured paragraph reference cited</td>
<td>Wordy, unclear conclusion, spurious</td>
<td>Conclusion is not cited, unorganized, difficult to comprehend</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>References</strong></td>
<td>Complete and correct format, well organized</td>
<td>Beside the point, Incomplete</td>
<td>Wrong format and structuring</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© Copyright by Global Journals | Guidelines Handbook
INDEX

A

Accra · 1, 9, 33, 43
Altruism · 18, 19, 26, 27
Anonymous · 40
Arguably · 45, 46

E

Enthusiastic · 1, 8

H

Homogeneity · 28
Hypothetical · 48

I

Intrinsic · 3

O

Obsolescence · 15

P

Prerequisite · 16
Procedural · 19, 26

Q

Quinquennium · 33

R

Repercussions · 13

S

Scanty · 37
Spiritual · 20, 31

T

Tangible · 34, 36, 38
Theoretical · 2, 3, 29

V

Virtue · 16, 18, 19, 21, 22, 24, 26, 27